**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Meeting – Webex Only**

**Tuesday, July 25, 2023 – 9:30 a.m.**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| *Members:* |  |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services (Reliant) |  |
| Bonskowski, Ned | Luminant Generation (Luminant) |  |
| Campo, Curtis | Garland Power and Light (GP&L) | Alt. Rep. for Russell Franklin |
| Carpenter, Jeremy | Tenaska Power Services (Tenaska) |  |
| Cochran, Seth | DC Energy |  |
| Dreyfus, Mark | City of Eastland |  |
| Fehrenbach, Nick | City of Dallas |  |
| Gaytan, Jose | Denton Municipal Electric (DME) |  |
| Goff, Eric | Residential Consumer |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation | Alt Rep. Richard Ross |
| Hanson, Kevin | National Grid Renewables (NG Renewables) |  |
| Harpole, Jay | AP Gas & Electric (APG&E) |  |
| Helton, Bob | ENGIE |  |
| Hendrix, Chris | Demand Control 2 |  |
| Holt, Blake | Lower Colorado River Authority (LCRA) | Alt. Rep. for Emily Jolly |
| Jolly, Emily | LCRA |  |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Kent, Garret | CMC Steel Texas (CMC Steel) |  |
| Lange, Clif | South Texas Electric Cooperative (STEC) |  |
| Loving, Alicia | Austin Energy |  |
| Martin, Collin | Oncor Electric Delivery (Oncor) |  |
| Mercado, David | CenterPoint Energy (CNP) |  |
| Nix, Keith | Texas-New Mexico Power Company (TNMP) |  |
| Pokharel, Nabaraj | Office of Public Utility Counsel (OPUC) |  |
| Powell, Christian | Pedernales Electric Cooperative (PEC) |  |
| Ross, Richard | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine Corporation (Calpine) |  |
| Schmitt, Jennifer | Rhythm Ops |  |
| Smith, Bill | Air Liquide |  |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy North America (SENA) |  |

The following proxy was assigned:

* Caitlin Smith to Bob Helton

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | |  |  |
| *Guests:* | |  |  |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | | NRG |  |
| Aldridge, Ryan | | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Ashley, Kristy | | CES |  |
| Barati, Camron | | Potomac Economics |  |
| Barber, Kathy | |  |  |
| Barr, Bill | | LCRA |  |
| Basaran, Harika | | PUCT |  |
| Bell, Brad | | Solar Proponent |  |
| Benson, Mariah | | PUCT |  |
| Berry, Danny | | LCRA |  |
| Bertin, Suzanne | |  |  |
| Bezwada, Neelima | | Potomac Economics |  |
| Bivens, Carrie | | Potomac Economics |  |
| Blackburn, Don | | Hunt Energy Network |  |
| Block, Laurie | | LBlock Consulting, LLC |  |
| Brown, Chris | | PUCT |  |
| Camet, Brooke | | PUCT |  |
| Clifford, Brigid | | PG Renewables |  |
| Conant, Portia | | Yes Energy |  |
| Cook, Kristin | | Southern Power |  |
| Cooksey, Matthew | | OPUC |  |
| Daigneault, Ralph | | Potomac Economics |  |
| Donohoo, Ken | | OwlERC, LLC |  |
| Duensing, Allison | | Sarac Energy |  |
| Fowler, Lynne | |  |  |
| Ghoshal, Orijit | | esVolta |  |
| Gietl, Tim | |  |  |
| Glotfelty, Jimmy | | PUCT |  |
| Godly, Kevin | | Rev Renewables |  |
| George, Ian | | BOFA |  |
| Grey, Bruce | | Samsung |  |
| Hankins, Laura | | LCRA |  |
| Harvey, Julia | | Texas Electric Cooperatives |  |
| Henderson, Norris | | FERC |  |
| Hennings, Peter | | Roscommon |  |
| Henson, Martha | | Oncor |  |
| Horstmyer, Reid | | Dynasty Power |  |
| Hubbard, John Russ | | TIEC |  |
| Hudis, Gabriella | | Gabel Associates |  |
| Lindsey Hughes  Huynh, Thuy | | Broad Reach Power  Potomac Economics |  |
| Ingraham, Deborah | | Acciona |  |
| Jewell, Michael | | Jewell and Associates |  |
| Jones, Randy | | Mountaineer Market Advisors |  |
| Keller, Jenna | | PUCT |  |
| Korde, Kshitij | | NG Renewables |  |
| Koz, Brian | |  |  |
| Kremling, Barry | | GVEC |  |
| Kroskey, Tony | | Brazos |  |
| Lacek, Mollie | | Talen Energy |  |
| Lasher, Warren | | Lasher Energy |  |
| Lee, Jim | | CNP |  |
| Lewis, William | | Payless Power |  |
| Lotter, Eric | | GridMonitor |  |
| Lu, Bo | | Broad Reach Power |  |
| Macaraeg, Tad | | Stem |  |
| Macias, Jesse | | AEP Texas |  |
| Mayers, Sharon | | Worley |  |
| Maynez, Andrew | | Orsted |  |
| McClellan, Suzi | | Good Company Associates |  |
| McKeever, Debbie | | Oncor |  |
| Morris, Sandy | | WETT |  |
| Nicholson, Tyler | | PUCT |  |
| Noyes, Theresa | | LCRA |  |
| Nguyen, Andy | | Constellation Energy Generation |  |
| Ok, Brendan | | PUCT |  |
| Okenfuss, James | | Savion |  |
| O’Niell, Nic | | Austin Energy |  |
| Orr, Rob | | Lone Star Transmission |  |
| Ortiz, Antonio | |  |  |
| Oxedine, Helen | | CPS Energy |  |
| Pallarez, Eddie | | AEP |  |
| Pfefferle, Ryan | | Oxy |  |
| Pietrucha, Doug | | Texas Advanced Energy |  |
| Proffer, Erica | | KVUE News |  |
| Pyka, Greg | | Schneider Engineering |  |
| Ramaswamy, Ramya | | PUCT |  |
| Reedy, Steve | | CIM View |  |
| Reimers, Andrew | | Lancium |  |
| Richmond, Michele | | Competitive Power |  |
| Riojas, Joselle | | Targa Resources |  |
| Ritch, John | | NextEra Energy |  |
| Roth, Werner | | PUCT |  |
| Sager, Brenden | | Austin Energy |  |
| Scott, Kathy | | CNP |  |
| Sersen, Juliana | | Baker Botts |  |
| Shaffer, Jarred | | Office of Texas Governor Greg Abbott |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | | Crescent Power Consulting |  |
| Smith, Chase | | Southern Power |  |
| Smith, Mark | | Mark Smith Law, LLC |  |
| Snyder, Bill | | AEP |  |
| Teng, Shuye | | LCRA |  |
| True, Roy | | ACES |  |
| Uy, Manny | | Hunt Energy |  |
| Walker, Floyd | | PUCT |  |
| Wan, Josephine | | Austin Energy |  |
| White, Lauri | | AEP |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | | Longhorn Power |  |
| Wolf, Craig | | RES |  |
| Wyman, Constance | |  |  |
| Yang, Chen | | Avangrid |  |
| Zhang, Wen | | Potomac Economics |  |
|  | |  |  |
|  |  | |  |
| *ERCOT Staff:* |  | |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  | |  |
| Anderson, Troy |  | |  |
| Arth, Matt |  | |  |
| Azeredo, Chris |  | |  |
| Billo, Jeff |  | |  |
| Blevins, Bill |  | |  |
| Boren, Ann |  | |  |
| Chu, Zhengguo |  | |  |
| Clifton, Suzy |  | |  |
| Dashnyam, Sanchir |  | |  |
| Day, Betty |  | |  |
| Dwyer, Davida |  | |  |
| Fohn, Doug |  | |  |
| Gnanam, Prabhu |  | |  |
| Golen, Robert |  | |  |
| Gross, Katherine |  | |  |
| Herrera, Shane |  | |  |
| Hobbs, Kristi |  | |  |
| Holden, Curry |  | |  |
| King, Ryan |  | |  |
| Li, Ying |  | |  |
| Magarinos, Marcelo |  | |  |
| Mago, Nitika |  | |  |
| McGuire, Joshua |  | |  |
| Meier, Kennedy |  | |  |
| Mereness, Matt |  | |  |
| Michelsen, Dave |  | |  |
| Moorty, Sai |  | |  |
| Moreno, Alfredo |  | |  |
| Ögelman, Kenan |  | |  |
| Parakkuth, Jayapal |  | |  |
| Patterson, Mark |  | |  |
| Pedigo, Jake |  | |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  | |  |
| Rainwater, Kim |  | |  |
| Rickerson, Woody |  | |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  | |  |
| Rosel, Austin |  | |  |
| Schmidt, Matthew |  | |  |
| Shaw, Pamela |  | |  |
| Solis, Stephen |  | |  |
| Thomas, Shane |  | |  |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  | |  |
| Wasik-Gutierrez, Erin |  | |  |
| You, Haibo |  | |  |
| Zhou, Emily |  | |  |

*Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments participated in the votes.*

Clif Lange called the July 25, 2023 meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Antitrust Admonition

Mr. Lange directed attention to the displayed Antitrust Admonition and noted that the Antitrust Guidelines are available for review on the ERCOT website.

Approval of TAC Meeting Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-2)

*June 25, 2023*

Mr. Lange noted this item could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2).

Meetings Update

*June 29, 2023 Public Utility Commission of Texas (PUCT) Open Meeting*

*July 20, 2023 PUCT Open Meeting*

Mr. Lange reviewed the disposition of Revision Request items considered at the June 29, 2023 and July 20, 2023 PUCT Open Meetings.

Review of ERCOT Market Impact Statements/Opinions and Independent Market Monitor (IMM) Opinion (see Key Documents)

Ann Boren presented the ERCOT Market Impact Statements and ERCOT opinions for Revision Requests to be considered by TAC, and Carrie Bivens presented the IMM opinions.

Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Report (see Key Documents)

Martha Henson reviewed PRS activities and presented Revision Requests for TAC consideration.

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 1165, Revisions to Requirements of Providing Audited Financial Statements and Providing Independent Amount*

**Eric Goff moved to recommend approval of NPRR1165 as recommended by PRS in the 7/13/23 PRS Report. Bill Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried with one objection from the Municipal (CPS Energy) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

*NPRR1182, Inclusion of Controllable Load Resources and Energy Storage Resources in the Constraint Competitiveness Test Process*

Mr. Lange noted this item could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2).

*NPRR1183, ECEII Definition Clarification and Updates to Posting Rules for Certain Documents without ECEII*

Mr. Lange noted this item could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2).

*Other Binding Documents List*

Ms. Henson summarized recent ERCOT efforts to streamline the change control process for items on the Other Binding Document List to align with NPRR1157, Incorporation of PUCT Approval into Revision Request Process, encouraged Market Participants to attend future PRS meetings to participate in the ongoing effort, and presented the PRS recommendations for TAC consideration. Mr. Lange noted this item could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2).

Revision Requests Tabled at TAC (See Key Documents)

*NPRR1173, Changes Consistent With the Options Available to an MOU and EC Entering Retail*

*Competition in the ERCOT Market*

TAC took no action on this item.

*NPRR1176, Update to EEA Trigger Levels*

Ms. Boren reviewed the 7/25/23 Revised Impact Analysis for NPRR1176. Mr. Lange noted that NPRR1176 and Nodal Operating Guide Revision Request (NOGRR) 252, Related to NPRR1176, Update to EEA Trigger Levels, could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2).

Other Binding Documents (See Key Documents)

*Other Binding Document Revision Request (OBDRR) 046, Related to NPRR1188, Implement Nodal Dispatch and Energy Settlement for Controllable Load Resources*

Mr. Lange noted this item could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2).

*OBDRR047, Revision to ERS Procurement Methodology regarding Unused Funds from Previous Terms*

Mark Patterson provided an overview of OBDRR047. Market Participants discussed allocations to Loads versus rolling funds to another contract period. Mr. Lange noted this item could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2).

Retail Market Subcommittee (RMS) Report (See Key Documents)

*Suspension of 2024 Business and Residential Annual Validation*

Debbie McKeever reviewed RMS activities, including RMS action to recommend suspending the 2024 Business and Residential Annual Profile Validation, summarized the benefits of taking this action, presented estimated cost savings for ERCOT and Transmission and/or Distribution Service Providers (TDSPs), and requested TAC consideration of the issue. Market Participants expressed support for the RMS recommended action for 2024, and requested a cost/benefit analysis on the validation process and consideration for potentially eliminating it at a later date. Mr. Lange noted this item could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2) and requested RMS review the issues.

Reliability and Operations Subcommittee (ROS) Report (see Key Documents)

Chase Smith reviewed ROS activities and presented Revision Requests for TAC consideration.

*NOGRR247, Change UFLS Stages and Load Relief Amounts*

Mr. Lange noted this item could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2).

*NOGRR252, Related to NPRR1176, Update to EEA Trigger Levels*

Mr. Lange noted this item could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2).

*Planning Guide Revision Request (PGRR) 108, Related to NPRR1183, ECEII Definition Clarification and Updates to Posting Rules for Certain Documents without ECEII*

Mr. Lange noted this item could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2).

*ROS Procedures*

Mr. Smith noted that the ROS Procedures were updated to include the Inverter-Based Resource Working Group (IBRWG) and administrative edits. Mr. Lange noted this item could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2).

Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Report (see Key Documents)

Jim Lee reviewed WMS activities and presented a Revision Request for TAC consideration.

*Verifiable Cost Manual Revision Request (VCMRR) 034, Excluding RUC Approved Fuel Costs from Fuel Adders*

Mr. Lee summarized the 6/12/23 WMS Report for VCMRR034. Some Market Participants expressed concern that VCMRR034 creates difficulty with reconciling which costs are submitted and approved via the process versus fuel adders.

**Mr. Goff moved to recommend approval of VCMRR034 as recommended by WMS in the 7/12/23 WMS Report. Chris Hendrix seconded the motion. The motion carried with one objection from the Independent Generator (Luminant) Market Segment, and three abstentions from the Independent Generator (Calpine, ENGIE, Jupiter Power) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Credit Finance Sub Group (CFSG) Report (see Key Documents)

*Approval of CFSG Membership*

Brenden Sager reviewed CFSG activities and presented the following designated CFSG Member for TAC approval:

* Anthony Lerch, Constellation Energy Generation, Independent Generator

Mr. Lange noted this item could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2).

Large Flexible Load Task Force (LFLTF) Report (See Key Documents)

Bill Blevins noted that the July 24, 2023 LFLTF meeting was cancelled; stated that Revision Requests addressing large Load issues, including registration, interconnection, and operation of customers with large Loads are anticipated to be filed soon; and encouraged Market Participants to attend the August 28, 2023 LFLTF Meeting for discussion on older interconnection approvals that have yet to interconnect and potential time frames for interconnection approvals to be valid.

ERCOT Reports (see Key Documents)

*Real-Time Cooptimization (RTC) Update*

Matt Mereness provided an update on the RTC project, stated that ERCOT proposes drafting an RTC+B Working Group Charter for consideration at the August 22, 2023 TAC meeting, and encouraged Market Participants to consider the Vice-Chair leadership opportunity. This working group is to provide on-going collaboration and risk mitigation between ERCOT and Market Participants for the implementation of the RTC+B program,

*ERCOT Contingency Reserve Service (ECRS) Go-Live Update*

Mr. Mereness noted that ERCOT Staff is working with ROS and WMS leadership on the TAC assignments related to ECRS.

*CPS San Antonio South Reliability Regional Planning Group Project*

Prabhu Gnanam presented the ERCOT independent review of the CPS San Antonio South Reliability Regional Planning Group Project, a comparison of options, and the ERCOT recommendation for Option 5 to address the reliability need in the San Antonio area. Mr. Lange noted this item could be considered in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot_2).

Other Business (see Key Documents)

*2024 Stakeholder Meeting Calendar*

Market Participants reviewed the 2024 Stakeholder Meeting Calendar options for TAC and expressed support for a Wednesday meeting schedule.

Combined Ballot

**David Kee moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To approve the June 27, 2023, TAC Meeting Minutes as presented**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1182 as recommended by PRS in the 7/13/23 PRS Report**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1183 as recommended by PRS in the 7/13/23 PRS Report**
* **To approve the OBD List as recommended by PRS**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1176 as recommended by PRS in the 6/14/23 PRS Report; and the 7/25/23 Revised Impact Analysis**
* **To table OBDRR046**
* **To recommend approval of OBDRR047 as submitted; and the 6/30/23 Impact Analysis**
* **To approve suspension of the 2024 Business and Residential Annual Validation; as recommended by RMS**
* **To recommend approval of NOGRR247 as recommended by ROS in the 7/6/23 ROS Report**
* **To recommend approval of NOGRR252 as recommended by ROS in the 7/6/23 ROS Report**
* **To recommend approval of PGRR108 as recommended by ROS in the 7/6/23 ROS Report**
* **To approve the ROS Procedures as presented**
* **To approve CFSG Membership as presented**
* **To endorse Option 5 for the CPS San Antonio South Reliability RPG Project, as recommended by ERCOT**

**Jose Gaytan seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Mr. Lange adjourned the July 25, 2023 TAC meeting at 11:29 a.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at:

   <https://www.ercot.com/calendar/07252023-TAC-Meeting-_-Webex> [↑](#footnote-ref-2)