**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Meeting**

**ERCOT Austin – 8000 Metropolis Drive (Building E), Suite 100 – Austin, Texas 78744**

 **Wednesday, May 10, 2023 – 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services (Reliant) | Via Teleconference |
| Coleman, Diana | CPS Energy |  |
| Goff, Eric | Residential Consumer |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation (AEPSC) |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Generation (Luminant) |  |
| Hanson, Kevin | National Grid Renewables (NG Renewables) | Via Teleconference |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor Electric Delivery (Oncor) |  |
| Mindham, David | EDP Renewables  |  |
| Rich, Katie | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative (GSEC) |  |
| Richmond, Tim | Chariot Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Trevino, Melissa | Occidental Chemical (Occidental) | Via Teleconference |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative (STEC) |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services (Tenaska) |  |
| Xie, Fei | Austin Energy |  |
|  |  |  |
| *Guests:* |  |  |
| Abbott, Kristin | Austin Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG | Via Teleconference |
| Aldridge, Ryan | AB Power Advisors | Via Teleconference |
| Anderson, Connor | AB Power Advisors | Via Teleconference |
| Ashley, Kristy | Customized Energy Solutions | Via Teleconference |
| Barati, Camron | Potomac Economics | Via Teleconference |
| Benson, Mariah | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Berry, Danny | LCRA | Via Teleconference |
| Bertin, Suzanne |  | Via Teleconference |
| Bezwada, Neelima | Potomac Economics | Via Teleconference |
| Bivens, Carrie | Potomac Economics |  |
| Blackburn, Don | Hunt Energy Network Power Marketing | Via Teleconference |
| Blakey, Eric | Pedernales Electric Cooperative (PEC) |  |
| Block, Laurie | LBlock Consulting, LLC | Via Teleconference |
| Burkhead, Brett | Calpine | Via Teleconference |
| Boggs, Callie | Eric Winters Goff, LLC | Via Teleconference |
| Callender, Hudson | CPS Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Campo, Curtis | Garland Power and Light | Via Teleconference |
| Caster, Andrew | Constellation | Via Teleconference |
| Clark, Jack | NextEra Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Cortez, Sarai | Trailstone | Via Teleconference |
| Cotton, Ashley | GEUS | Via Teleconference |
| DeLeon, Seth | DME | Via Teleconference |
| Dharme, Neeraja | EDFT | Via Teleconference |
| Dollar, Zachary | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Dreyfus, Mark | City of Eastland | Via Teleconference |
| Duensing, Allison | Sarac Energy  | Via Teleconference |
| Ghoshal, Orijit | esVolta | Via Teleconference |
| Headrick, Bridget | CES | Via Teleconference |
| Helton, Bob | ENGIE |  |
| Holt, Blake | LCRA |  |
| Hook, Marcia |  | Via Teleconference |
| Hubbard, John Russ | TIEC |  |
| Huynh, Thuy | Potomac Economics | Via Teleconference |
| Jolly, Emily | LCRA | Via Teleconference |
| Kee, David | CPS  |  |
| Kirby, Brandon | GEUS | Via Teleconference |
| Koz, Brian |  | Via Teleconference |
| Lacek, Mollie | Talen Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Laughlin, Madeline Gould | Enel Green Power | Via Teleconference |
| Lotter, Eric | Grid Monitor | Via Teleconference |
| Macaraeg, Tad | STEM | Via Teleconference |
| Mendoza, Albert | Occidental | Via Teleconference |
| Morris, Sandy | WETT | Via Teleconference |
| Nguyen, Andy | Constellation |  |
| Nicholson, Tyler | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Noyes, Theresa | LCRA |  |
| Okenfuss, James | Savion | Via Teleconference |
| Pfefferle, Ryan | Oxy | Via Teleconference |
| Pokharel, Nabaraj | OPUC | Via Teleconference |
| Ramaswamy, Ramya | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Reed, Ronald | CNP | Via Teleconference |
| Reedy, Steve | CIM View Consulting |  |
| Ritch, John | Lone Star Transmission  |  |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine Corporation | Via Teleconference |
| Showalter, Dana | Plus Power | Via Teleconference |
| Sims, Chris | LP&L | Via Teleconference |
| Smith, Caitlin | Jupiter Power | Via Teleconference |
| Smith, Mark | Mark Smith Law, LLC | Via Teleconference |
| Stafford, Will | GSEC | Via Teleconference |
| Teng, Shuye | LCRA | Via Teleconference |
| Thurnher, Greg | Tesla | Via Teleconference |
| True, Roy | ACES | Via Teleconference |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor | Via Teleconference |
| Villasana, Kristi | NBU |  |
| Walker, Floyd | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Wall, Perrin | CNP |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Broad Reach Power  | Via Teleconference |
| Wu, Tiffany | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Zhang, James | Austin Energy | Via Teleconference |
| *ERCOT Staff* |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Anderson, Troy |  |  |
| Arth, Matt |  | Via Teleconference |
| Azeredo, Chris |  | Via Teleconference |
| Billo, Jeff |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  |  |
| Castillo, Leo |  | Via Teleconference |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Dwyer, Davida |  |  |
| Fohn, Doug |  | Via Teleconference |
| Garcia, Freddy |  | Via Teleconference |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |  |
| Gross, Katherine |  |  |
| Hahne, Cynthia |  | Via Teleconference |
| Hailu, Ted |  | Via Teleconference |
| Holden, Curry |  | Via Teleconference |
| Huang, Fred |  | Via Teleconference |
| Jirasek, Shawna |  | Via Teleconference |
| King, Ryan |  | Via Teleconference |
| Lightner, Debbie |  | Via Teleconference |
| Magarinos, Marcelo |  | Via Teleconference |
| Maggio, Dave |  | Via Teleconference |
| Mago, Nitika |  |   |
| Matlock, Robert |  | Via Teleconference |
| McGowan, Erin |  | Via Teleconference |
| McGuire, Joshua |  | Via Teleconference |
| Mereness, Matt |  | Via Teleconference |
| Michelsen, Dave |  | Via Teleconference |
| Patterson, Mark |  | Via Teleconference |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  | Via Teleconference |
| Rosel, Austin |  | Via Teleconference |
| Shanks, Maggie |  | Via Teleconference |
| Shaw, Pamela |  | Via Teleconference |
| Solis, Stephen |  | Via Teleconference |
| Stevens, Jim |  | Via Teleconference |
| Teixeira, Jay |  | Via Teleconference |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  |  |
| Wasik-Gutierrez, Erin |  |  |
| Zhou, Emily |  | Via Teleconference |
|  |  |  |

*Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments participated in the votes.*

Martha Henson called the May 10, 2023 PRS meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Antitrust Admonition

Ms. Henson directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Approval of Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-2)

*April 13, 2023*

Market Participants reviewed the April 13, 2023 Meeting Minutes. Ms. Henson noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update

Ms. Henson noted TAC had not met since the April 13, 2023 PRS meeting.

Project Update (see Key Documents)

Troy Anderson provided project highlights, summarized 2023 release targets, and reviewed additional project status information. Mr. Anderson noted challenges in project planning for critical items and contrasted 2022 and 2023 average monthly project labor hours. Mr. Anderson encouraged Market Participants to attend the weekly ERCOT Contingency Reserve Service (ECRS) Readiness meetings and May 18, 2023 Technology Working Group (TWG) meeting.

Urgency Vote (See Key Documents)

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR)* *1177, Enhance Exceptional Fuel Cost Process*

*NPRR1178, Expectations for Resources Providing ERCOT Contingency Reserve Service*

*NPRR1179, Fuel Purchase Requirements for Resources Submitting RUC Fuel Costs (Waive Notice)*

**Eric Goff moved to grant NPRR1177 Urgent status, to grant NPRR1178 Urgent status, and to waive notice and grant NPRR1179 Urgent status. Bob Wittmeyer seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously****.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

*NPRR1177*

Andy Nguyen provided an overview of NPRR1177 and summarized discussions at the May 3, 2023 Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) and May 5, 2023 Wholesale Market Working Group (WMWG) meetings. Market Participants debated whether NPRR1177 should be tabled and referred to WMS for consideration along with other Revision Requests addressing Exceptional Fuel Costs and to consider Reliability Unit Commitments (RUCs) holistically. Some Market Participants expressed concern for the immediate ongoing risk of Entities unable to recover costs for lack of a mechanism in the Protocols. Other Market Participants expressed concern that the mechanism proposed in NPRR1177 would become permanent and stated that guardrails should be developed.

**John Ritch moved to recommend approval of NPRR1177 as submitted and to forward to TAC NPRR1177. Ian Haley seconded the motion.**

**Mr. Goff moved to table NPRR1177 and refer the issue to WMS. Mark Dreyfus seconded the motion. The motion failed with 17 objections from the Cooperative (3) (GSEC, LCRA, STEC), Independent Generator (5) (Luminant, Broad Reach Power, Calpine, Enel Green Power, Constellation), Independent Power Marketer (IPM) (2) (Tenaska, NG Renewables), Investor Owned Utility (IOU) (4) (Oncor, Lone Star Transmission, AEPSC, CNP), and Municipal (3) (CPS, GEUS, Austin Energy) Market Segments and one abstention from the Independent Generator (EDP Renewables) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

**Mr. Goff moved to amend the main motion to recommend approval of NPRR1177 as submitted with a sunset date of January 1, 2024. Kevin Hanson seconded the motion.** In response to Market Participant concerns, Ino Gonzalez reminded Market Participants of the system impacts for the interim solution verses a permanent solution, requested time to observe the results of NPRR1177 prior to proposing a permanent solution, and offered a clarification to the proposed language.

**Mr. Goff withdrew the motion to amend.** Mr. Ritch and Mr. Haley expressed support for the proposed clarification. **Mr. Ritch moved to recommend approval of NPRR1177 as revised by PRS and to forward to TAC NPRR1177. Mr. Haley seconded the motion. The motion carried with one objection from the Consumer (Occidental) Market Segment, and three abstentions from the Consumer (Residential) and Independent Retail Electric Provider (IREP) (2) (Reliant, Chariot Energy).** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

*NPRR1178*

Dave Maggio summarized NPRR1178 and reviewed the implementation timeline with Urgent status. Market Participants discussed the interaction of the proposed Energy Offer Curves requirements and possible deployment scenarios involving ECRS and On-Line Non-Spin within Section 6.4.4.1, Energy Offer Curve for On-Line Non-Spinning Reserve Capacity. Ms. Henson noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

*NPRR1179*

Mr. Gonzalez summarized NPRR1179. Market Participants requested further review by the Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG) to understand Resource compliance with parameters, given contracts with gas suppliers and Qualified Scheduling Entities (QSEs). Ms. Henson noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

Review PRS Reports, Impact Analyses, and Prioritization (see Key Documents)

*NPRR1143, Provide ERCOT Flexibility to Determine When ESRs May Charge During an EEA Level* Market Participants reviewed the 4/13/23 PRS Report and 7/27/22 Impact Analysis for NPRR1143.

**Bill Barnes moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 4/13/23 PRS Report and the 7/27/22 Impact Analysis for NPRR1143. Blake Gross seconded the motion. The motion carried with four abstentions from the Cooperative (GSEC, STEC), Independent Generator (Luminant), and Municipal (Austin Energy) Market Segments.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

*NPRR1156, Priority Revision Request Process*

PRS took no action on this item.

*NPRR1163, Related to LPGRR070, Discontinuation of Interval Data Recorder (IDR) Meter Weather Sensitivity Process*

*NPRR1166, Protected Information Status of DC Tie Schedule Information*

Market Participants reviewed the respective 4/13/23 PRS Reports and 2/14/23 Impact Analysis for NPRR1163 and 3/7/23 Impact Analysis for NPRR1166. Ms. Henson noted these items could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

*NPRR1167, Improvements to Firm Fuel Supply Service Based on Lessons Learned*

Mr. Maggio reviewed the 4/28/23 ERCOT comments, 3/8/23 Impact Analysis, and implementation timeline for NPR1167. In response to Market Participants questions and concerns, Davida Dwyer summarized the recertification approval process. Market Participants proposed desktop edits to maintain the phrase “fuel-related issues” within the qualification and decertification provisions of Section 8.1.1.2.1.6, Firm Fuel Supply Service Resource Qualification, Testing, and Decertification, and Recertification. Ms. Henson noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

*NPRR1168, Related to RMGRR172, Texas SET V5.0 Continuous Service Agreements Changes*

Market Participants reviewed the 4/13/23 PRS Report and 4/25/23 Impact Analysis for NPRR1168. Ms. Henson noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR956, Designation of Providers of Transmission Additions*

*NPRR1070, Planning Criteria for GTC Exit Solutions*

*NPRR1146, Credit Changes to Appropriately Reflect TAO Exposure*

*NPRR1162, Single Agent Designation for a QSE and its Sub-QSEs for Voice Communications over the ERCOT WAN*

*NPRR1164, Black Start and Isochronous Control Capable Identification*

*NPRR1165, Revisions to Requirements of Providing Audited Financial Statements and Providing Independent Amount*

*NPRR1170, Capturing Natural Gas Delivery Information for Natural Gas Generation Resources*

*NPRR1171, Requirements for DGRs and DESRs on Circuits Subject to Load Shedding*

PRS took no action on these items.

*NPRR1150, Related to NOGRR230, WAN Participant Security*

Market Participants reviewed the 4/20/23 ERCOT comments and noted the May 4, 2023 Reliability and Operations Subcommittee (ROS) vote to recommend approval of NOGRR230 as amended by the 4/20/23 ERCOT comments. Ms. Henson noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

*NPRR1169, Expansion of Generation Resources Qualified to Provide Firm Fuel Supply Service in Phase 2 of the Service – URGENT*

John Russ Hubbard reviewed the 5/8/23 TIEC comments to NPRR1169. Bryan Sams reviewed the 5/9/23 Calpine comments to NPRR1169. Ms. Dwyer summarized the 5/9/23 ERCOT comments to NPRR1169.

Market Participants proposed desktop edits to incorporate the Calpine revisions to the definitions of Firm Fuel Supply Service (FFSS) Qualifying Pipeline and Firm Transportation Agreement into the 5/9/23 ERCOT comments, and requested ERCOT Staff look into the use of the phrase Force Majeure Event to determine if other terminology would be more appropriate. Ms. Henson noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

Review of Revision Request Language (see Key Documents)

*NPRR1172, Fuel Adder Definition, Mitigated Offer Caps, and RUC Clawback*

Mr. Goff summarized NPRR1172. Market Participants requested that interested parties submit comments to NPRR1172, and requested additional review by RCWG and WMWG.

**Diana Coleman moved to table NPRR1172 and refer the issue to WMS. Mr. Gross seconded the motion. The motion carried with six abstentions from the Consumer (3) (Occidental, City of Eastland, Residential), Independent Generator (2) (Broad Reach Power, Enel Green Power), and IOU (Lone Start Transmission) Market Segments.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

*NPRR1173, Changes Consistent With the Options Available to an MOU and EC Entering Retail Competition in the ERCOT Market*

Dave Michelsen reviewed NPRR1173. Market Participants noted the Retail Market Subcommittee (RMS) request that PRS table NPRR1173 and refer the issue to RMS and that additional discussions can still take place at the June 6, 2023 RMS meeting before the June 14, 2023 PRS meeting. Ms. Henson noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

*NPRR1174, Market Participant’s Return of Settlement Funds to ERCOT Following Receipt of Overpayment*

Austin Rosel summarized NPRR1174. In response to Market Participant questions and concerns, Doug Fohn reviewed the similarities to the existing Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) process. Market Participants requested additional review of Settlement and resettlement scenarios by WMS and the Credit Finance Sub Group (CFSG). Ms. Henson noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

*NPRR1175, Revisions to Market Entry Financial Qualifications and Continued Participation Requirements*

Katherine Gross reviewed NPRR1175. Market Participants requested further review by the CFSG for issues such as limitations on what constitutes unreasonable financial risk and questions regarding civil matters pertaining to conviction, or settlement by parties, in cases involving fraud. Ms. Henson noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

*NPRR1176, Update to EEA Trigger Levels*

Nitika Mago summarized NPRR1176. Market Participants discussed whether NPRR1176 needed Urgent status and determined to maintain a normal timeline. Ms. Henson noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

Combined Ballot

**Mr. Haley moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To approve the April 13, 2023, PRS Meeting Minutes as presented**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1178 as submitted and to forward to TAC NPRR1178 and the 5/3/23 Impact Analysis**
* **To table NPRR1179 and refer the issue to WMS**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 4/13/23 PRS Report and the 2/14/23 Impact Analysis for NPRR1163**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 4/13/23 PRS Report and the 3/7/23 Impact Analysis for NPRR1166**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 4/13/23 PRS Report and the 4/25/23 Impact Analysis for NPRR1168**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1150 as amended by the 4/20/23 ERCOT comments**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 4/13/23 PRS Report as amended by the 4/28/23 ERCOT comments as revised by PRS and the 3/8/23 Impact Analysis for NPRR1167**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1169 as amended by the 5/9/23 ERCOT comments as revised by PRS and to forward to TAC NPRR1169 and the 3/29/23 Impact Analysis**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1173 as submitted**
* **To table NPRR1174 and refer the issue to WMS and CFSG**
* **To table NPRR1175 and refer the issue to CFSG**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1176 as submitted**

**Mr. Nguyen seconded the motion. The motion carried with one abstention from the IOU (Lone Star Transmission) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Notice of Withdrawal (see Key Documents)

*NPRR1067, Market Entry Qualifications, Continued Participation Requirements, and Credit Risk Assessment*

Ms. Henson noted the withdrawal of NPRR1067.

Other Business

*Other Binding Documents*

Ann Boren reminded Market Participants of the changes in NPRR1157, Incorporation of PUCT Approval into Revision Request Process, noted that this applies to Other Binding Documents, and stated that ERCOT is reviewing items for consideration in the protocols or guides to maximize efficiencies.

*June PRS Meeting*

Ms. Coleman stated that in consideration of the June 15, 2023 PUCT Open Meeting, the June 15, 2023 PRS meeting would be rescheduled to Wednesday, June 14, 2023.

Adjournment

Ms. Henson adjourned the May 10, 2023 PRS meeting at 1:49 p.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at <https://www.ercot.com/calendar/05102023-PRS-Meeting> unless otherwise noted [↑](#footnote-ref-2)