**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Meeting**

**ERCOT Austin – 8000 Metropolis Drive (Building E), Suite 100 – Austin, Texas 78744**

**Wednesday, March 1, 2023 – 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Allen, Thresa | Avangrid Renewables (Avangrid) | Via Teleconference |
| Bierschbach, Erika | Austin Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Blakey, Eric | Pedernales Electric Cooperative |  |
| Campo, Curtis | Garland Power and Light (GP&L) | Via Teleconference |
| Cochran, Seth | DC Energy |  |
| DeLeon, Amanda | Tenaska Power Services (Tenaska) | Via Teleconference |
| Denison, Taylor | City of Eastland |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Goff, Eric | Consumer – Residential |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Corporation |  |
| Hanson, Kevin | National Grid Renewables (NG Renewables) |  |
| Hendrix, Chris | Demand Control 2 | Alt. Rep. for Anoush Farhangi via Teleconference |
| Hunsaker, David | Chariot Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Jolly, Emily | Lower Colorado River Authority (LCRA) |  |
| Lee, Jim | CenterPoint Energy (CNP) |  |
| Lindberg, Ken | Bryan Texas Utilities (BTU) | Via Teleconference |
| Nguyen, Andy | Constellation Energy Generation |  |
| Rich, Katie | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative (GSEC) | Via Teleconference |
| Roberts, Vincent | Texas-New Mexico Power (TNMP) | Via Teleconference |
| Smith, Mark | CMC Steel Texas | Via Teleconference |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy North America (SENA) | Alt. Rep. for Wen Zhang Via Teleconference |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative (STEC) | Via Teleconference |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor Electric Delivery (Oncor) |  |

The following proxies were assigned:

* Bill Barnes to Chris Hendrix
* Blake Gross to Jim Lee

*Guests:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG | Via Teleconference |
| Aldridge, Ryan | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Ashley, Kristy | CES |  |
| Batra-Shrader, Monica | Enchanted Rock | Via Teleconference |
| Bertin, Suzanne |  | Via Teleconference |
| Bivens, Carrie | Potomac Economics | Via Teleconference |
| Blackburn, Don | Hunt Energy Network Power Marketing | Via Teleconference |
| Block, Laurie |  | Via Teleconference |
| Boggs, Callie | Eric Winters Goff, LLC | Via Teleconference |
| Boisseau, Heather | LCRA | Via Teleconference |
| Callender, Hudson | CPS Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Chamberlin, Jennifer | CPower | Via Teleconference |
| Conant, Portia | Yes Energy | Via Teleconference |
| De La Rosa, Lewis | Texas Reliability Entity | Via Teleconference |
| DeLeon, Seth | DME | Via Teleconference |
| Dharme, Neeraja | EDFT | Via Teleconference |
| Didsayabutra, Paul |  | Via Teleconference |
| Dollar, Zachary | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Fink, Regan | PG Renewables | Via Teleconference |
| Hall, Matthew | Invenergy | Via Teleconference |
| Hanson, Pamela |  | Via Teleconference |
| Headrick, Bridget | CES | Via Teleconference |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor | Via Teleconference |
| Hubbard, John | TIEC | Via Teleconference |
| Inman, Grant | BP | Via Teleconference |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Lee, Tina | WattBridge | Via Teleconference |
| Levine, Norman | NRG | Via Teleconference |
| Lotter, Eric | GridMonitor | Via Teleconference |
| Lu, Bo | Broad Reach Power | Via Teleconference |
| Macaraeg, Tad | Stem | Via Teleconference |
| McMurray, Mark | BTU | Via Teleconference |
| Mendoza, Albert | Oxy | Via Teleconference |
| Niemi, Mikko | Teal Systems | Via Teleconference |
| Noyes, Theresa | LCRA |  |
| Ok, Brendan | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Okenfuss, James | Savion | Via Teleconference |
| Petäjäsoja, Ida | InBalance | Via Teleconference |
| Pokharel, Nabaraj | OPUC | Via Teleconference |
| Ramaswamy, Ramya | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Reid, Walter | Advanced Power Alliance | Via Teleconference |
| Ritch, John | NextEra |  |
| Sager, Brenden | Austin Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Showalter, Dana | Plus Power | Via Teleconference |
| Siddiqi, Shams | Crescent Power | Via Teleconference |
| Sithuraj, Murali | LCRA | Via Teleconference |
| Smith, Caitlin | Jupiter Power | Via Teleconference |
| Snyder, Bill | AEPSC | Via Teleconference |
| Stephenson, Zach | TEC | Via Teleconference |
| Teng, Shuye | LCRA | Via Teleconference |
| True, Roy | ACES Power | Via Teleconference |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska | Via Teleconference |
| Viswanathan, Jay |  | Via Teleconference |
| Walker, Floyd | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Williams, Wes | BTU | Via Teleconference |
| Wu, Tiffany | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Yong, Cheng | Lone Star Transmission | Via Teleconference |
| Zang, Hailing | TC Energy | Via Teleconference |

*ERCOT Staff:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Anderson, Troy |  | Via Teleconference |
| Billo, Jeff |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  | Via Teleconference |
| Chu, Zhengguo |  | Via Teleconference |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Du, Pengwei |  | Via Teleconference |
| Garcia, Freddy |  | Via Teleconference |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |  |
| Hailu, Ted |  | Via Teleconference |
| Huang, Fred |  | Via Teleconference |
| Khodabakhsh, Fred |  | Via Teleconference |
| Magarinos, Marcelo |  | Via Teleconference |
| Maggio, Dave |  |  |
| Mago, Nitika |  | Via Teleconference |
| McGuire, Joshua |  | Via Teleconference |
| Phillips, Cory |  | Via Teleconference |
| Raish, Carl |  |  |
| Rosel, Austin |  | Via Teleconference |
| Shanks, Magie |  | Via Teleconference |
| Shaw, Pamela |  | Via Teleconference |
| Smith, Nathan |  | Via Teleconference |
| Thomas, Shane |  | Via Teleconference |
| Thuerwaechter, Kashia |  | Via Teleconference |
| Wasik-Gutierrez, Erin |  | Via Teleconference |

*Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments participated in the votes.*

Eric Blakey called the March 1, 2023 WMS meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Antitrust Admonition

Mr. Blakey directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Agenda Review

Mr. Blakey reviewed the agenda.

Approval of WMS Meeting Minutes

*February 6, 2023*

This item was deferred to the April 5, 2023 WMS meeting.

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

Mr. Blakey reviewed the disposition of items considered at the February 20, 2023 TAC meeting.

Market Credit Working Group (MCWG)

Brenden Sager reviewed MCWG activities, including the TAC assignment to create a Credit and Finance Sub Group charter for consideration at the March 21, 2023 TAC meeting.

2023 WMS Goals (see Key Documents)

Market Participants discussed potential 2023 WMS Goals. Mr. Blakey encouraged Market Participants to offer clarifications to the 2023 Goals for consideration at the April 5, 2023 WMS meeting.

ERCOT Operations and Market Items (see Key Documents)

*2022 Analysis of Retail Electric Providers (REPs) and Non-Opt-In Entities (NOIEs) Demand Response*

Carl Raish detailed findings of the 2022 Analysis of REP and NOIE Demand Response and presented next steps.

Cross-State Air Pollution Rule (CSAPR) Oxides of Nitrogen (NOx) Season Allowance Workshop Update and Next Steps

Mr. Blakey highlighted action items from the February 6, 2023 CSAPR NOx Season Allowance Workshop. Ian Haley offered to provide next steps at a future WMS meeting.

WMS Revision Requests (see Key Documents)

*Urgency Vote*

*Commercial Operations Market Guide Revision Request (COPMGRR) 049, Related to NPRR1157, Incorporation of PUCT Approval into Revision Request Process*

*Settlement Metering Operating Guide Revision Request (SMOGRR) 026, Related to NPRR1157, Incorporation of PUCT Approval into Revision Request Process*

*Verifiable Cost Manual Revision Request (VCMRR) 036, Related to NPRR1157, Incorporation of PUCT Approval into Revision Request Process*

Brittney Albracht summarized COPMGRR049, SMOGRR026, and VCMRR306, the request for Urgent status, and the respective 2/22/23 Impact Analyses. Market Participants offered administrative clarifications to COPMGRR049 and VCMRR036. Mr. Blakey noted that these items could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

Congestion Management Working Group (CMWG) (see Key Documents)

Katie Rich reviewed CMWG activities and noted the March 6, 2023 CMWG is cancelled.

Wholesale Market Working Group (WMWG)

John Ritch reviewed WMWG activities.

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS or ROS and Referred to WMS (see Key Documents)

*Nodal Operating Guide Revision Request (NOGRR) 215, Limit Use of Remedial Action Schemes*

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 1067, Market Entry Qualifications, Continued Participation Requirements, and Credit Risk Assessment*

*NPRR1070, Planning Criteria for GTC Exit Solutions*

*NPRR1143, Provide ERCOT Flexibility to Determine When ESRs May Charge During an EEA Level 3*

*NPRR1146, Credit Changes to Appropriately Reflect TAO Exposure*

WMS took no action on these items.

WMS Revision Requests Tabled at WMS (see Key Documents)

*Verifiable Cost Manual Revision Request (VCMRR) 031, Clarification Related to Variable Costs in Fuel Adders*

*VCMRR033, Excluding Exceptional Fuel Costs from Fuel Adders*

*VCMRR034, Excluding RUC Approved Fuel Costs from Fuel Adders*

*VCMRR035, Allow Verified Contractual Costs in Fuel Adder Calculation*

WMS took no action on these items.

Market Settlement Working Group (MSWG)

*MSWG Leadership*

*Vice Chair: Shuye Teng, LCRA*

Mr. Blakey noted that this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

Meter Working Group (MWG)

*MWG Leadership*

*Chair: Doug Breshears, BEC*

*Vice Chair: Michael Blum, CNP*

Mr. Blakey noted that this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

Demand Side Working Group (DSWG)

*DSWG Leadership*

Market Participants discussed DSWG leadership opportunities and expressed support for Jennifer Chamberlin, CPower, as Chair and Kevin Hanson, National Grid Renewables, as Vice-Chair. Mr. Blakey noted that this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

Combined Ballot

**Emily Jolly moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To grant COPMGRR049 Urgent status; to recommend approval of COPMGRR049 as revised by WMS; and to forward to TAC COPMGRR049 and the 2/22/23 Impact Analysis**
* **To grant SMOGRR026 Urgent status; to recommend approval of SMOGRR026 as submitted; and to forward to TAC SMOGRR026 and the 2/22/23 Impact Analysis**
* **To grant VCMRR036 Urgent status; to recommend approval of VCMRR036 as revised by WMS; and to forward to TAC VCMRR036 and the 2/22/23 Impact Analysis**
* **To approve Shuye Teng, LCRA as MSWG Vice Chair**
* **To approve Doug Breshears, BEC, as MWG Chair and Michael Blum, CNP, as MWG Vice Chair**
* **To approve Jennifer Chamberlin, CPower, as DSWG Chair and Kevin Hanson, National Grid Renewables, as DSWG Vice Chair**

**Eric Goff seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Other Business (see Key Documents)

*March 3, 2023 and March 15, 2023 Phase 2 Bridging Options Workshops*

Dave Maggio encouraged Market Participants to submit formal comments to the Phase 2 Bridging Options ERCOT presented at the February 27, 2023 Reliability and Market Committee meeting, using the comment form posted on the March 3, 2023 and March 15, 2023 workshop pages on ercot.com.

*Review Open Action Items*

Jim Lee presented draft clarifications to the Open Action Items List and encouraged working group leadership to review the Open Action Items List and provide an update to WMS leadership in an effort to maximize efficiencies and priorities for WMS consideration at the April 5, 2023 meeting.

*No Report*

* Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG)
* Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG)

Adjournment

Mr. Blakey adjourned the March 1, 2023 WMS meeting at 11:46 a.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at:

   <https://www.ercot.com/calendar/03012023-WMS-Meeting> [↑](#footnote-ref-1)