**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Meeting – Webex Only**

**Wednesday, November 2, 2022 – 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Allen, Thresa | Avangrid Renewables (Avangrid) |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services (Reliant) |  |
| Bierschbach, Erika | Austin Energy |  |
| Blakey, Eric | Pedernales Electric Cooperative | Alt. Rep. for Christian Powell |
| Burke, Tom | RWE Renewables |  |
| Camet, Brooke | OPUC |  |
| Cochran, Seth | DC Energy |  |
| Couch, Andrea | Texas-New Mexico Power (TNMP) |  |
| DeLeon, Amanda | Tenaska Power Services (Tenaska) |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Farhangi, Anoush | Demand Control 2 |  |
| Foster, Ashley | Dow Chemical |  |
| Franklin, Russell | Garland Power & Light (GP&L) |  |
| Goff, Eric | Consumer – Residential |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation (AEPSC) |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Corporation |  |
| Hanson, Kevin | National Grid Renewables |  |
| Jackson, Dan | ETC Endure Energy |  |
| Lange, Clif | South Texas Electric Cooperative (STEC) |  |
| Lee, Jim | CenterPoint Energy (CNP) | Alt. Rep. for Perrin Wall |
| Lindberg, Ken | Bryan Texas Utilities (BTU) |  |
| Mauldin, Jamie | City of Eastland |  |
| Nguyen, Andy | Lower Colorado River Authority (LCRA) |  |
| Ritch, John | Gexa Energy |  |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine Corporation (Calpine) |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | Jupiter Power |  |
| Smith, Mark | Nucor |  |
| Stafford, Will | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative (GSEC) | Alt. Rep. for Joe Dan Wilson |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy |  |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative (STEC) |  |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor Electric Delivery (Oncor) |  |

*Guests:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG |  |
| Ashley, Kristy | CES |  |
| Anderson, Connor | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Anderson, Kevin | CES |  |
| Batra-Shrader, Monica | Enchanted Rock |  |
| Benson, Mariah | PUCT |  |
| Berry, Danny | LCRA |  |
| Bivens, Carrie | Potomac Economics |  |
| Blackburn, Don | Hunt Energy Network Power Marketing |  |
| Callender, Hudson | CPS Energy |  |
| Carson, Michael | BETM |  |
| Chamberlin, Jennifer | CPower |  |
| Chiang, Richard | WattBridge |  |
| Clifford, Brigid | CES |  |
| Coleman, Diana | CPS Energy |  |
| Conant, Portia | Yes Energy |  |
| Cortez, Sarai | Trailstone Energy Management |  |
| Coultas, Ann | Enel Green Power |  |
| Cripe, Ramsey | Schneider Engineering |  |
| DeLeon, Seth | DME Power |  |
| Denison, Taylor | LG Law |  |
| Dharme, Neeraja | EDFT |  |
| Dreyfus, Mark | MD Energy Consulting |  |
| Fink, Regan | PG Renewables |  |
| Ghoshal, Orijit | Invenergy |  |
| Gould , Madeline | Enel |  |
| Headrick, Bridget | CES |  |
| Henderson, Ricky |  |  |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor |  |
| Hubbard, John | TIEC |  |
| Hudis, Gabriella | Gabel Associates |  |
| Hughes, Lindsey | Broad Reach Power |  |
| Huynh, Thuy | Potomac Economics |  |
| Inman, Grant | BP |  |
| Jones, Dan |  |  |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Kirby, Brandon | GEUS |  |
| Kirby, Trevor | Habitat Energy |  |
| Kroskey, Tony | Brazos |  |
| Lacek, Mollie | Talen Energy |  |
| Lasher, Warren | Lasher Energy |  |
| Lee, Tina | WattBridge |  |
| Lotter, Eric | GridMonitor |  |
| Lu, Bo | Broad Reach Power |  |
| Mack, Natalia | PECI |  |
| McClellan, Suzi | Good Company Associates |  |
| McIntyre, Ken | Plus Power |  |
| McKeever, Deborah | Oncor |  |
| Mendoza, Albert | Occidental |  |
| Miller, Samantha | LG Law |  |
| Mock, Christopher | BP |  |
| Murdock, John | Plus Power |  |
| Noyes, Theresa | LCRA |  |
| Okenfuss, James | Savion |  |
| Pfefferle, Ryan | Occidental |  |
| Pokharel, Nabaraj | OPUC |  |
| Pyka, Greg | Schneider Engineering |  |
| Ramaswamy, Ramya | PUCT |  |
| Reedy, Steve | CIM View Consulting |  |
| Reid, Walter | Advanced Power Alliance |  |
| Rich, Katie | GSEC |  |
| Sandidge, Clint | Calpine |  |
| Sangroniz, Inigo | Solea Power |  |
| Schwarz, Brad | Sharyland |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | Rainbow Energy Marketing Corporation |  |
| Smith, Chase | Southern Power Company |  |
| Stephenson, Zach | TEC |  |
| Sutjandra, Yohan | Octo Energy |  |
| Swigonski, Frank | PG Renewables |  |
| Thurnher, Greg | Shell Energy |  |
| Townsend, Aaron | IMM |  |
| True, Roy | ACES Power |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska |  |
| Villasana, Kristi | NBU |  |
| Walker, Floyd | PUCT |  |
| Wallin, Shane | DME Power |  |
| Watson, Mark |  |  |
| Wattles, Paul |  |  |
| Williams, Wes | BTU |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Longhorn Power |  |
| Wu, Tiffany | Potomac Economics |  |
| Xie, Fei | Austin Energy |  |
| Zarnikau, Jay | University of Texas |  |
| Zang, Hailing | TC Energy |  |
| Zhang, Matt | Austin Energy |  |
| Zhang, Wen | Shell Energy |  |

*ERCOT Staff:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Anderson, Troy |  |  |
| Barati, Camron |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  |  |
| Chen, Jian |  |  |
| Chu, Zhengguo |  |  |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Dinopol, Ohlen |  |  |
| Dashnyam, Sanchir |  |  |
| Garcia, Freddy |  |  |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |  |
| Hailu, Ted |  |  |
| Hinojosa, Luis |  |  |
| Khodabakhsh, Fred |  |  |
| Lee, Alex |  |  |
| Li, Weifang |  |  |
| Magarinos, Marcelo |  |  |
| Maggio, Dave |  |  |
| Mago, Nitika |  |  |
| Mantena, Dan |  |  |
| Maul, Donald |  |  |
| McGuire, Joshua |  |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Rios, Diana |  |  |
| Rosel, Austin |  |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  |  |
| Ruane, Mark |  |  |
| Schmidt, Matthew |  |  |
| Shaw, Pamela |  |  |
| Sheets, Jaron |  |  |
| Shanks, Maggie |  |  |
| Stice, Clayton |  |  |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  |  |
| Tucker, Don |  |  |
| Warnken, Pete |  |  |
| Wasik-Gutierrez, Erin |  |  |
| Zapanta, Rizaldy |  |  |
|  |  |  |

*Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments participated in the votes.*

Antitrust Admonition

Resmi Surendran directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Agenda Review

There were no changes to the agenda.

Approval of WMS Meeting Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*October 12, 2022*

Market Participants reviewed the October 12, 2022 WMS Meeting Minutes. Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update

Ms. Surendran reviewed the disposition of items considered at the October 26, 2022 TAC meeting.

ERCOT Operations and Market Items (see Key Documents)

*Proposed Changes to Ancillary Service Methodology for 2023*

Nitika Mago presented the proposed ERCOT Methodologies for Determining Minimum Ancillary Service Requirements for 2023. Some Market Participants expressed concern for the ERCOT procurement of Non-Spinning Reserve (Non-Spin) based on a ten-hour forecast rather than six hours. Ms. Mago reviewed the analyses for six and ten hours and noted that the ten-hour forecast will allow ERCOT to better respond to uncertainty. Market Participants also expressed concern for the timeline for formalizing the AS methodology changes in implementing the ERCOT Contingency Reserve Service (ECRS) project and requested ERCOT provide enhanced communication on the deployment process as soon as possible. Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

*Firm Fuel Supply Service (FFSS) Results and Stakeholder Request for Offer Disclosure*

Pamela Shaw reviewed Firm Fuel Supply Service Offer Disclosure Information posted on the Firm Fuel Supply Service page at: <https://www.ercot.com/services/programs/firmfuelsupply/>. In response to Market Participants questions and concerns, Ms. Shaw stated that ERCOT is developing a Revision Request for potential improvements and anticipates filing it after receiving additional direction from the Public Utility Commission of Texas (PUCT) in advance of the next FFSS procurement cycle in 2023. Ms. Shaw requested Market Participants contact her or Mark Patterson for questions and concerns on the issues.

*2022 Q3 Unregistered Distributed Generation (DG) Report*

Dan Mantena presented the 3rd Quarter 2022 Unregistered DG Report.

*2022 Q3 Settlement Stability Report*

Maggie Shanks presented the 3rd Quarter 2022 Settlement Stability Report, including the Securitization charges.

New Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Referrals (see Key Documents)

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 1149, Implementation of Systematic Ancillary Service Failed Quantity Charges*

Ms. Shaw reviewed NPRR1149. Carrie Bivens summarized the 9/20/22 IMM comments to NPRR1149 and requested NPRR1149 advance through the stakeholder process as quickly as possible. Some Market Participants noted their intent to provide additional clarifications to NPRR1149. Market Participants requested further review of the issues by the Wholesale Market Working Group (WMWG). Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

Market Credit Working Group (MCWG) (see Key Documents)

Seth Cochran reviewed MCWG activities.

WMWG (see Key Documents)

*WMWG Leadership*

Bryan Sams reviewed WMWG activities and requested WMS consideration of Murali Sithuraj, LCRA as WMWG Vice-Chair. Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS or ROS and Referred to WMS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR1067, Market Entry Qualifications, Continued Participation Requirements, and Credit Risk Assessment*

*NPRR1070, Planning Criteria for GTC Exit Solutions*

*NPRR1138, Communication of Capability and Status of Online IRRs at 0 MW Output*

*NPRR1143, Provide ERCOT Flexibility to Determine When ESRs May Charge During an EEA Level 3*

*NPRR1145, Use of State Estimator-Calculated ERCOT-Wide TLFs in Lieu of Seasonal Base Case ERCOT-Wide TLFs for Settlement*

*NPRR1146, Credit Changes to Appropriately Reflect TAO Exposure*

*Nodal Operating Guide Revision Request (NOGRR) 215, Limit Use of Remedial Action Schemes*

WMS took no action on these items.

*NPRR1144, Station Service Backup Power Metering*

John Murdock summarized NPRR1144 and the 8/29/22 Joint Commentor comments. Tom Burke reminded Market Participants of the NPRR1144 discussion at the October 12, 2022 WMS meeting, stated that participation is voluntary, and noted that Transmission Service Providers (TSPs) could reject the proposal.

**Mr. Burke moved to endorse NPRR1144 as amended by the 8/29/22 Joint Commenters comments. Thresa Allen seconded the motion. The motion carried with four abstentions from the Cooperative (STEC), Independent Generator (Calpine), Independent Power Marketer (IPM) (SENA) and Investor Owned Utility (IOU) (CNP) Market Segments.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Revision Requests Tabled at WMS (see Key Documents)

*Verifiable Cost Manual Revision Request (VCMRR) 031, Clarification Related to Variable Costs in Fuel Adders*

*VCMRR033, Excluding Exceptional Fuel Costs from Fuel Adders*

*VCMRR034, Excluding RUC Approved Fuel Costs from Fuel Adders*

*VCMRR035, Allow Verified Contractual Costs in Fuel Adder Calculation*

WMS took no action on these items.

Combined Ballot

**Ivan Velasquez moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To approve the October 12, 2022 WMS Minutes as submitted**
* **To endorse the ERCOT Methodologies for Determining Minimum Ancillary Service Requirements for 2023 as recommended by ERCOT**
* **To request PRS continue to table NPRR1149 for further review by WMWG**
* **To endorse Murali Sithuraj, LCRA as 2022 WMWG Vice-Chair**

**Ian Haley seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously. The IREP Market Segment did not participate in the vote.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG) (see Key Documents)

Caitlin Smith reviewed SAWG activities. Pete Warnken summarized the Zonal Supply Deliverability Study and the Effective Load Carrying Capability (ELCC) Study, presented next steps, and responded to Market Participant questions and concerns.

Demand Side Working Group (DSWG)

Greg Thurnher reviewed DSWG activities. Some Market Participants expressed support for consideration of a Distributed Energy Resource (DER) Task Force to expand the Aggregate Distributed Energy Resource (ADER) Pilot Project pilot program to include Ancillary Services beyond Non-Spin, and include DSWG in a supporting role. Mr. Thurnher and ERCOT Staff offered to consider the potential for a discussion of the issues at the December 12, 2022 DSWG meeting.

Other Business

*2023 ERCOT Membership/Segment Representative Elections*

Brittney Albracht reminded Market Participants that the membership date of record is Friday, November 18, 2022 and stated that 2023 Segment Representative Elections for TAC and Subcommittees would begin the week after the record date.

*Review Open Action Items*

Market Participants reviewed the Open Action Items List.

*No Report*

* Congestion Management Working Group (CMWG)
* Market Settlement Working Group (MSWG)
* Metering Working Group (MWG)
* Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG)

Adjournment

Ms. Surendran adjourned the November 2, 2022 WMS meeting at 12:44 p.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at:

   <https://www.ercot.com/calendar/11022022-WMS-Meeting-by-Webex> [↑](#footnote-ref-1)