**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Meeting**

**Webex Only**

**Wednesday, September 1, 2021– 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Bierschbach, Erika | Austin Energy |  |
| Burke, Tom | Invenergy |  |
| Carpenter, Jeremy | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Cochran, Seth | DC Energy |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Downey, Marty | Jupiter Power |  |
| Evans, Mike | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Farhangi, Anoush | Demand Control 2 |  |
| Franklin, Russell | Garland Power & Light  |  |
| Goff, Eric | OPUC | Alt. Rep. for Shawnee Claiborn-Pinto |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Generation |  |
| Hendrix, Chris | Demand Control 2 | Alt. Rep. for Anoush Farhangi |
| Johnson, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Lange, Clif | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Mauldin, Jamie | City of Eastland |  |
| Nguyen, Andy | Lower Colorado River Authority | Alt. Rep. for John Dumas |
| Roberts, Bobby | TNMP |  |
| Sandidge, Clint | Calpine Energy Solutions |  |
| Simpson, Lori | Exelon |  |
| Smith, Mark | Nucor |  |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative | Alt. Rep. for Clif Lange |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor |  |
| Wilson, Joe Dan | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |

The following proxy was assigned:

* Resmi Surendran to Seth Cochran

*Guests:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG |  |
| Aldridge, Ryan | AB Power Advisors  |  |
| Alford, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Allen, Thresa | Avangrid Renewables |  |
| Anderson, Connor | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Anderson, Kevin | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Ashley, Kristy | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Beggs, Matthew | Tenaska Power Services  |  |
| Bell, Brad | Solar Proponent |  |
| Benson, Mariah | PUCT |  |
| Bivens, Carrie | Potomac Economics |  |
| Blakey, Eric | Just Energy |  |
| Brandin, Samuel | Able Grid Energy |  |
| Bunch, Kevin | EDF Trading North America  |  |
| Bunyan, Michael | Jupiter Power |  |
| Chhajed, Pushkar | LCRA |  |
| Clark, Jack | Next Era Energy |  |
| Coleman, Diana | CPS Energy |  |
| Daigneault, Ralph | Potomac Economics |  |
| Deleon, Amanda | Tenaska Power Services  |  |
| Dreyfus, Mark | MD Energy Consulting |  |
| Floyd, Rickey | Oncor |  |
| Foreman, Mark | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Hanson, Kevin | National Grid |  |
| Harvey, Julia | Texas Electric Cooperatives |  |
| Hayden, Jolly | GDS Associates |  |
| Helton, Bob | Engie North America  |  |
| Henry, Mark | Texas Reliability Entity |  |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor |  |
| Hoang, Clifford | Voltus |  |
| Horstmyer, Reid | Dynasty Power |  |
| Jackson, Dan | Endure Energy- Energy Transfer |  |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Kilroy, Taylor | TPPA |  |
| Krajecki, Jim | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Kroskey, Tony | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Lotter, Eric | GridMonitor |  |
| Matt, Kevin | NRG |  |
| Mendoza, Albert | Occidental |  |
| Miller, Alexandra | EDFR  |  |
| Okenfuss, James | Savion |  |
| Powell, Christian | Pedernales Electric Cooperative |  |
| Rainwater, Kim | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Reid, Walter | Advanced Power Alliance |  |
| Rich, Katie | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |
| Richmond, Michele | TCPA |  |
| Sager, Brenden | Austin Energy |  |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine |  |
| Schumate, Walt |  |  |
| Schwarz, Brad | Sharyland |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | Crescent Power Consulting |  |
| Sithuraj, Murali | Austin Energy |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Smith, Chase | Southern Power Company |  |
| Townsend, Aaron | Potomac Economics |  |
| True, Roy | ACES Power |  |
| Uy, Manny | Hunt Energy |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Villasana, Kristi | NBU |  |
| Walke, Pranil | Calpine |  |
| Wall, Perrin | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| White, Lauri | AEP |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Longhorn Power |  |
| Yu, Joel | Enchanted Rock |  |
| Zarnikau, Jay | Frontier Energy |  |
| Zhou, Emily | Potomac Economics |  |

*ERCOT Staff:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Anderson, Troy |  |  |
| Barati, Camron |  |  |
| Bernecker, John |  |  |
| Billo, Jeff |  |  |
| Blevins, Bill  |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  |  |
| Bracy, Phil |  |  |
| Cheng, Yong |  |  |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Comstock, Read |  |  |
| Dinopol, Ohlen |  |  |
| Du, Pengwei |  |  |
| Garcia, Freddy |  |  |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |  |
| House, Donald |  |  |
| Huang, Fred |  |  |
| Jones, Dan |  |  |
| Kane, Erika |  |  |
| Khodabakhsh, Fred |  |  |
| Lee, Alex |  |  |
| Maggio, David |  |  |
| Mago, Nitika |  |  |
| Martinez, Adriana |  |  |
| Moreno, Alfredo |  |  |
| Moreno, Alfredo |  |  |
| Patterson, Mark |  |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Rios, Diana |  |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  |  |
| Ruane, Mark |  |  |
| Sharma, Sandip |  |  |
| Shaw, Pamela |  |  |
| Singh, Vijay |  |  |
| Stice, Clayton |  |  |
| Warnken, Pete |  |  |
| Xiao, Hong |  |  |

*Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments participated in the votes.*

Antitrust Admonition

Ivan Velasquez directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Agenda Review

There were no changes to the agenda.

Approval of WMS Meeting Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*August 4, 2021*

Market Participants reviewed the August 4, 2021 WMS meeting minutes. Mr. Velasquez noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update (see Key Documents)

*August 27, 2021*

Mr. Velasquez reviewed the disposition of items considered at the August 27, 2021 TAC meeting, including clarifications to the Emergency Conditions List, modifications to the Electric Reliability Council of Texas Technical Advisory Committee Procedures to codify quorum and voting participation requirements for TAC and TAC Subcommittee hybrid remote/in-person meetings, and the sunset of the Real-Time Co-Optimization Task Force (RTCTF). Mr. Velasquez noted to comply with Senate Bill 2 ERCOT Staff will develop Market Impact Statements for Revision Requests that will be considered by the ERCOT Board and Public Utility Commission of Texas (PUCT), and that TAC will review these statements. Mr. Velasquez summarized the discussion on the Ancillary Services analyses and changes in requirements.

New Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Referrals (see Key Documents)

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR)* *1088, Applying Forward Adjustment Factors to Forward Market Positions and Un-applying Forward Adjustment Factors to Prior Market Positions*

Market Participants reviewed NPRR1088 and the 8/6/21 ERCOT comments, noted the discussion at the August 18, 2021 Market Credit Working Group (MCWG) meeting, and requested MCWG review the issues. Mr. Velasquez noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

*NPRR1090, ERS Winter Storm Uri Lessons Learned Changes and Other ERS Items*

Camron Barati summarized NPRR1090, the 8/25/21 ERCOT comments and discussion at the July 30, 2021 Demand Side Working Group (DSWG) meeting. Market Participants expressed support to consider endorsing NPRR1090 with Urgent status. Some Market Participants expressed concern for communication issues during an Energy Emergency Alert (EEA), stated that Verbal Dispatch Instructions (VDIs) are necessary to confirm requested Emergency Response Service (ERS) deployments, and offered clarifications to NPRR1090.

**Clif Lange moved to endorse Urgent status for NPRR1090, and to endorse NPRR1090 as revised by WMS. Erika Bierschbach seconded the motion.** ERCOT Staff discussed the proposed communication plan in an EEA event and in consideration of the implementation timeline for NPRR1090, offered to consider those concepts in a separate Revision Request. Mr. Lange offered to develop clarifications with ERCOT Staff and withdrew his motion. Ms. Bierschbach withdrew her second.

Market Participants reviewed the proposed clarifications to NPRR1090.

**Mr. Lange moved to endorse Urgent status for NPRR1090, and to endorse NPRR1090 as revised by WMS. Bill Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried via roll call vote with one objection from the Independent Power Marketer (IPM) (Morgan Stanley) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

*System Change Request (SCR) 816, CRR Auction Bid Credit Enhancement*

Seth Cochran summarized SCR816. Market Participants discussed the concepts in SCR816 and the potential to modify the Congestion Revenue Right (CRR) auction calendar to achieve the desired solution. Donald House summarized the concepts and potential timeline in consideration of testing requirements prior to implementing changes to the CRR auction calendar. Market Participants requested additional review of SCR816 by the Congestion Management Working Group (CMWG). Mr. Velasquez noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot) Mr. Velasquez requested CMWG review potential modifications to the CRR auction calendar and provide their recommendation at the October 6, 2021 WMS meeting.

Wholesale Market Working Group (WMWG) (see Key Documents)

David Detelich reviewed WMWG activities, including the Emergency Conditions list items and 2022 ERCOT Ancillary Services Methodology.

Revision Requests Tabled at Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS), Referred to WMS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR981, Day-Ahead Market Price Correction Process (WMWG)*

*NPRR1058, Resource Offer Modernization for Real-Time Co-Optimization*

*NPRR1067, Market Entry Qualifications, Continued Participation Requirements, and Credit Risk Assessment*

*NPRR1070, Planning Criteria for GTC Exit Solutions*

*NPRR1084, Improvements to Reporting of Resource Outages and Derates (WMWG)*

WMS took no action on these items.

*NPRR1077, Extension of Self-Limiting Facility Concept to Settlement Only Generators (SOGs) and Telemetry Requirements for SOGs*

Clayton Stice reviewed NPRR1077 and the 8/16/21 ERCOT comments. Mr. Detelich summarized NPRR1077 discussion at the 8/20/21 WMWG meeting and stated WMWG was not in consensus on the issues. ERCOT Staff highlighted the need for greater visibility and reviewed forecasting impacts to ERCOT operations and planning with the increasing participation by SOGs. Some Market Participants expressed concern for the 10-second requirement and cost impacts in implementing NPRR1077.

**Mr. Detelich moved to endorse NPRR1077 as amended by the 8/16/21 ERCOT comments. Mr. Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried via roll call vote with three objections from the IPM (2) (Tenaska, Morgan Stanley) and Independent Retail Electric Provider (IREP) (Demand Control 2) Market Segments, and one abstention from the IPM (Shell) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Market Credit Working Group (see Key Documents)

Brenden Sager reviewed MCWG activities.

CMWG (see Key Documents)

Katie Rich reviewed CMWG activities, including updates to the Emergency Conditions list items.

*Other Binding Document Revision Request (OBDRR) 026, Change Shadow Price Caps to Curves and Remove Shift Factor Threshold*

*Nodal Operating Guide Revision Request (NOGRR) 215, Limit Use of Remedial Action Schemes*

WMS took no action on these items.

Revision Requests Tabled at WMS (see Key Documents)

*Verifiable Cost Manual Revision Request (VCMRR) 031, Clarification Related to Variable Costs in Fuel Adders*

WMS took no action on this item.

Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG) (see Key Documents)

Caitlin Smith reviewed SAWG activities, including updates to the Emergency Conditions list items and the Seasonal Assessment of Resource Adequacy for the ERCOT Region (SARA) Probabilistic Model Summer 2021. Pete Warnken announced the SARA for Fall 2021 will be posted to the ERCOT website on Friday, September 3, 2021 and a market notice will be distributed.

ERCOT Operations and Market Items (see Key Documents)

*NPRR1078, Clarification of potential uplift*

In response to Market Participant requests, Mark Ruane summarized NPRR1078, noted it would be implemented in the credit calculation on September 8, 2021, and reviewed the uplift process for amounts not covered under the securitization order from the PUCT.

*Solar Issues*

Mr. Barnes summarized concerns regarding summer 2021 solar forecast and performance, including under production for Solar Resources during periods with little or no congestion and requested an assignment to WMWG to review the issues. Mr. Velasquez directed WMWG to review the issues. Nitika Mago offered to provide the requested analyses at the September 22, 2021 WMWG meeting.

Other Business

*Major Transmission Elements (MTE) list*

Rickey Floyd presented the MTE list, noted consensus at the August 19, 2021 Operations Working Group (OWG) meeting, and requested WMS consideration. Mr. Velasquez noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Combined_Ballot)

*Annual TAC Subcommittee Structural Review*

Market Participants reviewed meeting efficiencies for WMS and its working groups in consideration of the TAC criteria. Mr. Velasquez noted that Distributed Generation (DG) and Distribution Generation Resource (DGR) issues will continue to be reviewed at WMWG and DSWG. Mr. Velasquez encouraged Market Participants to attend the September 17, TAC and TAC Subcommittee Structural and Procedural Review by Webex only.

*Review Open Action Items*

Market Participants reviewed the Open Action Items and removed the completed items:

* Review of the outcome of the Load Distribution Factors (LDFs) in the 2021 timeframe (CMWG)
* Review liquidation procedures as they impact CRRs and recommend potential changes (MCWG)

*No Report*

* DSWG
* Market Settlement Working Group (MSWG)
* Metering Working Group (MWG)
* Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG)

Combined Ballot

**Ian Haley moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To approve the August 4, 2021 WMS Meeting Minutes as submitted**
* **To request PRS continue to table NPRR1088 for further discussion by MCWG**
* **To request PRS continue to table SCR816 for further discussion by CMWG**
* **To endorse the 2021 MTE List as presented**

**Tom Burke seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously via roll call vote.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Adjournment

Mr. Velasquez adjourned the September 1, 2021 WMS meeting at 1:01 p.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at:

http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2021/9/1/213965-WMS [↑](#footnote-ref-1)