**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Meeting**

**Webex Only**

**Wednesday, April 7, 2021– 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Bierschbach, Erika | Austin Energy |  |
| Burke, Tom | Invenergy |  |
| Carpenter, Jeremy | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Claiborn-Pinto, Shawnee | OPUC |  |
| Cochran, Seth | DC Energy |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy  |  |
| Downey, Marty | Jupiter Power |  |
| Evans, Mike | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Farhangi, Anoush | Demand Control 2 |  |
| Franklin, Russell | Garland Power and Light |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Generation |  |
| Johnson, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Lange, Clif | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Lindberg, Ken | Bryan Texas Utilities |  |
| Mauldin, Jamie | City of Eastland |  |
| Nguyen, Andy | Lower Colorado River Authority | Alt. Rep. for John Dumas |
| Roberts, Bobby | TNMP |  |
| Sandidge, Clint | Calpine Energy Solutions |  |
| Sefa, Fanar | Blue Cube Operations |  |
| Simpson, Lori | Exelon |  |
| Smith, Mark | Nucor |  |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy  |  |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor |  |
| Wilson, Joe Dan | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |

The following proxy was assigned:

* Clayton Greer to Seth Cochran

*Guests:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG |  |
| Alford, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Allen, Thresa | Avangrid Renewables |  |
| Ashley, Kristy | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Bailey, Dan | Garland Power and Light |  |
| Bauman, Todd | Pearl Street Merchant |  |
| Benson, Mariah | PUCT |  |
| Bivens, Carrie | Potomac Economics |  |
| Blackburn, Don | Hunt Energy Network Power  |  |
| Blakey, Eric | Just Energy |  |
| Boisseau, Heather | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Breshears, Doug | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Bruce, Mark | Cratylus Advisors |  |
| Chamberlin, Jennifer | Power Energy Management |  |
| Chatlani, Varsha | Boston Energy |  |
| Coleman, Diana | CPS Energy |  |
| Coultas, Ann | Enel |  |
| Crouch, Clif | PUCT |  |
| Daigneault, Ralph | Potomac Economics |  |
| Donohoo, Kenneth | EPE |  |
| Dreyfus, Mark | MD Energy Consulting |  |
| Duensing, Allison | Sarac Energy |  |
| Fazio, Danielle | ECTP |  |
| Foreman, Mark | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Godinez, Gabriel | AEP |  |
| Goff, Eric |  |  |
| Graham, Sophie | Adapt 2 Solutions |  |
| Hasan, Prusha | Texas Advanced Energy |  |
| Heino, Shari | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor |  |
| Hourihan, Mike | CP Power Energy |  |
| Huynh, Thuy | Potomac Economics |  |
| Jolly, Emily | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Khayat, Maribel | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Krajecki, Jim | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Kroskey, Tony | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Lamp, Jeff | Peak Energy |  |
| Lee, Jim | AEP |  |
| Lonescu, Sandra | ATNV Energy LP |  |
| Martin, Loretto | Direct Energy |  |
| McClellan, Suzi | Good Company Associates |  |
| McKeever, Debbie | Oncor |  |
| Mendoza, Albert | Occidental |  |
| Mercado, David | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Miller, Alexandra | EDF Renewables |  |
| Musher, Danny | Key Capture Energy |  |
| Neeraj, Gurpreet | Active Power Investments |  |
| Parker, Ryan | Calpine |  |
| Pelletier, Eveline | Hydroquebec  |  |
| Pickens, Mike | IHS Markit |  |
| Powell, Christian | Pedernales Electric Cooperative |  |
| Price, Chris | 61 Commodities |  |
| Pyka, Greg  | Schneider Engineering |  |
| Rainwater, Kim | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Reid, Walter | Advanced Power Alliance |  |
| Richard, Derek | Calpine |  |
| Richmond, Michele | TCPA  |  |
| Rich, Katie | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |
| Robinson, Rhonda | Calpine |  |
| Sager, Brenden | Austin Energy |  |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine  |  |
| Schwarz, Brad | Sharyland |  |
| Schumate, Walt |  |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | Crescent Power Consulting |  |
| Sithuraj, Murali | Austin Energy |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Smith, Chase | Southern Power |  |
| Smith, Christopher | Austin Energy |  |
| Toomey, Megan | Talen Energy |  |
| Tran, Diane | TIEC |  |
| True, Roy | ACES Power |  |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Villasana, Kristi | New Braunfels Utilities |  |
| Walke, Pranil | Calpine |  |
| Walsh, Dominic | Texas Public Radio |  |
| Winegar, Paige | New Braunfels Utilities |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Longhorn Power |  |
| Woods, Brad | Texas Reliability Entity |  |
| Yu, Joel | Enchanted Rock |  |
| Zarnikau, Jay | Frontier Energy |  |
| Zhou, Emily | Potomac Economics |  |

*ERCOT Staff:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Anderson, Connor |  |  |
| Anderson, Troy |  |  |
| Billo, Jeff |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  |  |
| Boswell, Bill |  |  |
| Bracy, Phil |  |  |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Comstock, Read |  |  |
| Ganjoo, Shalesh |  |  |
| Garcia, Freddy |  |  |
| Gnanam, Prabhu |  |  |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |  |
| Haesler, Jameson |  |  |
| Holt, Blake |  |  |
| House, Donald |  |  |
| Huang, Fred |  |  |
| Hunsucker, Brett |  |  |
| Jones, Dan |  |  |
| Kane, Erika |  |  |
| Kersulis, Jonas |  |  |
| Khodabakhsh, Fred |  |  |
| Lasher, Warren |  |  |
| Maggio, Dave |  |  |
| Mago, Nitika |  |  |
| Martinez, Adam |  |  |
| Moreno, Alfredo |  |  |
| Patterson, Mark |  |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  |  |
| Rosel, Austin |  |  |
| Shaw, Pamela |  |  |
| Singh, Vijay |  |  |
| Solis, Stephen |  |  |
| Stice, Clayton |  |  |
| Thompson, Chad |  |  |
| Thuerwaechter, Kashia |  |  |
| Townsend, Aaron |  |  |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  |  |
| Tucker, Don |  |  |
| Urquhart, Thomas |  |  |
| Warnken, Pete |  |  |
| Xiao, Hong |  |  |

*Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments participated in the votes.*

Antitrust Admonition

Resmi Surendran directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Agenda Review

There were no changes to the agenda.

Approval of WMS Meeting Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*March 3, 2021*

**Shawnee Claiborn-Pinto moved to approve the March 3, 2021 WMS Meeting Minutes as presented. Ian Haley seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously via roll call vote.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update

*Emergency Conditions Issues List*

Ms. Surendran summarized the discussion of the 2021 Extreme Cold Weather event and market issues that fall under the purview of TAC and TAC Subcommittees at the March 5, 2021 TAC meeting, noted the disposition of items considered at the March 24, 2021 TAC meeting, and presented the Emergency Conditions List. Clif Lange reviewed the prioritization, timing and ERCOT resource considerations in advancing items under subcommittee working groups and task forces. Market Participants reviewed the WMS items and assignments to WMS working groups and offered clarifications to the list.

Other Binding Document Revision Request (OBDRR) 026, Change Shadow Price Caps to Curves and Remove Shift Factor Threshold (Waive Notice)

Ms. Surendran noted that due to an administrative issue, OBDRR026 was not posted timely and a successful motion to waive notice would be required for WMS to take action on it.

**Ms. Shawnee Claiborn-Pinto moved to waive notice to consider OBDRR026. Marty Downey seconded the motion. The motion failed via roll call vote with 10 objections from the Consumer (Blue Cube), Cooperative (2) (LCRA, STEC), Independent Generator (2) (Exelon, Luminant), Independent Retail Electric Provider (IREP) (2) (Calpine, Reliant), Investor Owned Utility (IOU) (AEP), and Municipal (2) (Bryan Texas Utilities, Garland Power and Light) Market Segments.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Ms. Surendran requested the Congestion Management Working Group (CMWG) review OBDRR026.

Wholesale Market Working Group (WMWG) (see Key Documents)

David Detelich reviewed WMWG activities, including reviewing participation in Security-Constrained Economic Dispatch (SCED) and Ancillary Services for behind-the-meter Resources, and Day-Ahead Market (DAM) Performance Issue (DAM Delays).

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS, Referred to WMS

*NPRR981, Day-Ahead Market Price Correction Process (WMWG)*

*NPRR1056, Market Impact Generic Transmission Constraint (GTC) Notification*

*NPRR1058, Resource Offer Modernization for Real-Time Co-Optimization*

*NPRR1063, Dynamic Rating Transparency*

*NPRR1067, Market Entry Qualifications, Continued Participation Requirements, and Credit Risk Assessment*

WMS took no action on these items.

CMWG (See Key Documents)

Katie Rich reviewed CMWG activities.

*NOGRR215, Limit Use of Remedial Action Schemes*

WMS took no action on this item.

Market Credit Working Group (See Key Documents)

Brenden Sager reviewed MCWG activities.

Revision Requests Tabled at WMS (See Key Documents)

*Verifiable Cost Manual Revision Request (VCMRR) 031, Clarification Related to Variable Costs in Fuel Adders*

WMS took no action on this item.

Metering Working Group (See Key Documents)

Doug Breshears reviewed MWG activities.

ERCOT Operations and Market Items

There were no ERCOT items.

Other Business

*ERCOT Report on Generator Outages and Derates*

Ms. Surendran noted the request for WMS discussion of issues related to the ERCOT Report on Generator Outages and Derates posted on April 6, 2021 in Public Utility Commission of Texas (PUCT) project No. 51878, and stated that although Woody Rickerson or Dan Woodfin were unable to attend the April 7, 2021 WMS meeting they encouraged WMS to submit concerns and questions to ERCOT. Some Market Participants expressed concern that the Outage data analysis in the report could be misleading, and offered recommendations to include:

* Reflecting generator expected output as opposed to nameplate capacity
* Breaking data down by generator fuel type

*Review Open Action Items*

WMS reviewed Open Action Items.

*No Report*

* Demand Side Working Group (DSWG)
* Market Settlement Working Group (MSWG)
* Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG)
* Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG)

Adjournment

Ms. Surendran adjourned the April 7, 2021 WMS meeting at 11:50 a.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at:

http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2021/4/7/213945-WMS [↑](#footnote-ref-1)