**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Meeting**

**Webex Only**

**Wednesday, March 3, 2021– 1:00 p.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Bierschbach, Erika | Austin Energy |  |
| Burke, Tom | Invenergy |  |
| Carpenter, Jeremy | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Claiborn-Pinto, Shawnee | OPUC |  |
| Cochran, Seth | DC Energy |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Downey, Marty | Jupiter Power |  |
| Evans, Mike | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Farhangi, Anoush | Demand Control 2 |  |
| Franklin, Russell | Garland Power and Light |  |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Generation |  |
| Johnson, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Jolly, Emily | Lower Colorado River Authority | Alt. Rep. for John Dumas |
| Lange, Clif | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Lindberg, Ken | Bryan Texas Utilities |  |
| McNamara, Grace | Chariot Energy |  |
| Mauldin, Jamie | City of Eastland |  |
| Roberts, Bobby | TNMP |  |
| Sandidge, Clint | Calpine Energy Solutions |  |
| Sefa, Fanar | Blue Cube Operations |  |
| Simpson, Lori | Exelon |  |
| Smith, Mark | Nucor |  |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy |  |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative | Alt. Rep. for Clif Lange |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor |  |
| Wilson, Joe Dan | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |

*Guests:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG |  |
| Aldridge, Ryan | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Alexander, Jonathan | Solea Energy |  |
| Alford, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Allen, Thresa | Avangrid Renewables |  |
| Anderson, Kevin | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Arnold, Jonathan | Vertical Research Partners |  |
| Ashley, Kristy | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Bailey, Dan | Garland Power and Light |  |
| Benson, Mariah | PUCT |  |
| Bivens, Carrie | Potomac Economics |  |
| Blakey, Eric | Just Energy |  |
| Bockhorn, Tim | AES |  |
| Bonskowski, Ned | Vistra Energy |  |
| Bosquez, Veronica | Orsted |  |
| Boyd, Lauren | CAMS |  |
| Brandin, Samuel | Able Grid Energy |  |
| Breshears, Doug | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Broussard, Rick | Calpine Solutions |  |
| Bruce, Mark | Cratylus Advisors |  |
| Bunch, Kevin | EDF Trading |  |
| Burnett, Ben | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Caraway, Shannon | Solar Prime |  |
| Chakka, Sathibabu | Austin Energy |  |
| Chatlani, Varsha | Boston Energy |  |
| Clemenhagen, Barbara | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Coleman, Diana | CPS Energy |  |
| Coultas, Ann | Enel |  |
| Cripe, Ramsey | Schneider Engineering |  |
| Crouch, Rebekah | New Braunfels Utilities |  |
| Daigneault, Ralph | Potomac Economics |  |
| David, Lauren | Constellation |  |
| Dawar, Vikas | Active Power Investments |  |
| De La Rosa, Lewis | Texas Reliability Entity |  |
| DiPastena, Philip | DME |  |
| Dreyfus, Mark | MD Energy Consulting |  |
| Farkas, Kristine | Exelon |  |
| Fazio, Danielle | ECTP |  |
| Flanary, Jerry | Constellation |  |
| Foreman, Mark | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Franchetti, Peter | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Gaytan, Jose | Denton Municipal Electric |  |
| Goff, Eric |  |  |
| Graham, Sophie | Adapt 2 Solutions |  |
| Hamann, Andrew | LCRA |  |
| Harvey, Julia | Texas Electric Cooperatives |  |
| Hasan, Prusha | Texas Advanced Energy |  |
| Helton, Bob | ENGIE |  |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor |  |
| Hoang, Lisa | Adapt 2 Solutions |  |
| Hourihan, Mike | CP Power Energy |  |
| Hubbard, John | TK Law |  |
| Huynh, Thuy | Potomac Economics |  |
| Jewell, Michael | Jewell and Associates |  |
| Jones, Liz | Oncor |  |
| Kavulla, Travis | NRG |  |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Kelley, Casey | Exelon |  |
| Khayat, Maribel | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Kilroy, Taylor | TPPA |  |
| Kroskey, Tony | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Lamp, Jeff | Peak Energy |  |
| Lane, Mark | Just Energy |  |
| Lattos, James | Calpine Solutions |  |
| Leahy, Patrick | Just Energy |  |
| Lemaire, Anthony | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Lookadoo, Heddie | NRG |  |
| Lunday, James | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Malik, Naureen | Bloomberg |  |
| Mann, Jane | Rainbow Energy |  |
| Marcinko, John | Just Energy |  |
| Marsh, Rob | Monolith Energy |  |
| Martin, Brooklyn | NRG |  |
| Mathew, Shirley | Austin Energy |  |
| McCamant, Frank | McCamant Consulting |  |
| McClellan, Suzi | Good Company Associates |  |
| McKeever, Debbie | Oncor |  |
| McKie, Cameron | Auroraer |  |
| Mendoza, Albert | Occidental |  |
| Mercado, David | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Minear, Luke | Endure Energy |  |
| Morris, Sandy | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Mortenson, Mark | Rainbow Energy |  |
| Mullins, Emily | Schneider Engineering |  |
| Neeraj, Gurpreet | Active Power Investments |  |
| Ng, Thomas | Capital Power |  |
| Nguyen, Andy | LCRA |  |
| O’Neil, Holly | MP2 Energy |  |
| Paff, Tom | Duke Energy |  |
| Palani, Ananth | Garland Power and Light |  |
| Parker, Ryan | Calpine |  |
| Peck, Alex | Onward Energy |  |
| Pelletier, Eveline | Hydroquebec |  |
| Powell, Christian | Pedernales Electric Cooperative |  |
| Pyka, Greg | Schneider Engineering |  |
| Rainwater, Kim | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Reader, Raborn | Enterprise Productions |  |
| Reid, Walter | Advanced Power Alliance |  |
| Richmond, Michele | TCPA |  |
| Rich, Katie | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |
| Robinson, Rhonda | Calpine |  |
| Ruggles, Mark | Calpine |  |
| Sager, Brenden | Austin Energy |  |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine |  |
| Sazena, Richa | Calpine Solutions |  |
| Schatz, John | Vistra |  |
| Schwarz, Brad | Sharyland |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | Crescent Power Consulting |  |
| Siegrist, Daichi | Calpine Solutions |  |
| Sithuraj, Murali | Austin Energy |  |
| Slaughter, Jeff | Just Energy |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Smith, Chase | Southern Power |  |
| Smith, Christopher | Austin Energy |  |
| Sobrino, Andres | Oxy |  |
| Spaulding, James | Calpine |  |
| Steitz, Deb | AES |  |
| Striedel, James | GDS Associates |  |
| Such, Chris | Recurrent Energy |  |
| Tibbetts, Maeve | Pierce Atwood |  |
| Toomey, Megan | Talen Energy |  |
| Tran, Diane | TIEC |  |
| Trousdale, Justin | Black Rock |  |
| True, Roy | ACES Power |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Villasana, Kristi | New Braunfels Utilities |  |
| Viswanathan, Jay | PNT Financials |  |
| Wallin, Shane | DME Power |  |
| Wan, Josephine | Austin Energy |  |
| Williams, Lori | Bryan Texas Utilities |  |
| Williamson, Kendra | Key Capture Energy |  |
| Winegar, Paige | New Braunfels Utilities |  |
| Whittle, Brandon | Calpine |  |
| Winegar, Paige | New Braunfels Utilities |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Longhorn Power |  |
| Woods, Brad | Texas Reliability Entity |  |
| Yu, Joel | Enchanted Rock |  |
| Zarnikau, Jay | Frontier Energy |  |
| Zhou, Emily | Potomac Economics |  |

*ERCOT Staff:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Adadjo, Fred |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Allen, James |  |  |
| Anderson, Connor |  |  |
| Ayson, Janice |  |  |
| Barati, Camron |  |  |
| Bernecker, John |  |  |
| Bigbee, Nathan |  |  |
| Billo, Jeff |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  |  |
| Boswell, Bill |  |  |
| Bracy, Phil |  |  |
| Cheng, Yong |  |  |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Comstock, Read |  |  |
| Deller, Art |  |  |
| Devadhas Mohanadha, Thinesh |  |  |
| Du, Pengwei |  |  |
| ElHabr, Tony |  |  |
| Ganjoo, Shalesh |  |  |
| Garcia, Freddy |  |  |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |  |
| Han, Minnie |  |  |
| Hanks, David |  |  |
| Hailu, Ted |  |  |
| Heselmeyer, Sarah |  |  |
| Hobbs, Kristi |  |  |
| Holt, Blake |  |  |
| House, Donald |  |  |
| Huang, Fred |  |  |
| Hull, Gibson |  |  |
| Hunsucker, Brett |  |  |
| Jin, Julie |  |  |
| Jones, Dan |  |  |
| Kane, Erika |  |  |
| Khodabakhsh, Fred |  |  |
| Lasher, Warren |  |  |
| Lee, Anson |  |  |
| Maggio, Dave |  |  |
| Mago, Nitika |  |  |
| Mantena, Dan |  |  |
| Martinez, Adam |  |  |
| Matlock, Robert |  |  |
| McGuire, Joshua |  |  |
| Mereness, Matt |  |  |
| Moorty, Sai |  |  |
| Moreno, Alfredo |  |  |
| Ngai, Chris |  |  |
| Orr, Rob |  |  |
| Patterson, Mark |  |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Raish, Carl |  |  |
| Ricaud, Leon |  |  |
| Rickerson, Woody |  |  |
| Rios, Diana |  |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  |  |
| Rosel, Austin |  |  |
| Ruane, Mark |  |  |
| Ryan, Keanen |  |  |
| Scott, Vicki |  |  |
| Sharma, Sandip |  |  |
| Shanks, Magie |  |  |
| Shaw, Pamela |  |  |
| Stice, Clayton |  |  |
| Sumruld, Lisa |  |  |
| Thomas, Shane |  |  |
| Thompson, Chad |  |  |
| Tomlin, Dale |  |  |
| Townsend, Aaron |  |  |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  |  |
| Tucker, Don |  |  |
| Urquhart, Thomas |  |  |
| Warnken, Pete |  |  |
| Wattles, Paul |  |  |
| Wolf, Craig |  |  |
| Woodfin, Dan |  |  |
| Xiao, Hong |  |  |
| Yan, Ping |  |  |
| Young, Matthew |  |  |
| Zhang, Wen |  |  |

***Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments participated in the votes.***

Antitrust Admonition

Resmi Surendran directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Waive Notice for Voting Items

Suzy Clifton noted that due to a delay in the posting and distribution of the agenda for this meeting, a successful motion to waive notice would be required if WMS should elect to take action on the listed voting items. Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

Agenda Review

There were no changes to the agenda.

TAC Request: List of WMS Related Items From February 2021 Weather Event (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

Clif Lange summarized the TAC request to WMS to develop a prioritized list of WMS related items from the February 2021 Weather event for consideration at the March 5, 2021 Special TAC Meeting and highlighted the ERCOT priority items identified in the March 2, 2021 email sent to TAC Representatives from Bill Magness regarding “ERCOT Initial Priorities for February 2021 Extreme Winter Weather Event Issues”. Ms. Surendran presented the draft WMS list and prioritization of items. Market Participants discussed the issues and expressed concern for immediate financial issues, including Settlements and invoices, short pays, and secondary defaults. Mr. Ruane summarized the short payment and default allocation processes described in the March 2, 2021 Market Notice, W-A030221-01 Short Payments for Failure to Make Invoice Payments. Mr. Ruane noted that ERCOT has collected all the letters of credit and other collateral available to cover short pays, and that although there could be additional defaults, ERCOT also anticipates additional resettlements due to timing and metering issues. Mr. Ruane stated that ERCOT was continuing to develop a more detailed reconciliation of the impact of short pays to provide to Qualified Scheduling Entities (QSEs) and Congestion Revenue Right Account Holders (CRRAHs). Market Participants offered clarifications to the list.

Approval of WMS Meeting Minutes (see Key Documents)

*February 3, 2021*

Market Participants reviewed the February 3, 2021 WMS Meeting Minutes. Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

New Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Referrals (see Key Documents)

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 1063, Dynamic Rating Transparency*

Market Participants reviewed NPRR1063 and requested review of the issues by the Congestion Management Working Group (CMWG). Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

*NPRR1067, Market Entry Qualifications, Continued Participation Requirements, and Credit Risk Assessment*

Market Participants reviewed NPRR1067 and requested review of the issues by the Market Credit Working Group (MCWG). Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

WMS Revision Requests (see Key Documents)

Language Review

*Verifiable Cost Manual Revision Request (VCMRR) 031, Clarification Related to Variable Costs in Fuel Adders*

Market Participants reviewed VCMRR031 and requested review of the issues by the Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG). Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

ERCOT Operations and Market Items (see Key Documents)

*Annual update to the Congestion Revenue Right (CRR) Activity Calendar*

Donald House presented the annual update to the CRR Activity Calendar as shared at the January 11, 2021 CMWG meeting and February 3, 2021 WMS meeting, summarized the WMS request to further review the issues, and noted that although the February 15, 2021 CMWG meeting was cancelled the annual update to the CRR Activity Calendar and alternate draft were distributed to the CMWG Listserv with a request for Stakeholder comments and an email vote. Mr. House stated that of the five Stakeholder responses received, only two requested the alternate draft calendar. Mr. House reviewed impacts to the CRR auction credit from delayed invoice postings.

**Ian Haley moved to approve the annual update to the CRR Activity Calendar as recommended by ERCOT at the February 3, 2021 WMS meeting. Clayton Greer seconded the motion.** Erika Bierschbach summarized holiday conflicts to scheduled invoice postings in 2022 and 2023.

**Ms. Bierschbach moved to amend the main motion to approve the annual update to the CRR Activity Calendar with the alternate updates to delay posting of the CRR Auction Results until January 2023 and January 2024.** **The motion failed via roll call vote, with 13 objections from the Consumer (3) (City of Eastland, OPUC, Nucor), Cooperative (3) (Brazos, STEC, GSEC), Independent Generator (3) (Exelon, Jupiter Power, Luminant), Independent Power Marketer (IPM) (2) (DC Energy, Morgan Stanley), and Independent Retail Electric Provider (IREP) (2) (Calpine, Demand Control 2) Market Segments, and eight abstentions from the Cooperative (LCRA), IPM ((Tenaska, Shell Energy), IREP (Chariot), and Investor Owned Utility (IOU) (4) (AEP, CenterPoint, TNMP, Oncor) Market Segments.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

**The motion to approve the annual update to the CRR Activity Calendar as recommended by ERCOT at the February 3, 2021 WMS Meeting carried unanimously via roll call vote.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

*Renewable Energy Credit Project Update*

Don Tucker summarized the Renewable Energy Credit project update, including the multifactor authentication login, process for system generated emails, mapping transition and timeline.

Combined Ballot

**Mr. Haley moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To Waive Notice in order to consider Voting Items**
* **To approve the February 3, 2021 WMS Meeting Minutes as submitted**
* **To request PRS continue to table NPRR1063 for further review by CMWG**
* **To request PRS continue to table NPRR1067 for further review by MCWG**
* **To table VCMRR031 and refer the issue to RCWG**

**Ms. Bierschbach seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously via roll call vote.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG)

Caitlin Smith reviewed SAWG activities.

Other Business

*Workshop*

Clayton Stice announced that ERCOT anticipates hosting the rescheduled Unregistered DG Workshop I at the end of March 2021, noted it would be open to Transmission and/or Distribution Service Providers (TDSPs) and Non-Opt-In Entities (NOIEs) only, and stated that future workshops would be open to a broader audience.

*Low System-Wide Offer Cap (LCAP)*

Dave Maggio stated that at the March 3, 2021 Public Utility Commission of Texas (PUCT) Open Meeting the PUCT ordered that ERCOT remove the February 15, 2021 LCAP suspension, therefore ERCOT will transition to the LCAP for Operating Day (OD) March 4, 2021 and that the Day-Ahead Market (DAM) for OD March 5, 2021 will use the LCAP value. Mr. Maggio noted ERCOT anticipates distributing a March 3, 2021 Market Notice on the issues.

*No Report*

* CMWG
* Demand Side Working Group (DSWG)
* MCWG
* Market Settlement Working Group (MSWG)
* Metering Working Group (MWG)
* RCWG
* Wholesale Market Working Group (WMWG)

Adjournment

Ms. Surendran adjourned the March 3, 2021 WMS meeting at 4:46 p.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at:

   http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2021/3/3/213941-WMS [↑](#footnote-ref-1)