**DRAFT**

**Minutes of the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Meeting**

**Webex Only**

**Wednesday, January 6, 2021– 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Bierschbach, Erika | Austin Energy |  |
| Burke, Tom | Invenergy |  |
| Carpenter, Jeremy | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Claiborn-Pinto, Shawnee | OPUC |  |
| Cochran, Seth | DC Energy |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Downey, Marty | Jupiter Power |  |
| Evans, Mike | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Farhangi, Anoush | Demand Control 2 |  |
| Franklin, Russell | Garland Power and Light |  |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Generation |  |
| Johnson, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Jolly, Emily | Lower Colorado River Authority | Alt. Rep. for John Dumas |
| Lange, Clif | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Lindberg, Ken | Bryan Texas Utilities |  |
| Mauldin, Jamie | City of Eastland |  |
| Roberts, Bobby | TNMP |  |
| Simpson, Lori | Exelon |  |
| Smith, Mark | Nucor |  |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy |  |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative | Alt. Rep. for Clif Lange |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor |  |
| Wilson, Joe Dan | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |

*Guests:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG |  |
| Aldridge, Ryan | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Alford, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Allen, Thresa | Avangrid Renewables |  |
| Anderson, Kevin | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Ashley, Kristy | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Benson, Mariah | PUCT |  |
| Bivens, Carrie | Potomac Economics |  |
| Blackburn, Don |  |  |
| Blakey, Eric | Just Energy |  |
| Boisseau, Heather | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Bonskowski, Ned | Vistra Energy |  |
| Bruce, Mark | Cratylus Advisors |  |
| Coleman, Diana | CPS Energy |  |
| Cripe, Ramsey | Schneider Engineering |  |
| Daigneault, Ralph | Potomac Economics |  |
| Donohoo, Kenneth | EPE Consulting |  |
| Dreyfus, Mark | MD Energy Consulting |  |
| Fogarty, Audrey | Jupiter Power |  |
| Goff, Eric | Tesla |  |
| Hanson, Kevin | National Grid |  |
| Harvey, Julia | Texas Electric Cooperatives |  |
| Hasan, Prusha | Texas Advanced Energy |  |
| Henry, Mark | Texas Reliability Entity |  |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor |  |
| Hudis, Gabriella | Gabel Associates |  |
| Huynh, Thuy | Potomac Economics |  |
| Jewell, Michael | Jewell and Associates |  |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Khayat, Maribel | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Krajecki, Jim | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Kroskey, Tony | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| McCamant, Frank | McCamant Consulting |  |
| Mendoza, Albert | Occidental |  |
| Meneley, Amy | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Mercado, David | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Morris, Sandy | Direct Energy |  |
| Nguyen, Andy | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Parker, Ryan | Calpine |  |
| Powell, Christian | Pedernales Electric Cooperative |  |
| Rainwater, Kim | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Reedy, Steve | Potomac Economics |  |
| Reid, Walter | Advanced Power Alliance |  |
| Richmond, Michele | TCPA |  |
| Rich, Katie | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine |  |
| Schumate, Walt |  |  |
| Schwarz, Brad | Hunt Utility |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | Crescent Power |  |
| Singh Rastogi, Rama | PUCT |  |
| Sithuraj, Murali | Austin Energy |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Smith, Chase | Southern Power |  |
| Smith, Christopher | Austin Energy |  |
| Striedel, James | GDS Associates |  |
| Toomey, Megan | Talen Energy |  |
| Tran, Diane | TIEC |  |
| True, Roy | ACES Power |  |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Villasana, Kristi | New Braunfels Utilities |  |
| Winegar, Paige | New Braunfels Utilities |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Longhorn Power |  |

*ERCOT Staff:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Adadjo, Fred |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Anderson, Connor |  |  |
| Ayson, Janice |  |  |
| Barati, Camron |  |  |
| Bernecker, John |  |  |
| Bigbee, Nathan |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  |  |
| Bracy, Phil |  |  |
| Chen, Jian |  |  |
| Chu, Zhengguo |  |  |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Dansro, Ben |  |  |
| Dinopol, Ohlen |  |  |
| Du, Pengwei |  |  |
| Ganjoo, Shalesh |  |  |
| Garcia, Freddy |  |  |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |  |
| Huang, Fred |  |  |
| Hughes, Lindsey |  |  |
| Jones, Dan |  |  |
| Kane, Erika |  |  |
| Khodabakhsh, Fred |  |  |
| Levine, Jonathan |  |  |
| Maggio, Dave |  |  |
| Maul, Donald |  |  |
| Martinez, Adriana |  |  |
| Morehead, Juliana |  |  |
| Moreno, Alfredo |  |  |
| Neiberger, Valery |  |  |
| Orr, Rob |  |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Rios, Diana |  |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  |  |
| Rosel, Austin |  |  |
| Ruane, Mark |  |  |
| Sharma, Sandip |  |  |
| Shaw, Pamela |  |  |
| Solis, Stephen |  |  |
| Stice, Clayton |  |  |
| Townsend, Aaron |  |  |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  |  |
| Tucker, Don |  |  |
| Urquhart, Thomas |  |  |
| Warnken, Pete |  |  |
| Xiao, Hong |  |  |
| Zhang, Wen |  |  |

***Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments were present for a vote.***

Antitrust Admonition

Suzy Clifton directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Election of 2021 WMS Chair and Vice Chair

Ms. Clifton reviewed the leadership election process codified in the Technical Advisory Committee Procedures and opened the floor for nominations.

**Ian Haley nominated Resmi Surendran for 2021 WMS Chair.** Ms. Surendran accepted the nomination. **Ms. Surendran was named 2021 WMS Chair by acclamation.**

**Blake Gross nominated Ivan Velasquez for 2021 WMS Vice Chair.** Mr. Velasquez accepted the nomination. **Mr. Velasquez was named 2021 WMS Vice Chair by acclamation.**

Agenda Review

There were no changes to the agenda.

TAC/Subcommittee Stakeholder Process Overview (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

Brittney Albracht presented an overview of the TAC and TAC Subcommittee process, including the committee structure, voting, filing of Revision Requests, TAC Procedures, and Stakeholder meeting guidelines.

Approval of WMS Meeting Minutes

*November 4, 2020*

*December 2, 2020*

Market Participants reviewed the November 4 and December 2, 2020 WMS Meeting Minutes. Ms. Surendran noted these items could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update and Assignments

*Review Day-Ahead Market (DAM) Performance (DAM delays)*

Ms. Surendran noted that TAC did not meet in December 2020 and reminded Market Participants of the October 28, 2020 TAC assignment to review the DAM performance and delays issue. Sandip Sharma reviewed the analysis of DAM delays from December 2010 to December 15, 2020, summarized the cause of the delays and the impacts to ERCOT and Stakeholders, noted that with anticipated increase of Demand Response (DR) and Loads in the future the complexities will be greater, and presented ERCOT recommendations and requested Next Steps. Market Participants discussed the issues and requested further review of the issues at the Wholesale Market Working Group (WMWG) to include performance analysis with delays and impact of transmission outages when Point-to-Point (PTP) Obligation transactions exceed 170k. Ms. Surendran requested the Congestion Management Working Group (CMWG) Chair announce the issues and the WMWG meeting where the discussion will occur, and requested Market Participants forward additional questions and concerns to Mr. Sharma at [Sandip.Sharma@ercot.com](mailto:Sandip.Sharma@ercot.com).

ERCOT Operations and Market Items

There were no reports or discussions for this agenda item.

New Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Referrals (see Key Documents)

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 1056, Market Impact Generic Transmission Constraint (GTC) Notification*

Tom Burke summarized NPRR1056. Jonathan Levine reviewed the 12/30/20 ERCOT comments. Market Participants discussed the potential to provide GTC information in a more generic format and requested WMWG review the issues. Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

*NPRR1057, Modification to Real-Time Hub Price Formulas for Fully De-Energized Hubs*

Dave Maggio summarized NPRR1057 and the 12/28/20 ERCOT comments. Pamela Shaw presented an example of current and proposed outcomes for the Real-Time Hub Price. Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

*NPRR1058, Resource Offer Modernization for Real-Time Co-Optimization*

Mr. Haley summarized NPRR1058 and requested WMWG review the issues. Carrie Bivens noted the 12/12/20 IMM comments and offered to discuss at WMWG. Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

Implementation Timeline update to NPRR1020, Allow Some Integrated Energy Storage Designs to Calculate Internal Loads

Don Tucker reviewed the implementation timeline for NPRR1020 in consideration of Settlement Metering Operating Guide Revision Request (SMOGRR) 024, Implement NPRR1020, and summarized the potential risks of the interim manual process.

WMS Revision Requests (see Key Documents)

*Impact Analysis Review*

*SMOGRR024*

Market Participants reviewed the 12/30/20 ERCOT comments and revised Impact Analysis for SMOGRR024. Eric Goff noted Tesla’s support to advance SMOGRR024 with the 12/30/20 ERCOT comments. Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS, Referred to WMS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR981, Day-Ahead Market Price Correction Process*

*NPRR1023, Change to CRR Repossession Process*

WMS took no action on these items.

CMWG (see Key Documents)

*Nodal Operating Guide Revision Request (NOGRR) 215, Limit Use of Remedial Action Schemes*

Katie Rich reviewed CMWG activities and encouraged Market Participants to attend the January 11, 2021 CMWG meeting and discussion on NOGRR215 with the Operations Working Group (OWG).

Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG) (see Key Documents)

Caitlin Smith reviewed SAWG activities, including the 2020 Reserve Margin study. Pete Warnken reviewed the December 2020 Capacity, Demand and Reserves (CDR) Report Summary. Market Participants discussed potential enhancements to the CDR Report to more accurately reflect reliability risk. Other Market Participants suggested that future CDR Reports should point to a probabilistic approach for specific details. Ms. Surendran requested SAWG evaluate different options for reflecting reliability risk in the CDR Report or through other mechanisms.

Other Business

*2021 Goals*

Market Participants discussed potential 2021 WMS Goals. Ms. Surendran encouraged Market Participants to offer revisions for the 2021 Goals for consideration at the February 3, 2021 WMS meeting.

*2021 Working Group Leadership*

Ms. Surendran presented the 2021 WMS Working Group Leadership and encouraged Market Participants to consider Market Settlement Working Group (MSWG) leadership opportunities. Market Participants noted the need to waive notice to consider 2021 Working Group Leadership. Ms. Surendran noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

Combined Ballot

**Mr. Burke moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To approve the November 4, 2020 WMS Meeting Minutes as submitted**
* **To approve the December 2, 2020 WMS Meeting Minutes as submitted**
* **To request PRS continue to table NPRR1056 for further review by WMWG**
* **To endorse NPRR1057 as amended by the 12/28/20 ERCOT comments**
* **To request PRS continue to table NPRR1058 for further review by WMWG**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 12/2/20 WMS Report, as amended by the 12/30/20 ERCOT comments, and Revised Impact Analysis for SMOGRR024**
* **To Waive Notice and endorse 2021 WMS Working Group Leadership as presented**

**Clayton Greer seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously via roll call vote.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

*Workshop*

Clayton Stice encouraged Market Participants to attend the January 13, 2021 Distributed Generation Resource (DGR) Workshop XI.

*Review of Open Action Items*

Market Participants reviewed the Open Action Items list.

*No Report*

* Demand Side Working Group (DSWG)
* Market Credit Working Group (MCWG)
* MSWG
* Metering Working Group (MWG)
* Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG)
* WMWG

Adjournment

Ms. Surendran adjourned the January 6, 2021 WMS meeting at 12:21 p.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at:

   http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2021/1/6/213933-WMS [↑](#footnote-ref-1)