**DRAFT**

**Minutes of the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Meeting**

**Webex Only**

**Wednesday, December 2, 2020– 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Allen, Thresa | Avangrid Renewables |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Bierschbach, Erika | Austin Energy |  |
| Bunch, Kevin | EDF Trading North America |  |
| Carpenter, Jeremy | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Claiborn-Pinto, Shawnee | OPUC |  |
| Evans, Mike | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Franklin, Russell | Garland Power and Light |  |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Generation |  |
| Johnson, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Lange, Clif | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Mauldin, Jamie | City of Eastland |  |
| McNamara, Grace | Chariot Energy |  |
| Morris, Sandy | Direct Energy |  |
| Nguyen, Andy | Lower Colorado River Authority | Alt. Rep. for John Dumas |
| Roberts, Bobby | TNMP |  |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine Corporation |  |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy |  |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor |  |
| Wilson, Joe Dan | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |

The following proxy was assigned:

* Ty Parker to Sandy Morris

*Guests:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG |  |
| Aldridge, Ryan | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Alford, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Ashley, Kristy | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Benson, Mariah | PUCT |  |
| Bivens, Carrie | Potomac Economics |  |
| Boisseau, Heather | LCRA |  |
| Bombick, Sarah | LCRA |  |
| Breshears, Doug | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Bruce, Mark | Cratylus Advisors |  |
| Burke, Tom | Invenergy |  |
| Cochran, Seth | DC Energy |  |
| Coleman, Diana | CPS Energy |  |
| Crouch, Rebekah | New Braunfels Utilities |  |
| Daigneault, Ralph | Potomac Economics |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Donohoo, Kenneth | EPE Consulting |  |
| Downey, Marty |  |  |
| Dreyfus, Mark | MD Energy Consulting |  |
| Dwyer, Davida | PUCT |  |
| Foreman, Mark | Tenaska |  |
| Godinez, Gabriel | American Electric Power |  |
| Goff, Eric | Tesla |  |
| Huynh, Thuy | Potomac Economics |  |
| Jewell, Michael | Jewell and Associates |  |
| Jolly, Emily | LCRA |  |
| Kroskey, Tony | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Lookadoo, Heddie | NRG |  |
| Matt, Kevin | NRG |  |
| McCamant, Frank | McCamant Consulting |  |
| McKeever, Debbie | Oncor |  |
| Mendoza, Albert | Occidental |  |
| Mullins, Emily | Schneider Engineering |  |
| Powell, Christian | Pedernales Electric Cooperative |  |
| Rainwater, Kim | LCRA |  |
| Reader, Raborn | Enterprise Productions |  |
| Reedy, Steve | Potomac Economics |  |
| Reid, Mike | Air Liquide |  |
| Reid, Walter | Advanced Power Alliance |  |
| Richmond, Michele | TCPA |  |
| Rich, Katie | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |
| Schauer, Trent | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Schumate, Walt |  |  |
| Schwarz, Brad | Hunt Utility |  |
| Sharma Frank, Arushi | Tesla |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | Crescent Power |  |
| Simpson, Lori | Exelon |  |
| Sithuraj, Murali | Austin Energy |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Sonti, Shyama | ENGIE |  |
| Striedel, James | GDS Associates |  |
| Tran, Diane | TIEC |  |
| True, Roy | ACES Power |  |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Van Booven, Ashley | New Braunfels Utilities |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Walke, Pranil | Calpine |  |
| Wallin, Shane | DME Power |  |
| White, Lauri | AEP |  |
| Winegar, Paige | New Braunfels Utilities |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Longhorn Power |  |

*ERCOT Staff:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Anderson, Connor |  |  |
| Barati, Camron |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  |  |
| Boswell, Bill |  |  |
| Bracy, Phil |  |  |
| Chen, Jian |  |  |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Comstock, Read |  |  |
| Dansro, Ben |  |  |
| Dinopol, Ohlen |  |  |
| Ganjoo, Shalesh |  |  |
| Garcia, Freddy |  |  |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |  |
| Hanson, Kevin |  |  |
| Harris, Connie |  |  |
| House, Donald |  |  |
| Hull, Gibson |  |  |
| Jin, Julie |  |  |
| Jones, Dan |  |  |
| Kane, Erika |  |  |
| Khodabakhsh, Fred |  |  |
| Maggio, Dave |  |  |
| Maul, Donald |  |  |
| Mantena, Dan |  |  |
| Morehead, Juliana |  |  |
| Moreno, Alfredo |  |  |
| Orr, Rob |  |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Rios, Diana |  |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  |  |
| Rosel, Austin |  |  |
| Ruane, Mark |  |  |
| Sharma, Sandip |  |  |
| Shaw, Pamela |  |  |
| Stice, Clayton |  |  |
| Thuerwaechter, Kashia |  |  |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  |  |
| Tucker, Don |  |  |
| Warnken, Pete |  |  |

***Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments were present for a vote.***

Antitrust Admonition

David Kee directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Agenda Review

There were no changes to the agenda.

Approval of WMS Meeting Minutes

*November 4, 2020*

This item was deferred to the January 6, 2021WMS meeting

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update and Assignments

*Review Day-Ahead Market (DAM) Performance (DAM delays)*

Mr. Kee reviewed the disposition of items considered at the November 18, 2020 TAC meeting. Sandip Sharma reminded Market Participants of the DAM performance and delays discussion and the informal request from TAC for WMS to review the issues, and stated that ERCOT Staff is still developing the array of potential solutions and analyses and anticipate presenting recommendations at the January 6, 2021 WMS meeting.

ERCOT Operations and Market Items (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*June 2020 Congestion Revenue Right (CRR) Balancing Account Resettlement Issue*

Bill Barnes summarized the CRR Balancing Account resettlement issue, reviewed relevant Protocol language, and presented potential solutions. Market Participants and ERCOT Staff discussed the impacts of using previous month’s resettlement to replenish the CRR Balancing account fund deficiency in later months. Market Participants requested additional review of the issues by the Congestion Management Working Group (CMWG).

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS, Referred to WMS (see Key Documents)

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 981, Day-Ahead Market Price Correction Process*

*NPRR1023, Change to CRR Repossession Process*

WMS took no action on these items.

*NPRR1017, Management of Congestion Revenue Rights (CRRs) and Resource Node Removal*

Market Participants noted the withdrawal of NPRR1017.

*NPRR1024, Determination of Significance with Respect to Price Correction*

Dave Maggio summarized NPRR1024 and the 11/9/20 ERCOT comments. Mr. Kee noted this items could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

Meter Working Group (MWG) (see Key Documents)

Gabriel Godinez summarized MWG activities.

*Settlement Meter Operating Guide Revision Request (SMOGRR) 024, Implement NPRR1020 – Urgency Vote(s)*

Eric Goff summarized the request for Urgent status for SMOGRR024 in consideration of the implementation timeline for NPRR1020, Add Definition of Integrated Battery Storage Systems (IBSS) and the June 2021 Tesla project. Arushi Sharma Frank summarized the status of the design proposal draft Tesla submitted, future validation steps, and meter testing. Mr. Godinez stated that SMOGRR024 achieved consensus at the November 19, 2020 MWG meeting. ERCOT Staff offered administrative clarifications to SMOGRR024. Mr. Kee noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

NOGRR215, Limit Use of Remedial Action Schemes

WMS took no action on NOGRR215.

Combined Ballot

**Ian Haley moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To endorse NPRR1024 as amended by the 11/9/20 ERCOT comments**
* **To grant SMOGRR024 Urgent status; and to recommend approval of SMOGRR024 as revised by WMS**

**Clif Lange seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously via roll call vote.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG) (see Key Documents)

Caitlin Smith reviewed SAWG activities, including the 2020 Reserve Margin study. Ms. Smith summarized the 2020 results and 2024 values for the market equilibrium and economically optimal reserve margins, highlighted major changes to the 2020 study, and presented the analyses. Pete Warnken encouraged Market Participants to review the full report, “Estimation of the Market Equilibrium and Economically Optimal Reserve Margins for the ERCOT Region for 2024” from ERCOT’s Resource Adequacy website under the Planning Reserve Margin Analysis section at <http://www.ercot.com/gridinfo/resource> and provide comments to Julie Jin, ERCOT by Monday, December 30, 2020.

Market Credit Working Group (MCWG) (see Key Documents)

Mr. Barnes reviewed MCWG activities, including the review of the 2020 goals. Mr. Barnes encouraged Market Participants to consider 2021 MCWG leadership opportunities.

Other Business

*Review of Open Action Items*

Market Participants reviewed the Open Action Items list.

*No Report*

* CMWG
* Demand Side Working Group (DSWG)
* Market Settlement Working Group (MSWG)
* Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG)
* Wholesale Market Working Group (WMWG)

Adjournment

Mr. Kee adjourned the December 2, 2020 WMS meeting at 11:50 a.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at: http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2020/12/2/189363-WMS [↑](#footnote-ref-1)