**DRAFT**

**Minutes of the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Meeting**

**Webex Only**

**Wednesday, October 7, 2020– 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Allen, Thresa | Avangrid Renewables |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Bierschbach, Erika | Austin Energy |  |
| Bunch, Kevin | EDF Trading North America |  |
| Caraway, Shannon | Solar Prime |  |
| Carpenter, Jeremy | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Claiborn-Pinto, Shawnee | OPUC |  |
| Dumas, John | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Evans, Mike | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Franklin, Russell | Garland Power and Light |  |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Generation |  |
| Johnson, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Lange, Clif | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Lindberg, Ken | Bryan Texas Utilities |  |
| Mauldin, Jamie | City of Eastland |  |
| Morris, Sandy | Direct Energy |  |
| Nguyen, Andy | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Parker, Ty | Infinite Energy |  |
| Roberts, Bobby | TNMP |  |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine Corporation |  |
| Smith, Mark | Nucor |  |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy |  |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor |  |
| Wilson, Joe Dan | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |

The following proxy was assigned:

* Fanar Sefa to Mark Smith

*Guests:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG |  |
| Aldridge, Ryan | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Anderson, Kevin | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Ashley, Kristy | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Basaran, Harika | PUCT |  |
| Bivens, Carrie | Potomac Economics |  |
| Blakey, Eric | Just Energy |  |
| Boisseau, Heather | LCRA |  |
| Bruce, Mark | Cratylus Advisors |  |
| Chatlani, Varsha | Boston Energy Trading and Marketing |  |
| Clark, Jack | NextEra Energy |  |
| Cochran, Seth | DC Energy |  |
| Coleman, Diana | CPS Energy |  |
| Coleman, Katie | TIEC |  |
| Coultas, Ann | Enel |  |
| Cripe, Ramsey | Schneider Engineering |  |
| Crouch, Rebekah | New Braunfels Utilities |  |
| Daigneault, Ralph | Potomac Economics |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Donohoo, Kenneth | EPE Consulting |  |
| Downey, Marty |  |  |
| Dreyfus, Mark | MD Energy Consulting |  |
| Godinez, Gabriel | American Electric Power |  |
| Goff, Eric |  |  |
| Harvey, Julia | Texas Electric Cooperatives |  |
| Hasan, Prusha | Advanced Energy Economy |  |
| Helton, Bob | ENGIE |  |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor |  |
| Hourihan, Mike | CPower Energy Management |  |
| Huynh, Thuy | Potomac Economics |  |
| Jewell, Michael | Jewell and Associates |  |
| Jolly, Emily | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Khayat, Maribel | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Krajecki, Jim | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Lui, Meng | Tenaska |  |
| Loving, Alicia | Austin Energy |  |
| Matt, Kevin | NRG |  |
| McCamant, Frank | McCamant Consulting |  |
| McClellan, Suzi | Good Company & Associates |  |
| Macfarland, Jeremy | Grid Beyond |  |
| Meneley, Amy | LCRA |  |
| Musher, Danny | Key Capture Energy |  |
| Nguyen, Andy | LCRA |  |
| Powell, Christian | Pedernales Electric Cooperative |  |
| Rainwater, Kim | LCRA |  |
| Reedy, Steve | Potomac Economics |  |
| Reid, Walter | Advanced Power Alliance |  |
| Ritch, John | NextEra Energy |  |
| Rich, Katie | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |
| Richmond, Michele | TCPA |  |
| Schwarz, Brad | Sharyland |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | Crescent Power |  |
| Simpson, Lori | Exelon |  |
| Sithuraj, Murali | Austin Energy |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Smith, Chris | Austin Energy |  |
| Striedel, James | GDS and Associates |  |
| Stupar, Rob | Invenergy |  |
| Tran, Diane | TIEC |  |
| Toomey, Megan | Talen Energy |  |
| True, Roy | ACES Power |  |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Whitworth, Doug | Texas Reliability Entity |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Longhorn Power |  |

*ERCOT Staff:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Al-Homsi, Alex |  |  |
| Anderson, Connor |  |  |
| Bernecker, John |  |  |
| Bezzam, Joseph |  |  |
| Billo, Jeff |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  |  |
| Boswell, Bill |  |  |
| Bracy, Phil |  |  |
| Chen, Jian |  |  |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Comstock, Read |  |  |
| Dinopol, Ohlen |  |  |
| Du, Pengwei |  |  |
| Fohn, Douglas |  |  |
| Ganjoo, Shalesh |  |  |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |  |
| Hanson, Kevin |  |  |
| House, Donald |  |  |
| Hull, Gibson |  |  |
| Jones, Dan |  |  |
| Kane, Erika |  |  |
| Khodabakhsh, Fred |  |  |
| Lasher, Warren |  |  |
| Maggio, Dave |  |  |
| Mago, Nitika |  |  |
| Morehead, Juliana |  |  |
| Moreno, Alfredo |  |  |
| Patterson, Mark |  |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  |  |
| Rosel, Austin |  |  |
| Ruane, Mark |  |  |
| Sanchez, Daniel |  |  |
| Sharma, Sandip |  |  |
| Shaw, Pamela |  |  |
| Stice, Clayton |  |  |
| Thompson, Chad |  |  |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  |  |
| Tucker, Don |  |  |
| Wattles, Paul |  |  |
| Xiao, Hong |  |  |

***Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments were present for a vote.***

Antitrust Admonition

David Kee directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Agenda Review

There were no changes to the agenda.

Approval of WMS Meeting Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*September 2, 2020*

Market Participants reviewed the September 2, 2020 WMS Meeting Minutes. Mr. Kee noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update and Assignments

Mr. Kee reviewed the disposition of items considered at the September 23, 2020 TAC meeting.

ERCOT Operations and Market Items

There were no reports or discussions for this agenda item.

Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 994, Clarify Generator Interconnection Neutral Project Classification

Market Participants discussed the need to provide clarity and consistent practice for planning, incentives for new generation, and a cost benefit analysis of additional build-out of new transmission. Some Market Participants requested additional time to review the issues and that NPRR994 remain tabled. Other Market Participants noted the extensive review of the issues in various stakeholder forums at the September 2, 2020 WMS meeting and requested WMS consider NPRR994. Mr. Kee encouraged Market Participants to provide additional clarifications to be considered at the November 4, 2020 WMS meeting.

New Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Referrals (see Key Documents)

*NPRR1040, Compliance Metrics for Ancillary Service Supply Responsibility*

John Dumas summarized NPRR1040. Market Participants requested the Wholesale Market Working Group (WMWG) review the issues. Mr. Kee noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

*NPRR1042, Planned Capacity Adjustment in the Report on Capacity, Demand and Reserves in the ERCOT Region (Waive Notice)*

Market Participants discussed waiving notice to consider NPRR1042. Bill Barnes reviewed NPRR1042. Caitlin Smith summarized discussions at the Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG) meeting regarding the concepts in NPRR1042. Market Participants discussed NPRR1042 and the SAWG scope. Mr. Kee noted these items could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

WMS Revision Requests (see Key Documents)

*Impact Analyses*

*Settlement Metering Operating Guide Revision Request (SMOGRR) 023, Updates to Nameplate Information Requirements*

*Commercial Operations Market Guide Revision Request (COPMGRR) 048, Related to NPRR1039, Replace the Term MIS Public Area with ERCOT Website*

*Verifiable Cost Manual Revision Request (VCMRR) 030, Related to NPRR1039, Replace the Term MIS Public Area with ERCOT Website*

Market Participants reviewed the Impact Analyses for SMOGRR023, COPMGRR048, and VCMRR030. Mr. Kee noted these items could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

WMWG (see Key Documents)

David Detelich reviewed recent WMWG activities, including the preliminary 2021 Ancillary Service methodology.

*Alternative Solutions to NPRR991*

Mr. Detelich summarized WMWG discussions of alternate solutions to NPRR991, Day-Ahead Market (DAM) Point-to-Point (PTP) Obligation Bid Clearing Price Clarification. Market Participants debated the potential solutions. Some Market Participants requested additional time to review the issues. Other Market Participants supported advancing the concepts in Option 1, developing an NPRR, and proceeding in the stakeholder process.

**Clayton Greer moved to endorse Option 1 (remove the DAM price floor), acknowledging that the price floor in Real-Time is needed for operational reasons that are not observed in the DAM; and request ERCOT develop an NPRR. Ian Haley seconded the motion. The motion carried via roll call vote with two objections from the Consumer (2) (Nucor, Olin) Market Segment and 14 abstentions from the Consumer (2) (OPUC, City of Eastland), Cooperative (2) (LCRA, Brazos), Independent Retail Electric Provider (IREP) (3) (Reliant, Direct, Infinite), Investor Owned Utility (IOU) (3) (AEP, CenterPoint, TNMP), and Municipal (4) (Austin Energy, BTU, Garland, CPS) Market Segments.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS, Referred to WMS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR981, Day-Ahead Market Price Correction Process*

*NPRR1017, Management of Congestion Revenue Rights (CRRs) and Resource Node Removal*

*NPRR1023, Change to CRR Repossession Process*

WMS took no action on these items.

*NPRR995, RTF-6 Create Definition and Terms for Settlement Only Energy Storage*

Paul Wattles summarized WMS discussions on Settlement issues for Settlement Only Distribution Energy Storage (SODES) and Settlement Only Transmission Energy Storage (SOTES), and for the newly defined Non-Wholesale Storage Load (WSL) Settlement Only Charging Load, and stated that ERCOT is still developing clarifications for consideration at the November 4, 2020 WMS meeting. WMS took no action on this item.

*NPRR1024, Determination of Significance with Respect to Price Correction*

Dave Maggio summarized NPRR1024 and the September 2, 2020 WMS discussion. Austin Rosel presented the additional ERCOT analysis of the price correction impact on Settlements using thresholds of $1,000, $2,000, $3,000, $4,000, $5,000, $10,000 and $20,000 as requested by Stakeholders. Market Participants discussed the appropriate threshold, impacts to counter-parties, and administrative costs in resettlement. Market Participants further debated the issues and offered clarifications to determine the appropriate threshold. ERCOT Staff offered to conduct additional analysis for consideration at the November 4, 2020 WMS meeting. WMS took no action on this item.

Congestion Management Working Group (see Key Documents)

*NOGRR215, Limit Use of Remedial Action Schemes*

Katie Rich summarized CMWG activities, including revision requests assigned to CMWG and encouraged Market Participants to attend the November 2, 2020 joint CMWG and Operations Working Group (OWG) meeting to discuss NOGRR215.

SAWG (see Key Documents)

Ms. Smith reviewed SAWG activities, including the Astrape update on the 2020 Reserve Margin Study.

*Planned Project In-Service Cut-off Dates for Capacity, Demand, and Reserves (CDR) /* *Seasonal Assessment of Resource Adequacy for the ERCOT Region (SARA) Reports*

Ms. Smith summarized the ERCOT Seasonal Peak Analysis and options to modify the cut-off dates for peak seasons as presented at the September 24, 2020 SAWG meeting, stated that SAWG was in consensus to recommend Option 2, and reviewed the timeline for implementation prior to Summer 2021.

**Mr. Greer move to endorse the Planned Project in-service cut-off dates for CDR/SARA Analyses with Option 2 per the SAWG report, and to direct ERCOT to develop an NPRR to move the Summer cut-off date to July 1 for planned new CDR capacity. Kevin Bunch seconded the motion. The motion carried via roll call vote with one abstention from the Independent Generator (Luminant) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Combined Ballot

**Mr. Haley moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To approve the September 2, 2020 WMS meeting minutes as submitted**
* **To request PRS continue to table NPRR1040 for further review by WMWG**
* **To waive notice to consider NPRR1042, and to endorse NPRR1042 as submitted**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 9/2/20 WMS Report and Impact Analysis for SMOGRR023**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 9/2/20 WMS Report and Impact Analysis for COPMGRR048**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 9/2/20 WMS Report and Impact Analysis for VCMRR030**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **August 5, 2020 WMS meeting minutes - approve as submitted**  **811SCR - endorse as submitted, endorse Urgent status**  **023SMOGRR - recommend approval as submitted**  **048COPMGRR - recommend approval as submitted**  **030VCMRR - recommend approval as submitted**  **1028NPRR - endorse as amended by the 8/14/20 ERCOT comments** |  |

**Ivan Velasquez seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously via roll call vote.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Demand Side Working Group (DSWG) (see Key Documents)

Mike Hourihan reviewed DSWG activities.

Meter Working Group (MWG) (see Key Documents)

Gabriel Godinez summarized MWG activities.

Market Credit Working Group (MCWG) (see Key Documents)

Mr. Kee noted the MCWG report was posted.

Other Business (see Key Documents)

Suzy Clifton reminded Market Participants that the membership date of record is Friday, November 6, 2020, highlighted changes in membership and fee submittal due to COVID19 restrictions, and stated that 2021 Segment Representative Elections would begin on Monday, November 9, 2020.

*Review of Open Action Items*

Resmi Surendran presented clarifications to the Open Action Items list and encouraged Market Participants to review and offer additional clarifications for consideration at the November 4, 2020 WMS meeting. Market Participants noted the WMWG update to the Open Action Items list and removed the item:

* Review the Independent Market Monitor (IMM) recommendation to remove the Reliability Unit Commitment (RUC) opt-out (WMWG)

*No Report*

* Market Settlement Working Group (MSWG)
* Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG)

Adjournment

Mr. Kee adjourned the October 7, 2020 WMS meeting at 12:39 p.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at: http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2020/10/7/189351-WMS [↑](#footnote-ref-1)