**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Meeting**

**Webex Only**

**Wednesday, September 2, 2020– 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Allen, Thresa | Avangrid Renewables |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Bierschbach, Erika | Austin Energy |  |
| Bunch, Kevin | EDF Trading North America  |  |
| Caraway, Shannon | Solar Prime |  |
| Carpenter, Jeremy | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Claiborn-Pinto, Shawnee | OPUC |  |
| Evans, Mike | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Franklin, Russell | Garland Power and Light |  |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Generation |  |
| Johnson, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Lange, Clif | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Lindberg, Ken | Bryan Texas Utilities |  |
| Mauldin, Jamie | City of Eastland |  |
| McNamara, Grace | Chariot Energy |  |
| Morris, Sandy | Direct Energy |  |
| Nguyen, Andy | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Parker, Ty | Infinite Energy |  |
| Roberts, Bobby | TNMP |  |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine Corporation |  |
| Sefa, Fanar | Olin Corporation |  |
| Smith, Mark | Nucor |  |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative | Alt. Rep. for Clif Lange |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy  |  |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor |  |
| Wilson, Joe Dan | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |

*Guests:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG |  |
| Aldridge, Ryan | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Alford, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Anderson, Kevin | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Ashley, Kristy | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Benson, Mariah | PUCT |  |
| Bivens, Carrie | Potomac Economics |  |
| Black-Huynh, Emily | EDF Energy  |  |
| Blakey, Eric | Just Energy |  |
| Bruce, Mark | Cratylus Advisors |  |
| Bruns, Scott | Direct Energy |  |
| Cochran, Seth | DC Energy |  |
| Coleman, Diana | CPS Energy |  |
| Coultas, Ann | Enel  |  |
| Cripe, Ramsey | Schneider Engineering |  |
| Crouch, Cliff | PUCT |  |
| Crouch, Rebekah | New Braunfels Utilities  |  |
| Daigneault, Ralph | Potomac Economics |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Donohoo, Kenneth | EPE Consulting |  |
| Downey, Marty |  |  |
| Dreyfus, Mark | MD Energy Consulting |  |
| Godinez, Gabriel | American Electric Power |  |
| Goff, Eric |  |  |
| Harvey, Julia | Texas Electric Cooperatives |  |
| Helton, Bob | ENGIE |  |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor |  |
| Huynh, Thuy | Potomac Economics |  |
| Jewell, Michael | Jewell and Associates |  |
| Jolly, Emily | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Krajecki, Jim | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Loving, Alicia | Austin Energy |  |
| McCamant, Frank | McCamant Consulting |  |
| McClellan, Suzi | Good Company & Associates  |  |
| Mendoza, Albert | Occidental  |  |
| Musher, Danny | Key Capture Energy |  |
| Picone, Benjamin | RES  |  |
| Powell, Christian | Pedernales Electric Cooperative |  |
| Reedy, Steve | Potomac Economics |  |
| Reid, Walter | Advanced Power Alliance |  |
| Rich, Katie | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |
| Richmond, Michele | TCPA |  |
| Roth, Werner | PUCT |  |
| Schwarz, Brad | Sharyland |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | Crescent Power  |  |
| Simpson, Lori | Exelon |  |
| Sithuraj, Murali | Austin Energy |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Smith, Chris  | Austin Energy |  |
| Tran, Diane | TIEC |  |
| Toomey, Megan | Talen Energy |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Longhorn Power |  |
| Zhang, Lu | Austin Energy |  |

*ERCOT Staff:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Adadjo, Fred |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Anderson, Connor |  |  |
| Anderson, Troy |  |  |
| Bernecker, John |  |  |
| Bigbee, Nathan |  |  |
| Billo, Jeff |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  |  |
| Boswell, Bill  |  |  |
| Bracy, Phil |  |  |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Comstock, Read |  |  |
| Dansro, Ben |  |  |
| Dinopol, Ohlen |  |  |
| Flint Alison |  |  |
| Fohn, Douglas |  |  |
| Ganjoo, Shalesh |  |  |
| Garcia, Freddy |  |  |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |  |
| Hailu, Ted |  |  |
| Holt, Blake |  |  |
| House, Donald |  |  |
| Huang, Fred |  |  |
| Hughes, Lindsey |  |  |
| Hull, Gibson |  |  |
| Jones, Dan |  |  |
| Kane, Erika |  |  |
| Kapiloff, Leonard |  |  |
| Lasher, Warren |  |  |
| Lofton, Amy |  |  |
| Maggio, Dave |  |  |
| Mago, Nitika |  |  |
| Morehead, Juliana |  |  |
| Patterson, Mark |  |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Ragsdale, Kenneth |  |  |
| Rios, Diana |  |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  |  |
| Rosel, Austin |  |  |
| Ruane, Mark |  |  |
| Sharma, Sandip |  |  |
| Shaw, Pamela |  |  |
| Spells, Vanessa |  |  |
| Stice, Clayton |  |  |
| Thompson, Chad |  |  |
| Townsend, Aaron |  |  |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  |  |
| Tucker, Don |  |  |
| Wattles, Paul |  |  |
| Zapanta, Rizaldy |  |  |
| Zhang, Wen |  |  |

***Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments were present for a vote.***

Antitrust Admonition

David Kee directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Agenda Review

There were no changes to the agenda.

Approval of WMS Meeting Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*August 5, 2020*

Market Participants reviewed the August 5, 2020 WMS Meeting Minutes. Mr. Kee noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update and Assignments

Mr. Kee reviewed the disposition of items considered at the August 26, 2020 TAC meeting and summarized the discussion regarding the 2% rule, and noted that TAC leadership and ERCOT Staff are working on a procedural path forward.

ERCOT Operations and Market Items (see Key Documents)

*Transformer Rating Error and Potential Price Correction Notice (Notice: M-A070820-01 Operations)*

Dave Maggio summarized the timeline and root cause of the incorrect dynamic ratings for three transmission transformers, reviewed the impacts to the Day-Ahead Market (DAM) and Real-Time Market (RTM) for the specific Operating Days between June 8, 2020 and July 6, 2020, and presented the price correction analyses. Mr. Maggio stated that ERCOT will present the analyses at the September 23, 2020 TAC meeting, and seek review of DAM and RTM prices for the specific Operating Days at the October 13, 2020 ERCOT Board of Directors meeting.

*Incorrect Remedial Action Scheme (RAS) Modeling Impacting Day-Ahead Market and Potential Price Corrections Notice (Notice: M-A082720-01 Operations)*

Mr. Maggio summarized Market Notice M-A082720-01 Operations and noted that the software error that led to the disabling of the Stryker Creek RAS impacted DAM prices only. Mr. Maggio stated that ERCOT corrected DAM prices for Operating Day August 24, 2020 before prices became final, and would seek review of DAM prices for the Operating Days August 20, August 21, and August 23, 2020 at the October 13, 2020 ERCOT Board of Directors meeting.

*Transmission Issues Related to Generation Constraints Workshop*

Jeff Billo summarized discussion at the August 21, 2020 Transmission Issues Related to Generation Constraints Workshop, including Nodal Operating Guide Revision Request (NOGRR) 215, and presented ERCOT’s recommended next steps.

Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 994, Clarify Generator Interconnection Neutral Project Classification

Market Participants discussed NPRR994, the 4/15/20 ERCOT comments, 7/6/20 TCPA TIEC Joint comments, and the 9/2/20 APA comments.

**Bryan Sams moved to endorse NPRR994 as amended by the 4/15/20 ERCOT comments. Bill Barnes seconded the motion.** Some Market Participants requested additional time to review the issues. Other Market Participants noted the extensive review of the issues in various stakeholder forums and stated that the 4/15/20 ERCOT comments provide clarity and consistent practice for planning.

**Anthony Johnson moved to table NPRR994. Clayton Greer seconded the motion. The motion carried via roll call vote with ten objections from the Consumer (4) (OPUC, City of Eastland, Nucor, Olin), Cooperative (STEC), Independent Generator (2) (Calpine, Luminant), Independent Retail Electric Provider (IREP) (3) (Reliant, Direct, Infinite) Market Segments and one abstention from the Independent Power Marketer (IPM) (Shell) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Nodal Operating Guide Revision Request (NOGRR) 215, Limit Use of Remedial Action Schemes

Mr. Kee requested the Congestion Management Working Group (CMWG) review NOGRR215 issues in a joint meeting with the Operations Working Group (OWG) as recommended by ERCOT following the August 21, 2020 Transmission Issues Related to Generation Constraints Workshop.

Wholesale Market Working Group (WMWG) (see Key Documents)

David Detelich reviewed recent WMWG activities. Mr. Detelich summarized WMWG discussions on alternate solutions to NPRR991, Day-Ahead Market (DAM) Point-to-Point (PTP) Obligation Bid Clearing Price Clarification, and requested WMS direction on seeking additional ERCOT analysis to include Operating Days impacted without the DAM price floor. Mr. Kee directed WMWG to request and review the additional analysis and provide its recommendation at the October 7, 2020 WMS meeting.

New Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Referrals (see Key Documents)

*System Change Request (SCR) 811, Addition of Intra-Hour PhotoVoltaic Power Forecast to GTBD Calculation*

Mr. Detelich summarized SCR811 and previous discussions at WMWG. Nitika Mago noted ERCOT requested urgent status. Mr. Kee noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

WMS Revision Requests

*Settlement Metering Operating Guide Revision Request (SMOGRR) 023, Updates to Nameplate Information Requirements*

Don Tucker summarized SMOGRR023. Mr. Kee noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

*Commercial Operations Market Guide Revision Request (COPMGRR) 048, Related to NPRR1039, Replace the Term MIS Public Area with ERCOT Website*

*Verifiable Cost Manual Revision Request (VCMRR) 030, Related to NPRR1039, Replace the Term MIS Public Area with ERCOT Website*

Amy Lofton summarized COPMGRR048 and VCMRR030. Market Participants debated whether the term “ERCOT website” was vague, and whether interested parties would have difficulty locating publicly available information. Mr. Kee noted these items could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot).

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS, Referred to WMS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR981, Day-Ahead Market Price Correction Process*

*NPRR1017, Management of Congestion Revenue Rights (CRRs) and Resource Node Removal*

*NPRR1023, Change to CRR Repossession Process*

WMS took no action on these items.

*NPRR995, RTF-6 Create Definition and Terms for Settlement Only Energy Storage*

Paul Wattles summarized WMS discussions on Settlement issues for Settlement Only Distribution Energy Storage (SODES) and Settlement Only Transmission Energy Storage (SOTES), and for the newly defined Non-Wholesale Storage Load (WSL) Settlement Only Charging Load and stated that ERCOT will provide additional clarifications. WMS took no action on this item.

*NPRR1024, Determination of Significance with Respect to Price Correction*

Mr. Detelich summarized NPRR1024, the WMWG recommendation, and a potential motion for WMS consideration. Market Participants debated the appropriate value for “significant” threshold. ERCOT Staff presented analysis of the price correction impact on Settlements and the capitalization of the ERCOT market at the Counter-Party level. Market Participants requested additional analysis using thresholds of $1,000, $2,000, $3,000, $4,000, $5,000, $10,000 and $20,000. Mr. Kee noted this item would be considered at the October 7, 2020 WMS meeting.

*NPRR1028, RUC Process Alignment with Resource Limits*

Mr. Detelich summarized the August 17, 2020 WMWG discussions on NPRR1028, noted that the 8/14/20 ERCOT comments were not reviewed by all Market Participants prior to the meeting, and therefore, no recommendation was made. Some Market Participants requested additional time to review the issues. Market Participants discussed the implementation timeline for NPRR1028. Mr. Kee noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot). Ian Haley did not object, but stated his intent to abstain on the Combined Ballot was in consideration of NPRR1028.

Combined Ballot

**Shawnee Claiborn-Pinto moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To approve the August 5, 2020 WMS meeting minutes as submitted**
* **To endorse SCR811 as submitted, and to endorse Urgent status for SCR811**
* **To recommend approval of SMOGRR023 as submitted**
* **To recommend approval of COPMGRR048 as submitted**
* **To recommend approval of VCMRR030 as submitted**
* **To endorse NPRR1028 as amended by the 8/14/20 ERCOT comments**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **August 5, 2020 WMS meeting minutes - approve as submitted** **811SCR - endorse as submitted, endorse Urgent status** **023SMOGRR - recommend approval as submitted** **048COPMGRR - recommend approval as submitted** **030VCMRR - recommend approval as submitted** **1028NPRR - endorse as amended by the 8/14/20 ERCOT comments**  |  |

**Kevin Bunch seconded the motion. The motion carried with one abstention from the Independent Generator (Luminant) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Meter Working Group (MWG) (see Key Documents)

Gabriel Godinez summarized MWG activities.

Market Credit Working Group (MCWG) (see Key Documents)

Mr. Barnes reviewed MCWG activities.

Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG) (see Key Documents)

Caitlin Smith reviewed SAWG activities.

Other Business (see Key Documents)

*Clarify Demand Response qualification*

Shams Siddiqi reviewed current Demand Response qualifications and requested WMS provide clarification that Load shifting facilitated by behind the meter battery storage systems qualifies as Demand Response. Mr. Kee requested the Demand Side Working Group (DSWG) review the issues.

*Review of Open Action Items*

Market Participants reviewed the Open Action Items list and removed the item:

* Review the Independent Market Monitor (IMM) recommendation to eliminate the 2% Rule (WMS/CMWG)

*September 14, 2020 Annual TAC Subcommittee Structural Review*

Mr. Kee announced the September 14, 2020 annual TAC and TAC Subcommittee Structural and Procedural Review and encouraged Market Participants to consider working group meeting efficiencies.

*No Report*

* CMWG
* DSWG
* Market Settlement Working Group (MSWG)
* Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG)

Adjournment

Mr. Kee adjourned the September 2, 2020 WMS meeting at 1:10 p.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at: <http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2020/9/2/189346-WMS> [↑](#footnote-ref-1)