**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Meeting**

**Webex Only**

**Wednesday, August 5, 2020– 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Allen, Thresa | Avangrid Renewables |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Bunch, Kevin | EDF Trading North America |  |
| Caraway, Shannon | Solar Prime |  |
| Carpenter, Jeremy | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Claiborn-Pinto, Shawnee | OPUC |  |
| Evans, Mike | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Franklin, Russell | Garland Power and Light |  |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Generation |  |
| Johnson, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Lange, Clif | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Lindberg, Ken | Bryan Texas Utilities |  |
| Mauldin, Jamie | City of Eastland |  |
| McNamara, Grace | Chariot Energy |  |
| Morris, Sandy | Direct Energy |  |
| Nguyen, Andy | Lower Colorado River Authority | Alt. Rep. for John Dumas |
| Roberts, Bobby | TNMP |  |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine Corporation |  |
| Sefa, Fanar | Olin Corporation |  |
| Sithuraj, Murali | Austin Energy | Alt. Rep. for Erika Bierschbach |
| Smith, Mark | Nucor |  |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy |  |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor |  |
| Wilson, Joe Dan | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |

The following proxy was assigned:

* Ty Parker to Sandy Morris

*Guests:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG |  |
| Aldridge, Ryan | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Anderson, Kevin | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Ashley, Kristy | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Basaran, Harika | PUCT |  |
| Benson, Mariah | PUCT |  |
| Bivens, Carrie | Potomac Economics |  |
| Blakey, Eric | Just Energy |  |
| Breshears, Doug | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Bruce, Mark | Cratylus Advisors |  |
| Chhajed, Pushkar | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Cochran, Seth | DC Energy |  |
| Coultas, Ann | Enel |  |
| Daigneault, Ralph | Potomac Economics |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Downey, Marty |  |  |
| Dreyfus, Mark | MD Energy Consulting |  |
| Dwyer, Davida | PUCT |  |
| Godinez, Gabriel | American Electric Power |  |
| Goff, Eric |  |  |
| Harvey, Julia | Texas Electric Cooperatives |  |
| Helton, Bob | ENGIE |  |
| Huynh, Thuy | Potomac Economics |  |
| Jewell, Michael | Jewell and Associates |  |
| Jolly, Emily | Lower Colorado River Authority |  |
| Jones, Randy | Mountaineer Market Advisors |  |
| Kroskey, Tony | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Kueker, Dan | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Loving, Alicia | Austin Energy |  |
| Marsh, Tony | Legends Unity |  |
| Mendoza, Albert | Oxy |  |
| Musher, Danny | Key Capture Energy |  |
| Park, Soo-Seon | Shell Energy |  |
| Powell, Christian | Pedernales Electric Cooperative |  |
| Reader, Raborn | Enterprise Products Partners |  |
| Reedy, Steve | Potomac Economics |  |
| Reid, Mike | Air Liquide |  |
| Reid, Walter | Advanced Power Alliance |  |
| Rich, Katie | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |
| Richmond, Michele | TCPA |  |
| Ritch, John | NextEra Energy |  |
| Robinson, Rhonda | Calpine Corporation |  |
| Schwarz, Brad | Sharyland |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Smith, Chris | Austin Energy |  |
| Tran, Diane | TIEC |  |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Longhorn Power |  |
| Zhao, Bo | GEUS |  |

*ERCOT Staff:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Anderson, Connor |  |  |
| Bernecker, John |  |  |
| Bigbee, Nathan |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  |  |
| Boswell, Bill |  |  |
| Bracy, Phil |  |  |
| Chen, Jian |  |  |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Comstock, Read |  |  |
| Covington, Austin |  |  |
| Du, Pengwei |  |  |
| Fohn, Douglas |  |  |
| Ganjoo, Shalesh |  |  |
| Garcia, Freddy |  |  |
| Gnanam, Prabhu |  |  |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |  |
| Hailu, Ted |  |  |
| Haley, Aubrey |  |  |
| Hartmann, Jimmy |  |  |
| Holt, Blake |  |  |
| Hull, Gibson |  |  |
| Jones, Dan |  |  |
| Kane, Erika |  |  |
| Kapiloff, Leonard |  |  |
| Krishnaswamy, Sankarara |  |  |
| Lasher, Warren |  |  |
| Maggio, Dave |  |  |
| Mago, Nitika |  |  |
| Morehead, Juliana |  |  |
| Moreno, Alfredo |  |  |
| Opheim, Calvin |  |  |
| Orr, Rob |  |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Rios, Diana |  |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  |  |
| Rosel, Austin |  |  |
| Ruane, Mark |  |  |
| Shanks, Magie |  |  |
| Sharma, Sandip |  |  |
| Shaw, Pamela |  |  |
| Stice, Clayton |  |  |
| Thompson, Chad |  |  |
| Townsend, Aaron |  |  |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  |  |
| Tucker, Don |  |  |
| Warnken, Pete |  |  |
| Wattles, Paul |  |  |
| Xiao, Hong |  |  |

***Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments were present for a vote.***

Antitrust Admonition

David Kee directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Agenda Review

Mr. Kee reviewed the agenda and proposed using a combined ballot where possible to maximize

efficiencies for items to be considered by WMS. There were no questions or comments from Market Participants.

Approval of WMS Meeting Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*July 8, 2020*

Market Participants reviewed the July 8, 2020 WMS Meeting Minutes. Mr. Kee noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot). There were no questions or comments from Market Participants.

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update and Assignments

Mr. Kee reviewed the disposition of items considered at the July 29, 2020 TAC meeting. Some Market Participants expressed support for the Market Settlements Working Group (MSWG) to review and offer potential clarifications to Settlement language in regard to removing the Oklaunion exemption. Mr. Kee encouraged Market Participants to consider MSWG leadership opportunities.

ERCOT Operations and Market Items (see Key Documents)

*2020 Q2 Unregistered Distributed Generation (DG) Report*

Connor Anderson presented the 2nd Quarter 2020 Unregistered DG Report and responded to questions and comments from Market Participants.

*2020 Q2 Settlement Stability Report*

Austin Covington presented the 2nd Quarter 2020 Settlement Stability Report. Mr. Covington and Randy Roberts responded to questions and comments from Market Participants.

New Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Referrals (see Key Documents)

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 1028, RUC Process Alignment with Resource Limits*

Bill Barnes reviewed NPRR1028. Dave Maggio summarized the 7/20/20 ERCOT comments. Market Participants requested review of the issues by the Wholesale Market Working Group (WMWG). Mr. Kee noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot). There were no questions or comments from Market Participants.

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS, Referred to WMS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR947, Clarification to Ancillary Service Supply Responsibility Definition and Improvements to Determining and Charging for Ancillary Service Failed Quantities*

*NPRR981, Day-Ahead Market Price Correction Process*

*NPRR994, Clarify Generator Interconnection Neutral Project Classification*

*NPRR995, RTF-6 Create Definition and Terms for Settlement Only Energy Storage*

*NPRR1017, Management of Congestion Revenue Rights (CRRs) and Resource Node Removal*

*NPRR1023, Change to CRR Repossession Process*

*NPRR1024, Determination of Significance with Respect to Price Correction*

WMS took no action on these items.

Congestion Management Working Group (see Key Documents)

Katie Rich reviewed CMWG activities.

*Planning Guide Revision Request (PGRR) 077, DC Tie Planning Assumptions*

Ms. Rich summarized PGRR077, the 7/8/20 ERCOT comments and 7/29/20 REMC comments, and discussion at the July 13, 2020 CMWG meeting.

**Bryan Sams moved to endorse approval of PGRR077 as submitted. Mr. Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried via roll call vote with one objection from the Independent Power Marketer (IPM) (Morgan Stanley) Market Segment, and four abstentions from the Cooperative (STEC), Independent Generator (Luminant Generation) and IPM (2) (EDF Trading, Tenaska) Market Segments.**

*Two Percent Rule Discussion*

Ms. Rich summarized previous two percent rule discussions at CMWG meetings in consideration of ERCOT analyses, stated that CMWG was unable to come to consensus in recommending the two percent rule be removed, and requested WMS direction on the issues. Carrie Bivens reviewed the Independent Market Monitor (IMM) 2019 State of the Market recommendation to eliminate the two percent rule and price all congestion in Real-Time, and responded to Market Participants questions and concerns. Some Market Participants expressed support for removing the two percent rule and opined that it would lead to Resources locating more appropriately. Market Participants opposed to removing the two percent rule opined that it would raise congestions costs with little benefit to the market and would lead to less predictability in prices. Market Participants requested the issues be presented to TAC for further consideration.

Combined Ballot

**Shawnee Claiborn-Pinto moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To approve the July 8, 2020 WMS meeting minutes as submitted**
* **To request PRS continue to table NPRR1028 for further review by WMWG**

**Clayton Greer seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously via roll call.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Meter Working Group (MWG) (see Key Documents)

*NPRR1020, Add Definition of Integrated Battery Storage Systems (IBSS)*

Gabriel Godinez summarized MWG activities, including review of the technical issues in NPRR1020.

Market Credit Working Group (MCWG) (see Key Documents)

Mr. Barnes reviewed MCWG activities.

WMWG (see Key Documents)

David Detelich reviewed WMWG activities.

Other Business

*Review of Open Action Items*

Market Participants reviewed the Open Action Items list and removed the completed item:

* Review market impacts from Tech Refresh project (WMWG)

*Market Notice M-D073020-01: NPRR833 Implementation Error Identified*

Alfredo Moreno summarized Market Notice M-D073020-01, noted the discussions at WMWG to address the issues, and responded to Market Participants questions and concerns.

*August 21, 2020 Transmission Issues Related to Generation Constraints Workshop*

*Nodal Operating Guide Revision Request (NOGRR) 215, Limit Use of Remedial Action Schemes*

Warren Lasher announced the August 21, 2020 Transmission Issues related to Generation Constraints Workshop and noted the holistic review would include discussion of Generic Transmission Constraints (GTCs), NPRR994, and NOGRR215. Mr. Lasher encouraged Market Participants to review the “Use of Generic Transmission Constraints in ERCOT” presentation posted on the meeting page and submit questions or requests to present to Jeff Billo by August 14, 2020.

*Market Information System (MIS) Integration Update*

Aubrey Hale reviewed the MIS release plan and encouraged Market Participants to attend the August 12, 2020 MIS Technical Integration Workshop.

*Annual TAC Subcommittee Structural Review*

Mr. Kee noted the annual TAC and TAC Subcommittee Structural and Procedural Review will be held in September 2020 and encouraged Market Participants to consider working group meeting efficiencies.

*2021 Meeting Calendar*

Market Participants reviewed the draft 2021 meeting calendar.

*No Report*

* Demand Side Working Group (DSWG)
* MSWG
* Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG)
* Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG)

Adjournment

Mr. Kee adjourned the August 5, 2020 WMS meeting at 12:06 p.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at: http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2020/8/5/189342-WMS [↑](#footnote-ref-1)