**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Meeting**

**Webex Only**

**Wednesday, June 3, 2020– 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Allen, Thresa | Avangrid Renewables |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Bierschbach, Erika | Austin Energy |  |
| Bunch, Kevin | EDF Trading North America |  |
| Caraway, Shannon | Solar Prime |  |
| Carpenter, Jeremy | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Claiborn-Pinto, Shawnee | OPUC |  |
| Dumas, John | LCRA |  |
| Evans, Mike | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Franklin, Russell | Garland Power and Light |  |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Generation |  |
| Johnson, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Jolly, Emily | LCRA | Alt. Rep. for John Dumas |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Lange, Clif | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Lindberg, Ken | Bryan Texas Utilities |  |
| Roberts, Bobby | TNMP |  |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine Corporation |  |
| Sefa, Fanar | Olin Corporation |  |
| Smith, Mark | Nucor |  |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy |  |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor |  |
| Wilson, Joe Dan | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |

The following proxies were assigned:

* Jamie Mauldin to Shawnee Claiborn-Pinto
* Sandy Morris to Bill Barnes
* Ty Parker to Bill Barnes

*Guests:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG |  |
| Ashley, Kristy | Customized Energy Solutions |  |
| Benson, Mariah | PUCT |  |
| Bivens, Carrie | Potomac Economics |  |
| Blakey, Eric | Just Energy |  |
| Bruce, Mark | Cratylus Advisors |  |
| Chatlani, Varsha |  |  |
| Cochran, Seth | DC Energy |  |
| Coleman, Diana | CPS Energy |  |
| Dawar, Vikas | Active Power Investments |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Dreyfus, Mark | MD Energy Consulting |  |
| Downey, Marty |  |  |
| Dwyer, Davida | PUCT |  |
| Harvey, Julia | Texas Electric Cooperatives |  |
| Hasan, Prusha | Advanced Energy Economy |  |
| Helton, Bob | ENGIE |  |
| Henry, Mark | Texas Reliability Entity |  |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor |  |
| Huynh, Thuy | Potomac Economics |  |
| Jewell, Michael | Jewell and Associates |  |
| Kroskey, Tony | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| McCamant, Frank | McCamant Consulting |  |
| McKeever, Debbie | Oncor |  |
| Musher, Danny | Key Capture Energy |  |
| Neeraj, Gurpreet | Active Power Investments |  |
| Powell, Christian | Pedernales Electric Cooperative |  |
| Reedy, Steve | Potomac Economics |  |
| Reid, Walter | Advanced Power Alliance |  |
| Rich, Katie | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |
| Richmond, Michele | TCPA |  |
| Roth, Werner | PUCT |  |
| Schauer, Trent | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Schwarz, Brad | Sharyland |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | Crescent Power |  |
| Sithuraj, Murali | Austin Energy |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Smith, Chris | Austin Energy |  |
| Striedel, James | GDS and Associates |  |
| Tran, Diane | TIEC |  |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska |  |
| Wallin, Shane | Denton Municipal Electric |  |
| Wan, Josephine | Austin Energy |  |
| Watson, Mark | SP Global |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Longhorn Power |  |
| Zerwas, Rebecca | PUCT |  |
| Zhou, Emily | Potomac Economics |  |
| Younger, Joseph | Texas Reliability Entity |  |

*ERCOT Staff:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Anderson, Connor |  |  |
| Bernecker, John |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  |  |
| Boswell, Bill |  |  |
| Bracy, Phil |  |  |
| Chen, Jian |  |  |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Comstock, Read |  |  |
| Dinopol, Ohlen |  |  |
| Frosch, Colleen |  |  |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |  |
| Hale, Aubrey |  |  |
| Hanson, Kevin |  |  |
| Hailu, Ted |  |  |
| Hull, Gibson |  |  |
| Jones, Dan |  |  |
| Kane, Erika |  |  |
| Khodabaksh, Fred |  |  |
| Lasher, Warren |  |  |
| Lee, Anson |  |  |
| Lofton, Amy |  |  |
| Maggio, Dave |  |  |
| Mago, Nitika |  |  |
| Moorty, Sai |  |  |
| Morehead, Juliana |  |  |
| Moreno, Alfredo |  |  |
| Opheim, Calvin |  |  |
| Orr, Rob |  |  |
| Patterson, Mark |  |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Ragsdale, Kenneth |  |  |
| Raish, Carl |  |  |
| Rios, Diana |  |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  |  |
| Rosel, Austin |  |  |
| Ruane, Mark |  |  |
| Sharma, Sandip |  |  |
| Shaw, Pam |  |  |
| Stice, Clayton |  |  |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  |  |
| Townsend, Aaron |  |  |
| Tucker, Don |  |  |
| Warnken, Pete |  |  |
| Wattles, Paul |  |  |

***Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments were present for a vote.***

Antitrust Admonition

David Kee directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Agenda Review

Mr. Kee reviewed items scheduled for a vote and noted changes to the order items would be taken up.

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update and Assignments

Mr. Kee summarized discussion from the May 27, 2020 TAC Information Session, noted that the TAC Procedures, effective June 1, 2020 allow remote voting for TAC and TAC Subcommittees, and reviewed the proposed voting process to maximize efficiencies for items to be considered by WMS. There were no questions or comments from Market Participants.

Approval of WMS Meeting Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*February 5, 2020*

Market Participants reviewed the February 5, 2020 WMS Meeting Minutes. Mr. Kee noted this item was slated for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot). There were no questions or comments from Market Participants.

ERCOT Operations and Market Items

There were no reports or discussions for this agenda item.

WMS Revision Requests (see Key Documents)

*Impact Analysis Review*

*Verifiable Cost Manual Revision Request (VCMRR) 029, Related to NPRR1003, Elimination of References to Resource Asset Registration Form*

Market Participants reviewed the Impact Analysis for VCMRR029. Mr. Kee noted this item was slated for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot). There were no questions or comments from Market Participants.

Draft Other Binding Document, Demand Response Data Definitions and Technical Specifications

Carl Raish presented the Draft Other Binding Document, Demand Response Data Definitions and Technical Specifications, provided an update on Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 933, Reporting of Demand Response by Retail Electric Providers and Non-Opt-In Entities, noted the anticipated implementation timeline for NPRR933 and the proposed Other Binding Document, and summarized discussions at the June 2, 2020 Retail Market Subcommittee (RMS) meeting. There were no questions or comments from Market Participants.

Wholesale Market Working Group (WMWG) (see Key Documents)

David Detelich reviewed WMWG activities, including Revision Requests and issues assigned to WMWG.

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS, Referred to WMS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR947, Clarification to Ancillary Service Supply Responsibility Definition and Improvements to Determining and Charging for Ancillary Service Failed Quantities*

Market Participants and ERCOT Staff discussed the cost benefit analysis of NPRR947 in consideration of Real-Time Co-optimization (RTC). ERCOT Staff requested additional time to review the issues. WMS took no action on this item.

*NPRR981, Day-Ahead Market Price Correction Process*

WMS took no action on this item.

*NPRR991, Day-Ahead Market (DAM) Point-to-Point (PTP) Obligation Bid Clearing Price Clarification*

Mr. Detelich summarized NPRR991 and discussions from the May 23 and May 18, 2020 WMWG meetings, and stated that WMWG reached consensus in recommending WMS reject NPRR991 and consider alternate solutions 1, 2 and 3 as presented. Mr. Detelich noted the need to await for NPRR903, Day-Ahead Market Timing Deviations and NPRR981 to proceed through the stakeholder process to consider potential impacts to the alternate solutions. ERCOT Staff responded to Market Participants questions and concerns. Market Participants expressed support for the WMWG recommendation to reject NPRR991 and requested WMWG review the alternate solutions. Mr. Kee noted this item was slated for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot). There were no objections from Market Participants.

NPRR995, RTF-6 Create Definition and Terms for Settlement Only Energy Storage

Bob Wittmeyer summarized NPRR995 and requested WMS direction on the policy issue of how Settlement Only Generators (SOGs) are settled, noting that they often represent energy storage. Carrie Bivens stated that using nodal prices is preferable. Market Participants directed ERCOT Staff to develop Settlement language and calculations for nodal prices for consideration at the July 8, 2020 WMS meeting. Mr. Kee noted this item was slated for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot). There were no objections from Market Participants.

NPRR1004, Load Distribution Factor Process Update

Alfredo Moreno reviewed NPRR1004. Katie Rich summarized the December 16, 2019 Congestion Management Working Group (CMWG) meeting discussion. Mr. Kee noted this item was slated for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot). Ian Haley stated his intent to abstain in consideration of NPRR1004 would be reflected in his vote on the Combined Ballot and declined to remove NPRR1004 from the Combined Ballot.

Planning Guide Revision Request (PGRR) 077, DC Tie Planning Assumptions

ERCOT Staff summarized PGRR077. Market Participants discussed the intent of PGRR077 and the 5/28/20 REMC comments, and requested review of the issues by the CMWG. Mark Bruce expressed concern for the broader language proposed in the 5/28/20 REMC comments and noted the potential delay of PGRR077 proceeding through the stakeholder process would impact two of the Southern Cross Transmission Directives. Mr. Kee noted this item was slated for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot](#Combined_Ballot). There were no objections from Market Participants.

Combined Ballot

**Shawnee Claiborn-Pinto moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To approve the February 5, 2020 WMS meeting minutes as submitted**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 5/8/20 WMS Report and Impact Analysis for VCMRR029**
* **To recommend PRS reject NPRR991, direct WMWG to continue to develop Alternatives 1 through 3 per the WMWG presentation to June 3, 2020 WMS**
* **To request PRS continue to table NPRR995**
* **To endorse NPRR1004 as submitted**
* **To request the Reliability and Operations Subcommittee (ROS) continue to table PGRR077, and referred the issue to the CMWG**

**Resmi Surendran seconded the motion. The motion carried via roll call vote with one abstention from the Independent Generator (Luminant Generation) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

CMWG (see Key Documents)

Ms. Rich reviewed CMWG activities and responded to questions and comments from Market Participants.

Market Credit Working Group (MCWG) (see Key Documents)

Bill Barnes reviewed MCWG activities, including Revision Requests reviewed for credit impacts and issues assigned to MCWG, and responded to questions and comments from Market Participants.

Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG) (see Key Documents)

Caitlin Smith reviewed SAWG activities and responded to questions and comments from Market Participants.

*Final Summer 2020 Seasonal Assessment of Resource Adequacy (SARA) for the ERCOT Region and Updated Capacity, Demand and Reserves (CDR)*

Pete Warnken summarized the Final Summer 2020 SARA and updated CDR discussion at the May 28, 2020 SAWG meeting and responded to questions and comments from Market Participants.

Other Business (see Key Documents)

*May 28 MIS Sandbox Release*

Aubrey Hale encouraged Market Participants to explore the sandbox Market Information System (MIS) and provide comments on the MIS redesign to ERCOT in advance of the June 24, 2020 MIS and ERCOT.com User Workshop.

*PUCT Rule 25.503(f)(12) Issue*

Dan Jones presented Draft NPRR, Modify Allocator for CRR Auction Revenue Distribution, stated that the NPRR will correct an inefficiency related to the current CRR Auction Revenue Distribution (CARD) allocation methodology, and responded to questions and comments from Market Participants.

*Review of Open Action Items*

Market Participants reviewed the Open Action Items list and removed the completed items:

* Examine whether capacity curtailed for purpose of base case violations should be included in Operating Reserve Demand Curve (ORDC) reserve calculations

*No Report*

* Demand Side Working Group (DSWG)
* Market Settlement Working Group (MSWG)
* Metering Working Group (MWG)
* Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG)

Adjournment

Mr. Kee adjourned the June 3, 2020 WMS meeting at 12:40 p.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at: http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2020/6/3/189334-WMS [↑](#footnote-ref-1)