**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Meeting**

**ERCOT Austin – 7620 Metro Center Drive – Austin, Texas 78744**

**Wednesday, December 4, 2019 – 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Allen, Thresa | Avangrid Renewables | Via Teleconference |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Bierschbach, Erika | Austin Energy |  |
| Bunch, Kevin | EDF Energy Services | Via Teleconference |
| Caraway, Shannon | Solar Prime |  |
| Carpenter, Jeremy | Tenaska Power Services | Via Teleconference |
| Claiborn-Pinto, Shawnee | OPUC |  |
| Evans, Mike | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Franklin, Russell | Garland Power and Light |  |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Haley, Ian | Exelon | Alt. Rep. for Marka Shaw |
| Johnson, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Lange, Clif | South Texas Electric Cooperative | Via Teleconference |
| Lindberg, Ken | Bryan Texas Utilities |  |
| Mauldin, Jamie | City of Eastland |  |
| Morris, Sandy | Direct Energy |  |
| Nguyen, Andy | LCRA | Alt. Rep. for John Dumas |
| Parker, Ty | Infinite Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine Corporation | Alt. Rep. for Brandon Whittle |
| Smith, Mark | Nucor |  |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy |  |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor |  |
| Wilson, Joe Dan | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |

*Guests:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG | Via Teleconference |
| Ashley, Kristy | Customized Energy Solutions | Via Teleconference |
| Baldwin, Stephanie | Softsmiths |  |
| Benson, Mariah | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Blakey, Eric | Just Energy |  |
| Boisseau, Heather | LCRA | Via Teleconference |
| Bryant, Mark | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Bruce, Mark | Cratylus Advisors | Via Teleconference |
| Carson, Michael | Engie | Via Teleconference |
| Coleman, Diana | CPS Energy |  |
| Daigneault, Ralph | Potomac Economics |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Downey, Marty |  |  |
| Dwyer, Davida | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Fazio, Danielle | ECTP | Via Teleconference |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Generation |  |
| Hennelly, Eugene | Fifth Set Capital | Via Teleconference |
| Kroskey, Tony | Brazos Electric Cooperative | Via Teleconference |
| Pollo, Kevin | CPS Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Powell, Christian | Pedernales Electric Cooperative |  |
| Rainwater, Kim | Environmental Defense Fund | Via Teleconference |
| Reid, Walter | Advanced Power Alliance | Via Teleconference |
| Rich, Katie | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |
| Roberts, Bobby | TNMP | Via Teleconference |
| Robinson, Rhonda | Calpine | Via Teleconference |
| Siddiqi, Shams | Crescent Power | Via Teleconference |
| Singer, Chad | Trane | Via Teleconference |
| Sithuraj, Murali | Austin Energy |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | AB Power Advisors |  |
| Smith, Chase | Southern Power |  |
| Smith, Chris | Austin Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Smyth, Scott | DTRG Law | Via Teleconference |
| Thompson, David | Pedernales Electric Cooperative | Via Teleconference |
| True, Roy | ACES Power | Via Teleconference |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative | Via Teleconference |
| Van Booven, Ashley | New Braunfels Utilities | Via Teleconference |
| Van Zee, Katie | Texas Reliability Entity | Via Teleconference |
| Watson, Mark | SP Global | Via Teleconference |
| Wittington, Pam | Jewell and Associates |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Longhorn Power |  |

*ERCOT Staff:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Anderson, Connor |  | Via Teleconference |
| Bivens, Carrie |  | Via Teleconference |
| Bracy, Phil |  | Via Teleconference |
| Chen, Jian |  | Via Teleconference |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Covington, Austin |  | Via Teleconference |
| Hailu, Ted |  | Via Teleconference |
| Hilliard, Marie |  | Via Teleconference |
| Khodabaksh, Fred |  | Via Teleconference |
| Lee, Anson |  | Via Teleconference |
| Levine, Jon |  | Via Teleconference |
| Maggio, Dave |  |  |
| Mickey, Joel |  |  |
| Morehead, Juliana |  | Via Teleconference |
| Moreno, Alfredo |  | Via Teleconference |
| Ögelman, Kenan |  |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  | Via Teleconference |
| Rosel, Austin |  | Via Teleconference |
| Smith, Nathan |  | Via Teleconference |
| Thompson, Chad |  | Via Teleconference |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  | Via Teleconference |
| Xia, Hong |  | Via Teleconference |

***Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments were present for a vote.***

Antitrust Admonition

David Kee directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Agenda Review

Mr. Kee reviewed items scheduled for a vote and noted changes to the order items would be taken up.

Approval of WMS Meeting Minutes

*November 6, 2019*

This item was deferred to the January 8, 2020 WMS meeting

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update and Assignments (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*Summer Assessment Items*

Mr. Kee reviewed the disposition of items considered at the November 20, 2019 TAC meeting. Kenan Ögelman presented the 2019 Summer Learned items, including responses from Calpine and Exelon, stated the intent to provide an efficient approach for vetting the issues rather than ad hoc discussions, responded to questions and comments from Market Participants, and requested WMS direction on the issues. Market Participants added the following assignments to the WMS Open Action Items list:

* Switchable Generation Resources (SWGRs) with Exelon items to the Wholesale Market Working Group (WMWG) to develop solutions, then to the Market Settlement Working Group (MSWG) for Settlement review
* Emergency Response Service (ERS) to the Demand Side Working Group (DSWG) and WMWG to be considered in joint meetings
* Credit and/or Collateral for Qualified Scheduling Entity (QSE) representing Resource only to WMWG for mechanics, then to the Market Credit Working Group (MCWG)
* Revert to previous usage of Operating Condition Notices (OCNs) for projected reserve capacity shortage being issued when there is a projected shortage of available capacity, rather than committed capacity, for a future hour to WMS awaiting ERCOT proposal
* Evaluate current Texas Commission on Environmental Quality (TCEQ) enforcement discretion process and look for improvements with managing potential emission limitation issues to WMS
* Process for Summer demand response study to WMS following consideration by the Retail Market Subcommittee (RMS)
* Review of Resource Adequacy forecasts and development of a Net Load forecast to the Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG)

ERCOT Operations and Market Items

There were no reports or discussions for this agenda item.

New Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Referrals (see Key Documents)

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 976, Provisions for Resource Entities to Act as a Virtual QSE or Emergency QSE*

Mark Ruane reviewed NPRR976 and noted that additional clarifications are being developed. Bill Barnes summarized the November 22, 2019 MCWG discussion regarding NPRR976. Market Participants requested additional review of the issues by MCWG and WMWG.

**Clayton Greer moved to request PRS continue to table NPRR976 for further review by MCWG and WMWG. Mr. Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

WMS Revision Requests (see Key Documents)

*Impact Analysis Review*

*Verifiable Cost Manual Revision Request (VCMRR) 026, Related to NPRR970, Reliability Unit Commitment (RUC) Fuel Dispute Process Clarification*

**Mr. Barnes moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 11/6/19 WMS Report and Impact Analysis for VCMRR026. Mr. Greer seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

WMWG (see Key Documents)

David Detelich summarized recent WMWG activities.

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS, Referred to WMS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR903, Day-Ahead Market Timing Deviations*

*NPRR933, Reporting of Demand Response by Retail Electric Providers and Non-Opt-In Entities*

*NPRR938, Distribution Voltage Level Block Load (BLT) Compensation*

*NPRR947, Clarification to Ancillary Service Supply Responsibility Definition and Improvements to Determining and Charging for Ancillary Service Failed Quantities*

WMS took no action on these items.

*NPRR970, Reliability Unit Commitment (RUC) Fuel Dispute Process Clarification*

**Mr. Barnes moved to endorse NPRR970 as submitted. Mr. Greer seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Congestion Management Working Group (CMWG)

Sandy Morris summarized CMWG activities.

MCWG (see Key Documents)

Mr. Barnes reviewed MCWG activities.

Other Business

*Review of Open Action Items*

Market Participants reviewed the Open Action Items list and removed the following completed item as submitted:

* External telemetry and price corrections issues related to May 30, 2019 Event (WMWG)

*No Report*

* DSWG
* MSWG
* Metering Working Group (MWG)
* Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG)
* SAWG

Adjournment

Mr. Kee adjourned the December 4, 2019 WMS meeting at 10:50 a.m.

1. http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2019/12/4/165264-WMS [↑](#footnote-ref-1)