**APPROVED Minutes**

**Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Meeting**

**ERCOT Austin – 7620 Metro Center Drive – Austin, Texas 78744**

**Thursday, December 13, 2018 – 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Coleman, Diana | OPUC |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Generation | Alt. Rep. for D. Ricketts |
| Heino, Shari | Brazos Electric Power Cooperative |  |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor |  |
| Sams, Bryan | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Stanfield, Leonard | Invenergy Energy Management |  |
| Trevino, Melissa | Occidental Chemical |   |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Denton Municipal Electric | Alt. Rep. for S. Day |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| *Guests:* |  |  |
| Abbott, Kristin | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG | Via Teleconference |
| Blakey, Eric | Just Energy |  |
| Bryant, Mark | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Carpenter, Jeremy | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Checkly, Jim | Cross Texas Transmission |  |
| Cochran, Seth | DC Energy  | Via Teleconference |
| Cortez, Sarai | Sharyland |  |
| Cripe, Ramsey | Schneider Engineering | Via Teleconference |
| Downey, Marty | Electranet Power |  |
| Griffiths, Meghan | Jackson Walker | Via Teleconference |
| Harris, Brenda | Oxy | Via Teleconference |
| Hejkal, John | Tenaska Power Services | Via Teleconference |
| Helton, Bob  | ENGIE Resources |  |
| Henderson, Natasha | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |
| Johnson, Anthony | CenterPoint Energy |   |
| Lange, Clif | South Texas Electric Cooperative |   |
| Lee, Jim | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| McCamant, Frank | McCamant Consulting | Via Teleconference |
| Morris, Sandy | Direct Energy |  |
| Moss, Steven | E.ON |  |
| Paff, Tom | Duke Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Powell, Christian | Pedernales Electric Cooperative |  |
| Reed, Cyrus | Sierra Club |  |
| Reedy, Steve | Potomac Economics |  |
| Reid, Walter | Advanced Power Alliance |  |
| Ritch, John | Lone Star Transmission | Alt. Rep. for A. Williams  |
| Robertson, Jennifer | LCRA |  |
| Romero, Lara | ACES Power | Via Teleconference |
| Scott, Kathy | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | Crescent Power |  |
| Sithuraj, Murali  | Austin Energy |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | Invenergy  |   |
| Smith, Lana | San Miguel Electric Cooperative |  |
| Trefny, Floyd | Nucor | Alt. Rep. for M. Smith |
| Vickery, Chris | GlidePath Power | Via Teleconference |
| Watson, Mark | SPGlobal | Via Teleconference |
| Whittington, Pam | Jewell & Associates  |  |
| Younger, Joseph | Texas Reliability Entity  | Via Teleconference |
|  |  |  |
| *ERCOT Staff* |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |   |
| Anderson, Connor |  | Via Teleconference |
| Anderson, Troy |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  |  |
| Boswell, Bob |  | Via Teleconference |
| Bracy, Phil  |   |   |
| Butterfield, Lindsay |  |  |
| Castillo, Leo |  | Via Teleconference |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Hanson, Kevin |  | Via Teleconference |
| Hilliard, Marie |  | Via Teleconference |
| Hobbs, Kristi |  |  |
| Hull, Gibson |  | Via Teleconference |
| Jin, Julie |  | Via Teleconference |
| Jones, Dan |  |  |
| Kane, Erika |  | Via Teleconference |
| Kang, Sun Wook |  | Via Teleconference |
| Krein, Steve |  |  |
| Levine, Jon |  |   |
| Morehead, Juliana |  | Via Teleconference |
| Ögelman, Kenan |  |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Rios, Diana |  |  |
| Roberts, Randy |  | Via Teleconference |
| Rosel, Austin |  |   |
| Ruane, Mark |  |  |
| Shanks, Magie |  | Via Teleconference |
| Solis, Stephen |  | Via Teleconference |
| Stice, Clayton |  |  |
| Taurozzi, Tina |  |  |
| Teixeira, Jay |  |  |
| Townsend, Aaron |  | Via Teleconference |
| Warnken, Pete |  | Via Teleconference |
| Wattles, Paul |  | Via Teleconference |
| Woodfin, Dan |  |  |
| Zeplin, Rachel |  |   |

*Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments were present for a vote.*

Martha Henson called the December 13, 2018 PRS meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Antitrust Admonition

Ms. Henson directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Approval of Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*November 15, 2018*

**Bob Helton moved to approve the November 15, 2018 meeting minutes as submitted. Clayton Greer seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) and Board Report

Ms. Henson noted the disposition of Revision Requests considered at the November 29, 2018 TAC and December 11, 2018 ERCOT Board meetings.

Project Update and Summary of Project Priority List (PPL) Activity to Date (see Key Documents)

Troy Anderson provided a project update and summary of PPL activity and reviewed the 2018 and 2019 release targets and 2018 project spending.

Review PRS Reports, Impact Analyses, and Prioritization

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 863, Creation of ERCOT Contingency Reserve Service and Revisions to Responsive Reserve*

Market Participants reviewed the 12/6/18 ERCOT comments, Impact Analysis, and Business Case for NPRR863. Some Market Participants expressed concern for the assumptions used in the cost benefit analysis presented in the 12/6/18 ERCOT comments and requested additional time to review.

**Ian Haley moved to table NPRR863 for one month. Murali Sithuraj seconded the motion.** Some Market Participants expressed opposition to tabling NPRR863 stating that it had been fully vetted. **The motion to table NPRR863 for one month failed via roll call vote, with 12 objections from the Consumer (2) (Sierra Club, Nucor), Cooperative (3) (GSEC, SMEC, STEC), Independent Generator (2) (E.ON, ENGIE), Independent Power Marketer (IPM) (2) (Morgan Stanley, Tenaska), Independent Retail Electric Provider (IREP) (Electranet), Investor Owned Utility (IOU) (Lone Star), and Municipal (DME) Market Segments, and one abstention from the IREP (Direct Energy) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Market Participants further discussed a phased implementation approach and ERCOT Staff and the sponsor of NPRR863 agreed to review potential project timelines to phase in the Responsive Reserve (RRS) portions of NPRR863 ahead of the Contingency Reserve Service. Market Participants offered additional Business Case language in support of NPRR863.

**Marty Downey moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 10/18/18 PRS Report as revised by PRS and Impact Analysis for NPRR863 with a recommended priority of 2019 and rank of 2650. Lucas Turner seconded the motion. The motion carried with two objections from the Independent Generator (Luminant) and Municipal (Austin Energy) Market Segments and three abstentions from the Consumer (Occidental), Cooperative (LCRA), and Independent Generator (Invenergy) Market Segments.**

*NPRR886, Agreements Between ERCOT and Other ISOs, RCs, and/or RTOs*

Market Participants discussed the Impact Analysis for NPRR886 and offered clarifications to the Revision Request title to better align it with the proposed language revisions.

**Bob Wittmeyer moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 11/15/18 PRS Report as revised by PRS and Impact Analysis for NPRR886. Bryan Sams seconded the motion. The motion carried with one abstention from the IPM (Morgan Stanley) Market Segment.**

*NPRR905, CRR Balancing Account Resettlement*

Market Participants discussed the Impact Analysis and appropriate priority and rank for NPRR905.

**Mr. Greer moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 11/15/18 PRS Report and Impact Analysis for NPRR905 with a recommended priority of 2019 and rank of 2630. Mr. Downey seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

*NPRR906, Clarifying the Decision Making Entity Process*

**Mr. Greer moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 11/15/18 PRS Report and Impact Analysis for NPRR906. Mr. Wittmeyer seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

*NPRR907, Revise Definition of M1a to Reflect Actual Calendar Days*

Market Participants discussed the Impact Analysis for NPRR907 and offered clarifications to the Business Case to note significant savings to Market Participants.

**Mr. Greer moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 11/15/18 PRS Report as revised by PRS and Impact Analysis for NPRR907 with a recommended priority of 2019 and rank of 2640. Mr. Helton seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR823, Amend the Definition of an Affiliate*

*NPRR826, Mitigated Offer Caps for RMR Resources*

*NPRR838, Updated O&M Cost for RMR Resources*

*NPRR849, Clarification of the Range of Voltage Set Points at a Generation Resource’s POI*

*NPRR872, Modifying the SASM Shadow Price Cap*

*NPRR885, Must-Run Alternative (MRA) Details and Revisions Resulting from PUCT Project No. 46369, Rulemaking Relating to Reliability Must-Run Service*

*NPRR891, Removal of NOIE Capacity Reporting Threshold for the Unregistered Distributed Generation Report*

*NPRR896, Reliability Must-Run and Must-Run Alternative Evaluation Process*

*NPRR900, Protocol Section 14 Language Review*

*NPRR903, Day-Ahead Market Timing Deviations*

*NPRR904, Revisions to Real-Time On-Line Reliability Deployment Price Adder for ERCOT-Directed Actions Related to DC Ties*

*NPRR908, Revisions to Mass Transition Processes*

*System Change Request (SCR) 798, PTP Obligation Bid ID Limit*

PRS took no action on these items.

*NPRR902, ERCOT Critical Energy Infrastructure Information*

Jon Levine announced the NPPR902 Workshop II date of January 31, 2019 and encouraged Market Participants to submit comments by January 18, 2019. PRS took no action on this item.

Review of Revision Request Language (see Key Documents)

*NPRR909, Address Unavailability Gap for ERS and Other Minor Clarifications*

**Mr. Helton moved to table NPRR909 and refer the issue to the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS). John Varnell seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

*NPRR910, Clarify Treatment of RUC Resource that has a Day-Ahead Market Three-Part Supply Award*

Kenan Ögelman reviewed the merits of NPRR910, noted the vetting of NPRR910 at the Qualified Scheduling Entity (QSE) Managers Working Group (QMWG) meetings and summarized the changes in Other Binding Document Revision Request (OBDRR) 010, Related to NPRR910, Clarify Treatment of RUC Resource that has a Day-Ahead Market Three-Part Supply Award. Some Market Participants expressed concern for unintended consequences of NPRR910 in the Day-Ahead Market (DAM). ERCOT Staff clarified that NPRR910 proposes no changes to the DAM or Settlements. Market Participants and ERCOT Staff reviewed the Revision Request timeline for NPRR910.

**Mr. Greer moved to recommend approval of NPRR910 as submitted. Mr. Wittmeyer seconded the motion. The motion carried with one abstention from the Independent Generator (Luminant) Market Segment.**

*NPRR911, Improved Calculation of Real-Time LMPs at Logical Resource Nodes for On-Line Combined Cycle Generation Resources*

**Mr. Greer moved to recommend approval of NPRR911 as submitted. Mr. Sams seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

*NPRR912, Settlement of Switchable Generation Resources (SWGRs) Instructed to Switch to ERCOT*

Market Participants and ERCOT Staff discussed the merits of NPRR912, the 12/13/18 Tenaska Energy comments, and the implementation timeline. Some Market Participants expressed concern for the completeness of the list of costs recoverable in Settlement and requested additional review by WMS.

**Mr. Greer moved to table NPRR912 and refer the issue to WMS. Mr. Varnell seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Resource Definition Task Force (RTF)

Mr. Wittmeyer reviewed recent RTF activities.

Other Business

There was no other business.

Adjournment

Ms. Henson adjourned the December 13, 2018 PRS meeting at 11:05 a.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2018/12/13/138520-PRS unless otherwise noted [↑](#footnote-ref-1)