**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS) Meeting**

**ERCOT Austin – 7620 Metro Center Drive – Austin, Texas 78744**

**Wednesday, September 27, 2017 – 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Allen, Thresa | Avangrid Renewables |  |
| Bierschbach, Erika | Austin Energy |  |
| Brewster, Chris | City of Eastland |  |
| Carpenter, Jeremy | Tenaska |  |
| Coleman, Diana | OPUC |  |
| Downey, Marty | Viridity Energy |  |
| Dumas, John | LCRA |  |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |   |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Helton, Bob | Dynegy |  |
| Hauk, Christine | Garland Power and Light | Alt. Rep. for R. Franklin |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Lindberg, Ken | Bryan Texas Utilities  |  |
| Maduzia, Franklin | Dow Chemical |  |
| Moore, Sheri | CenterPoint Energy | Alt. Rep. for D. Plunkett |
| Sams, Bryan | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Sandidge, Clint | Calpine Energy Solutions |  |
| Smith, Mark | Nucor |  |
| Such, Chris | E. ON |  |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy | Alt. Rep. for G. Thurnher |
| Troy, Roy | Brazos Electric Power Cooperative | Via Teleconference |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative | Alt. Rep. for C. Lange |
| Wilson, Joe Dan | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |   |
| Woodruff, Taylor | Oncor |  |

The following proxies were assigned:

* Brad Schwarz to Blake Gross

*Guests:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Abbott, Kristin | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Anderson, Kevin | CES Energy |  |
| Barnes, Bill  | Reliant Energy Retail Services |   |
| Blevins, Chad | Grid Economics | Via Teleconference |
| Brandt, Adrianne | CPS Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Bryant, Mark | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Bunch, Kevin | EDF Energy Services |  |
| Clark, Jack | NextEra |  |
| Cripe, Ramsey | Schneider Engineering | Via Teleconference |
| Daigneault, Ralph | Potomac Economics |  |
| Dickson, Andrew | Duke Energy |  |
| Eckhoff, Christina | Texas Reliability Entity | Via Teleconference |
| Elliott, Christopher | Bank of America Merrill Lynch | Via Teleconference |
| Foos, Richard | Calpine | Via Teleconference |
| Gray, Stan | Southern Cross |  |
| Gomez, Gabe | CES Energy Solutions | Via Teleconference |
| Graham, Greg | Texas Reliability Entity | Via Teleconference |
| Haley, Ian | Vistra Energy |   |
| Hourihan, Mike | CPower Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Johnson, David | IVG Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Juricek, Michael | Oncor | Via Teleconference |
| Kroskey, Tony | Brazos Electric Power Cooperative | Via Teleconference |
| Moss, Steven | EON |  |
| Mueller, Paula | Texas Reliability Entity | Via Teleconference |
| Nathan, Robert | CPS Energy |  |
| Paff, Tom | Duke Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Poonawala, Adnan | Just Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Powell, Christian | LCRA |  |
| Reed, Cyrus | Sierra Club |  |
| Reedy, Steve | Potomac Economics |  |
| Ricketts, David | Vistra Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Robinson, Rhonda | Calpine | Via Teleconference |
| Rothschild, Eric | GDS Associates | Via Teleconference |
| Scott, Astrid | Just Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Sithuraj, Murali | Austin Energy |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | Jewell & Associates |  |
| Smith, Tom Smitty | Public Citizen | Via Teleconference |
| Stanfield, Leonard | Invenergy |  |
| Thompson, David | PEC |  |
| Trefny, Floyd |  | Via Teleconference |
| Trenary, Michelle | Tenaska | Via Teleconference |
| Wallin, Shane | DME | Via Teleconference |
| Whittle, Brandon | Megawatt Analytics |   |
| Whitworth, Doug | Texas Reliability Entity | Via Teleconference |
| Williams, Aundrea,  | NextEra |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | DME |  |
| Zake, Diana | Lone Star Transmission | Via Teleconference |
| Zhou, Jeff | SPGlobal | Via Teleconference |

*ERCOT Staff:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Albracht, Brittney |  | Via Teleconference |
| Bracy, Phil |  | Via Teleconference |
| Clifton, Suzy |  | Via Teleconference |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |   |
| Hailu, Ted |  | Via Teleconference |
| Hanson, Kevin |  | Via Teleconference |
| Jones, Dan |  |  |
| Kane, Erika |  | Via Teleconference |
| Landry, Kelly |  |  |
| Lasher, Warren |  |  |
| Maggio, Dave |  |  |
| Mago, Nitika |  | Via Teleconference |
| Matevosjana, Julia |  | Via Teleconference |
| Mele, Cheryl |  |  |
| Mereness, Matt |  |  |
| Morehead, Juliana |  |  |
| Moreno, Alfredo |  | Via Teleconference |
| Ögelman, Kenan |  |  |
| Pengwei, Du |  | Via Teleconference |
| Phillips, Cory |  |   |
| Ragsdale, Ken |  |  |
| Raish, Carl |  | Via Teleconference |
| Rosel, Austin |  | Via Teleconference |
| Ruane, Mark |  |   |
| Sharma, Sandip |  |  |
| Stice, Clayton |  |  |
| Thomas, Shane |  |  |

***Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments were present for a vote.***

Antitrust Admonition

Jeremy Carpenter directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Agenda Review

There were no changes to the agenda.

Approval of WMS Meeting Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*September 6, 2017*

**Bob Helton moved to approve the September 6, 2017 WMS meeting minutes as revised by WMS. Bryan Sams seconded the motion. The motion carried with one abstention from the Independent Power Marketer (IPM) (Morgan Stanley) Market Segment.**

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update and Assignments see (Key Documents)

Mr. Carpenter reminded Market Participants of the September 28, 2017 TAC meeting.

*Southern Cross Working Group Assignment*

Matt Mereness presented an update on the Southern Cross Transmission Project and stated that after additional review, ERCOT proposed assigning Directive #10, Price Formation to the Qualified Scheduling Entity (QSE) Managers Working Group (QMWG). Mr. Carpenter referred the issue to QMWG, and requested that the ERCOT proposed assignments for WMS and its working groups be added to the Open Action Items list. There were no objections.

ERCOT Operations and Market Items

There were no items for discussion.

New Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Referrals

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 846, Allow Previously Committed ERS Resources to Participate in MRA Agreements and Other ERS Items*

Mark Patterson reviewed NPRR846 and noted that the Demand Side Working Group (DSWG) discussed and addressed Market Participant concerns.

**Mark Smith moved to endorse NPRR846 as submitted. Franklin Maduzia seconded the motion. The motion carried with one abstention from the IPM (Morgan Stanley) Market Segment.**

*NPRR847, Exceptional Fuel Cost Included in the Mitigated Offer Cap*

**Mr. Sams moved to request PRS continue to table NPRR847 to allow additional time for review by QMWG. Mr. Helton seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS, Referred to WMS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR807, Day-Ahead Market Price Correction*

*NPRR814, Modify Black Start Procurement Cycle*

*NPRR819, Resettlement Clean-Ups*

*NPRR828, Include Fast Frequency Response as a Subset of Responsive Reserve*

*NPRR832, Disallow PTP Obligation Bids and DAM Energy Bids that Sink at Private Use Network Settlement Points Without a Load Distribution Factor - Urgent*

*NPRR835, Removing the Capacity Limits from Resources Providing Fast Responding Regulation Service (FRRS)*

*NPRR837, Regional Planning Group (RPG) Process Reform*

*NPRR838, Updated O&M Cost for RMR Resources*

*NPRR841, Real-Time Adjustments to Day-Ahead Make Whole Payments due to Ancillary Services Infeasibility Charges*

*NPRR842, Study Area Load Information*

*NPRR844, Clarification to Outage Report*

*NPRR845, RMR Process and Agreement Revisions*

WMS took no action on these items.

*NPRR834, Clarifications for Repossessions of CRRs by ERCOT*

**Resmi Surendran moved to endorse NPRR834 as amended by the 8/8/17 ERCOT comments. Clayton Greer seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

*NPRR843, Short-Term System Adequacy and AS Offer Disclosure Reports Additions*

**Ms. Surendran to endorse NPRR843 as submitted. Mr. Greer seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Congestion Management Working Group (CMWG) (see Key Documents)

Ian Haley reviewed recent CMWG activities.

Market Credit Working Group (MCWG) (see Key Documents)

Bill Barnes reviewed recent MCWG activities including the Congestion Revenue Rights (CRR) Auction credit calculator.

Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG) (see Key Documents)

Mr. Sams reviewed recent SAWG activities, including defining the scope of Real-Time co-optimization and requested direction from WMS on the assignment. Market Participants discussed the complexity of the issue, challenges in the stakeholder process based on competing interests, and the potential paths forward. Kenan Ögelman stated that Real-Time co-optimization is now being considered by the Public Utility Commission of Texas (PUCT) and proposed that until those policy decisions are made, Market Participants pursue an educational focus on the issue. Some Market Participants discussed the need for a cost benefit analysis and expressed concern for an education only focus. Mr. Carpenter offered to request additional direction at the September 28, 2017 TAC meeting.

Other Business

*Review of Open Action Items*

Market Participants reviewed the Open Action Items list and the completed TAC assignment, “Review the issue of potential price impacts of large Direct Current Ties (DC Ties) in ERCOT related to NPRR768, Revisions to Real-Time On-Line Reliability Deployment Price Adder Categories,” was removed.

*No Report*

* DSWG
* Emerging Technologies Working Group (ETWG)
* Metering Working Group (MWG)
* QMWG
* Resource Cost Working Group (RCWG)

Adjournment

Mr. Carpenter adjourned the September 27, 2017 WMS meeting at 11:30 a.m.

1. <http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2017/9/27/118703-WMS>

 [↑](#footnote-ref-1)