**APPROVED Minutes**

**Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Meeting**

**ERCOT Austin – 7620 Metro Center Drive – Austin, Texas 78744**

**Thursday, September 14, 2017 – 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Burke, Tom | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative |  |
| Coleman, Diana | OPUC |  |
| Day, Smith | Denton Municipal Electric |  |
| Gibson, C. | Discount Power |  |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Heino, Shari | Brazos Electric Power Cooperative |  |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor |  |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Peters, Patrick | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Ricketts, David | Luminant |  |
| Shaw, Marka | Exelon |  |
| Trevino, Melissa | Occidental Chemical |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services |  |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| *Guests:* | |  | |  |
| Abbott, Kristin | | PUCT | | Via Teleconference |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | | NRG | | Via Teleconference |
| Blevins, Chad | | GridEconomics | | Via Teleconference |
| Brandt, Adrianne | | CPS Energy | |  |
| Bryant, Mark | | PUCT | | Via Teleconference |
| Bunch, Kevin | | EDF ES | |  |
| Chang, Sam | | CenterPoint Energy | | Via Teleconference |
| Checkley, Jim | | CTT | |  |
| Cochran, Seth | | DC Energy | |  |
| Downey, Marty | | Viridity | |  |
| Eckhoff, Christina | | Texas Reliability Entity | | Via Teleconference |
| Goff, Eric | | Citigroup Energy | |  |
| Graham, Greg | | Texas Reliability Entity | | Via Teleconference |
| Hall, Tim | | Southern Power | |  |
| Harvey, Julia | | PUCT | |  |
| Helton, Bob | | Dynegy | |  |
| Hourihan, Michael | | CPower | |  |
| Johnson, David | | IVG | | Via Teleconference |
| Jones, Randy | | Calpine | |  |
| Juricek, Mike | | Oncor | | Via Teleconference |
| Kroskey, Tony | | Brazos Electric Cooperative | | Via Teleconference |
| Lange, Clif | | STEC | | Via Teleconference |
| McKeever, Debbie | | Oncor | |  |
| McMillin, Michael | | TIEC | |  |
| Moore, Sheri | | CenterPoint Energy | | Via Teleconference |
| Mueller, Paula | | Texas Reliability Entity | | Via Teleconference |
| Paff, Tom | | Duke-Energy | | Via Teleconference |
| Powell, Christian | | LCRA | |  |
| Rehfeldt, Diana | | Texas New Mexico Power | | Via Teleconference |
| Reed, Cyrus | | Sierra Club | |  |
| Reedy, Steve | | Potomac Economics | |  |
| Reid, Walter | | Pattern Energy | | Via Teleconference |
| Richard, Derek | | Calpine | | Via Teleconference |
| Robertson, Jennifer | | LCRA | |  |
| Ross, Richard | | AEPSC | |  |
| Sams, Bryan | | NRG | |  |
| Sandidge, Clint | | Calpine Solutions | |  |
| Schwarz, Brad | | Sharyland | | Via Teleconference |
| Scott, Kathy | | CenterPoint Energy | |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | | Crescent Power | |  |
| Sithuraj, Murali | | Austin Energy | |  |
| Stanfield, Leonard | | Invenergy | |  |
| Thomas, Wayne | | Bryan Texas Utilities | |  |
| Thomson, Thayil | | Power Costs | | Via Teleconference |
| Thompson, David | | Pedernales Electric Cooperative | |  |
| Totten, Jess | | Osprey Energy | |  |
| Tierney-Lloyd, Mona | | EnerNOC Inc | |  |
| Trenary, Michelle | | Tenaska Power Services | | Via Teleconference |
| True, Roy | | Brazos Electric Cooperative | |  |
| Turner, Lucas | | South Texas Electric Cooperative | |  |
| Walker, Mark | | NRG | | Via Teleconference |
| White, Lauri | | AEPSC | |  |
| Whittle, Brandon | | Megawatt Analytics | |  |
| Whitworth, Doug | | Texas Reliability Entity | | Via Teleconference |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | | DME | |  |
| Zake, Diana | | Lone Star Transmission | |  |
| Zerwas, Rebecca | | NRG | |  |
|  |  | |  | |
| *ERCOT Staff* |  | |  | |
| Albracht, Brittney |  | |  | |
| Anderson, Troy |  | |  | |
| Bivens, Carrie |  | |  | |
| Boren, Ann |  | |  | |
| Bracy, Phil | |  | |  | |
| Butterfield, Lindsay | |  | |  | |
| Castillo, Leo | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Change, Sean | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Clifton, Suzy | |  | |  | |
| Day, Betty | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Dovalina, Julio | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Hobbs, Kristi | |  | |  | |
| Jones, Dan | |  | |  | |
| Krein, Steve | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Landry, Kelly | |  | |  | |
| Morehead, Juliana | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Moreno, Alfredo | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Opheim, Calvin | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Phillips, Cory | |  | |  | |
| Rasberry, Justin | |  | |  | |
| Reed, Bobby | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Rickerson, Woody | |  | |  | |
| Roberts, Randy | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Ruane, Mark | |  | |  | |
| Searcy, Robbie | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Sharma, Sandip | |  | |  | |
| Shaw, Pam | |  | |  | |
| Stice, Clayton | |  | |  | |
| Teixeira, Jay | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Thomas, Shane | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Thompson, Chad | |  | |  | |
| Taurozzi, Tina | |  | |  | |
| Wattles, Paul | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Zeplin, Rachel | |  | |  | |

*Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments were present for a vote.*

Martha Henson called the September 14, 2017 PRS meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Antitrust Admonition

Ms. Henson directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Approval of Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*August 11, 2017*

**David Kee moved to approve the August 11, 2017 meeting minutes as submitted. Smith Day seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) and Board Report

Ms. Henson reported the disposition of Revision Requests considered at the August 23, 2017 TAC meeting and noted the remand of Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 821, Elimination of the CRR Deration Process, to be taken up under Agenda Item #5, Review PRS Reports, Impact Analyses, and Prioritization.

Project Update and Summary of Project Priority List (PPL) Activity to Date (see Key Documents)

Troy Anderson provided a project update and summary of PPL activity, and reviewed the 2017 and 2018 release target dates. Kathy Scott, Retail Market Subcommittee (RMS) Chair, stated that due to the impacts from Hurricane Harvey and possible impacts in transitioning Electric Service Identifiers (ESI IDs) from Sharyland to Oncor, Market Participants may not be prepared to implement system changes related to NPRR778, Modifications to Date Change and Cancellation Evaluation Window. Ms. Scott stated that RMS will be discussing NPRR778 implementation at their October meeting and making a recommendation to ERCOT. Mr. Anderson provided an update on the implementation approach for the Credit Monitoring and Management Application (CMM) project bundles. Mr. Anderson reviewed project spending and presented the priority and rank options for Revision Requests requiring projects.

Justin Rasberry provided an update on the Resource Asset Registration Form (RARF) Replacement project, stating that the project remains a high priority, however, the planning phase has been extended due to the complexity of the project. Mr. Rasberry stated the new web based application is being built with a focus on the user experience and that ERCOT is engaging Market Participants on the business solution requirements with the intent to develop a seamless workflow from registration through the life of the Resource. Mr. Rasberry stated that ERCOT would provide an update at the November 9, 2017 PRS meeting.

Review PRS Reports, Impact Analyses, and Prioritization (see Key Documents)

*NPRR815, Revise the Limitation of Load Resources Providing Responsive Reserve (RRS) Service*

Mr. Anderson reviewed the revised Impact Analysis for NPRR815. In response to Market Participant questions regarding the significant decrease in cost, Mr. Anderson stated the initial Impact Analysis was developed on a shortened timeline and that in further review, ERCOT identified an alternate approach that could be implemented, eliminating vendor efforts.

**Clayton Greer moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 8/11/17 PRS Report as amended by the 9/6/17 ERCOT comments and the revised Impact Analysis for NPRR815 with a recommended priority of 2018 and a rank of 2070. Tom Burke seconded the motion. The motion carried via roll call vote, with 8 objections from the Consumer (Occidental), Cooperative (3) (Pedernales, LCRA, STEC), Independent Generator (3) (Calpine, Dynegy, Luminant), and Investor Owned Utility (IOU) (Lone Star Transmission) Market Segments, and two abstentions from the Independent Generator (Exelon) and IOU (CenterPoint) Market Segments.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.[[2]](#footnote-2))*

ERCOT Staff and Market Participants acknowledged that associated changes would need to be made to the ERCOT Methodologies for Determining Minimum Ancillary Service Requirements.

*NPRR817, Create a Panhandle Hub*

Mr. Anderson presented the revised Impact Analysis for NPRR817 and explained that while reviewing the PRS request to consider costs related to adding future trading Hubs, ERCOT identified additional vendor impacts related to NPRR817 resulting in additional costs. In response to the PRS request, Mr. Anderson stated that adding future Hubs would not have a vendor impact resulting in a 30-40% decrease in cost. Some Market Participants expressed a desire to formalize this discussion and offered revisions to the business case for NPRR817.

**Mr. Greer moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 8/11/17 PRS Report as revised by PRS and the revised Impact Analysis for NPRR817 with a recommended priority of 2018 and rank of 2080. Eric Goff seconded the motion. The motion carried with one objection from the Independent Generator (Luminant) Market Segment and two abstentions from the Independent Generator (Dynegy) and Consumer (Occidental Chemical) Market Segments.**

*NPRR821, Elimination of the CRR Deration Process*

Carrie Bivens reviewed the Congestion Revenue Right (CRR) Settlement process, including the history and development of the CRR deration and related aspects of the Day-Ahead Market (DAM) congestion rent and the CRR Balancing Account. Ms. Bivens then reviewed the proposed stakeholder solutions and the potential impacts of each. Some Market Participants supported the 9/12/17 Joint comments stating it was a compromise solution, taking the original concepts in NPRR821 and applying it to a subset of CRRs.

**Bill Barnes moved to recommend approval of NPRR821 as amended by the 9/12/17 Joint comments and to forward NPRR821 to TAC. David Ricketts seconded the motion.** Seth Cochran stated DC Energy did not support the 9/12/17 Joint comments as it did not address the issues; and stated that NPRR821 as written or with the 8/22/17 DC Energy comments solves the equitability issues, moves towards a more fully funded CRR product, provides protection against CRR shortfall, and is an effective risk management tool. Steve Reedy stated the Independent Market Monitor (IMM) has the ability to identify market manipulation and that it supports removal of the deration process. Some Market Participants requested additional time to review the 9/12/17 Joint comments and consider the impacts.

**Mr. Greer moved to table NPRR821 and refer the issue to the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS). John Varnell seconded the motion.** Some Market Participants expressed opposition to tabling NPRR821 stating that NPRR821 had been fully vetted. **The motion failed via roll call vote, with 14 objections from the Consumer (Occidental), Cooperative (5) (Brazos, Pedernales, LCRA, STEC, GSEC), Independent Generator (3) (Calpine, Dynegy, Luminant), Independent Retail Electric Provider (IREP) (3) (Discount Power, Viridity, Reliant), IOU (CenterPoint), and Municipal (CPS) Market Segments, and one abstention from the Consumer (Sierra Club) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

**The motion to recommend approval of NPRR821 as amended by the 9/12/17 Joint comments and to forward NPRR821 to TAC carried via roll call vote with three objections from the Independent Generator (Exelon), Independent Power Marketer (IPM) (Tenaska) and Municipal (Denton) Market Segments, and three abstentions from the IPM (Morgan Stanley, Citigroup, EDF Energy) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.[[3]](#footnote-3))*

*NPRR825, Require ERCOT to Issue a DC Tie Curtailment Notice Prior to Curtailing any DC Tie Load*

Market Participants discussed the 8/18/17 REMC comments to expand on the Business Case for NPRR825. Concerns were expressed regarding the budgetary impact associated with NPRR825. Chad Thompson stated that the cost included significant impacts to Market Management Systems (MMS), internal labor costs due to development of the tool and testing across systems, and new Market Information System (MIS) postings. Market Participants discussed the implementation timeline and requested ERCOT keep the Reliability and Operations Subcommittee (ROS) and WMS apprised as the tool is being developed. Mr. C. Thompson acknowledged that procedural changes for NPRR825 could likely be implemented ahead of the system changes.

**Mr. Goff moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 8/11/17 PRS Report as amended by the 8/18/17 REMC comments and the Impact Analysis for NPRR825 with a recommended priority of 2018 and rank of 2090. Mr. Greer seconded the motion. The motion carried with one abstention from the Independent Generator (Luminant) Market Segment.**

*NPRR840, Implementation of Infeasible Ancillary Service Protocol Revisions*

In response to Market Participant questions, Dave Maggio stated that the system impacts associated with NPRR840 are included in the Impact Analysis for NPRR782, Settlement of Infeasible Ancillary Services Due to Transmission Constraints, and that NPRR840 was submitted to ensure the intent of NPRR782.

**Mr. Greer moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 8/11/17 PRS Report and the Impact Analysis for NPRR840. Mr. Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

*System Change Request (SCR) 791, Correction of 60-day SCED GRD Disclosure Report*

**Mr. Greer moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 8/11/17 PRS Report and Impact Analysis for SCR791 with a recommended priority of 2018 and rank of 2100. Mr. Ricketts seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Review of Pending Project Priorities (see Key Documents)

Mr. Anderson reviewed the list of projects planned for initiation in September 2017 and February 2018.

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR807, Day-Ahead Market Price Correction*

*NPRR814, Modify Black Start Procurement Cycle*

*NPRR819, Resettlement Clean-Ups*

*NPRR826, Mitigated Offer Caps for RMR Resources*

*NPRR828, Include Fast Frequency Response as a Subset of Responsive Reserve*

*NPRR832, Disallow PTP Obligation Bids and DAM Energy Bids that Sink at Private Use Network Settlement Points Without a Load Distribution Factor – URGENT*

*NPRR834, Clarifications for Repossessions of CRRs by ERCOT*

*NPRR835, Removing the Capacity Limits from Resources Providing Fast Responding Regulation Service (FRRS)*

*NPRR837, Regional Planning Group (RPG) Process Reform*

*NPRR838, Updated O&M Cost for RMR Resources*

*NPRR839, Clarification of ERCOT Forwarding of Consumption and Other Data*

*NPRR841, Real-Time Adjustments to Day-Ahead Make Whole Payments due to Ancillary Services Infeasibility Charges*

*NPRR842, Study Area Load Information*

*NPRR843, Short-Term System Adequacy and AS Offer Disclosure Reports Additions*

*NPRR844, Clarification to Outage Report*

*NPRR845, RMR Process and Agreement Revisions*

PRS took no action on these items.

*NPRR823, Amend the Definition of an Affiliate*

Bob Helton provided an update stating that ERCOT Staff has offered to provide additional clarifications, and requested additional time for continued discussion with Market Participants, ERCOT Staff and the Public Utility Commission of Texas (PUCT) Staff of the correlation between the ERCOT Protocols and ERCOT Bylaws regarding the definition of Affiliate. PRS took no action on this item.

Review of Revision Request Language (see Key Documents)

*NPRR846, Allow Previously Committed ERS Resources to Participate in MRA Agreements and Other ERS Items*

**Mr. Goff moved to table NPRR846 and refer the issue to the WMS. Mr. Ricketts seconded the motion. The motion carried with one abstention from the IPM (Morgan Stanley) Market Segment.**

*NPRR847, Exceptional Fuel Cost Included in the Mitigated Offer Cap*

**Mr. Helton moved to table NPRR847 and refer the issue to WMS. Melissa Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Notice of Withdrawal

*NPRR697, Disclosure of Protected Information for Research and Coordination Purposes*

Ms. Henson noted the withdrawal of NPRR697.

Resource Definition Task Force (RTF)

Mr. Ricketts reviewed recent RTF activities and presented the draft RTF scope to be considered at the October 12, 2017 PRS meeting. Mr. Rickets stated the September 14, 2017 RTF meeting is cancelled.

Other Business

*2018 Meeting Schedule*

Market Participants reviewed the proposed 2018 Meeting Schedule.

*Impact Analysis Process*

Market Participants expressed a concern for the increased number of recent revised Impact Analyses on Revision Requests, and requested a review of the ERCOT process. Ms. Hobbs briefly explained the Impact Analysis process and reminded Market Participants of the annual review of Impact Analysis results that Mr. Anderson provides to PRS, which includes statistics reflecting how the Impact Analysis track to ultimate project costs with explanations where deviations occurred.

Adjournment

Ms. Henson adjourned the September 14, 2017 PRS meeting at 11:34 a.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at <http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2017/9/14/108244-PRS> unless otherwise noted [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. <http://www.ercot.com/mktrules/issues/NPRR815#keydocs>

   [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. <http://www.ercot.com/mktrules/issues/NPRR821#keydocs> [↑](#footnote-ref-3)