**APPROVED Minutes**

**Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Meeting**

**ERCOT Austin – 7620 Metro Center Drive – Austin, Texas 78744**

**Thursday, June 15, 2017 – 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Burke, Tom | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative | Via Teleconference |
| Coleman, Diana | OPUC |  |
| Day, Smith | Denton Municipal Electric |  |
| Gibson, C. | Discount Power |  |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor |  |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Peters, Patrick | CenterPoint Energy |  |
| Ricketts, David | Luminant |  |
| Shaw, Marka | Exelon |  |
| Trevino, Melissa | Occidental Chemical |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services |  |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| *Guests:* | |  | |  |
| Abbott, Kristin | | PUCT | | Via Teleconference |
| Ashley, Kristy | | CES | |  |
| Blakey, Eric | | Just Energy | |  |
| Bombick, Sarah | | LCRA | |  |
| Bryant, Mark | | PUCT | | Via Teleconference |
| Carter, Tim | | MP2Energy | | Via Teleconference |
| Checkley, Jim | | CTT | |  |
| Coleman, Katie | | TIEC | |  |
| Courtney, Kenneth | | City of Burnet | |  |
| Dotson-Westphalen, Peter | | CPower | | Via Teleconference |
| Downey, Marty | | Viridity | |  |
| English, Barksdale | | Austin Energy | | Via Teleconference |
| Firestone, Joel | | LCRA | |  |
| Garza, Beth | | Potomac Economics | |  |
| Goff, Eric | | Citigroup Energy | |  |
| Gross, Blake | | AEPSC | |  |
| Haley, Ian | | Vistra | | Via Teleconference |
| Helton, Bob | | Dynegy | |  |
| Jones, Randy | | Calpine | |  |
| Juricek, Mike | | Oncor | | Via Teleconference |
| King, Scott | | San Marcos Electric Utility | |  |
| Lee, Jim | | AEPSC | |  |
| McKeever, Debbie | | Oncor | |  |
| Moss, Steven | | EON | |  |
| Ongudu, Luke | | City of Brenham | |  |
| Paffe, Heather | | Tesla | |  |
| Phillips, Kaylynne | | Oncor | |  |
| Powell, Christian | | LCRA | | Via Teleconference |
| Reed, Cyrus | | Sierra Club | |  |
| Reedy, Steve | | Potomac Economics | |  |
| Rehfeldt, Diana | | Texas New Mexico Power | | Via Teleconference |
| Robertson, Jennifer | | LCRA | |  |
| Rochelle, Jenni | | CES | | Via Teleconference |
| Rodgers, Vance | | City of Lockhart | |  |
| Sams, Bryan | | NRG | |  |
| Scott, Kathy | | CenterPoint Energy | |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | | Crescent Power | | Via Teleconference |
| Sithuraj, Murali | | Austin Energy | |  |
| Slagel, Ron | | MICS | |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | | Jewell and Associates | |  |
| Smith, Mark | | Nucor | |  |
| Smith, Tom | | Public Citizen | |  |
| Thompson, David | | Pedernales Electric Cooperative | |  |
| Treibs, Kyle | | City of Fredericksburg | |  |
| Trenary, Michelle | | Tenaska Power Services | | Via Teleconference |
| True, Roy | | Rayburn | |  |
| Thurnher, Greg | | Shell Energy | |  |
| Turner, Lucas | | South Texas Electric Cooperative | |  |
| White, Lauri | | AEPSC | |  |
| Whittle, Brandon | | Megawatt Analytics | |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | | Denton Municipal Electric | |  |
| Zake, Diana | | Lone Star Transmission | |  |
| Zella, Raymond | | City of Cuero | |  |
| Zerwas, Rebecca | | NRG | | Via Teleconference |
|  |  | |  | |
| *ERCOT Staff* |  | |  | |
| Albracht, Brittney |  | |  | |
| Anderson, Connor |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Anderson, Troy |  | |  | |
| Billo, Jeff |  | |  | |
| Bivens, Carrie |  | |  | |
| Boren, Ann |  | |  | |
| Bracy, Phil | |  | |  | |
| Butterfield, Lindsay | |  | |  | |
| Clifton, Suzy | |  | |  | |
| Giarratano, Alex | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Gonzalez, Ino | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Hanson, Kevin | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Hartmann, Jimmy | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Hobbs, Kristi | |  | |  | |
| Landry, Kelly | |  | |  | |
| Maggio, Dave | |  | |  | |
| Mago, Nitika | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Morehead, Juliana | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Ögelman. Kenan | |  | |  | |
| Phillips, Cory | |  | |  | |
| Rios, Diana | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Roberts, Randy | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Ruane, Mark | |  | |  | |
| Sham, Pam | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Simons, Diane | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Solis, Stephen | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Surendran, Resmi | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Weaver, Eileen | |  | |  | |
| Xiao, Hong | |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Zeplin, Rachel | |  | |  | |

*Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments were present for a vote.*

Martha Henson called the June 15, 2017 PRS meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Antitrust Admonition

Ms. Henson directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Approval of Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*May 11, 2017*

**Bill Barnes moved to approve the May 11, 2017 meeting minutes as submitted. Bob Helton seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) and Board Report

Ms. Henson noted the disposition of Revision Requests considered at the May 25, 2017 TAC and June 13, 2017 ERCOT Board meetings. Ms. Henson stated that the TAC request to take up Resource definitions will be discussed under Other Business.

Project Update and Summary of Project Priority List (PPL) Activity to Date (see Key Documents)

Troy Anderson provided a project update and summary of PPL activity, and reviewed the 2017/2018 release target dates and 2017 project spending. Mr. Anderson stated that the May 2018 release target date for the Credit Monitoring and Management (CMM) application projects may be at risk due ERCOT resource constraints, however ERCOT was committed to delivering key functionality by the summer of 2018.

Review PRS Reports, Impact Analyses, and Prioritization (see Key Documents)

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 822, Designate Resource Node Procedure an Other Binding Document and Adjust the Process for Retiring Resource Nodes*

*Associated Revisions to the Procedure for Identifying Resource*

*Updated Other Binding Document List*

Clarifications were made so that the associated document “Procedure for Identifying Resource Nodes” would be added to the Other Binding Documents List upon ERCOT Board approval of NPRR822.

**Patrick Peters moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 5/11/17 PRS Report as revised by PRS and the Impact Analysis for NPRR822. Mr. Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Review of Pending Project Priorities (see Key Documents)

Mr. Anderson reviewed the list of projects planned for initiation in June 2017, September 2017, and February 2018.

Urgency Vote

*NPRR832, Disallow PTP Obligation Bids and DAM Energy Bids that Sink at Private Use Network Settlement Points Without a Load Distribution Factor*

David Ricketts stated that NPRR832 is an interim solution and requested it be granted Urgent status due to the risk to Loads from Real-Time revenue neutrality charges. Other Market Participants disagreed, stating Urgent status was not necessary and that NPRR832 would not provide any benefit given the implementation timeline for the associated long term solution, NPRR831, Inclusion of Private Use Networks in Load Zone Price Calculations.

**Mr. Ricketts moved to grant NPRR832 Urgent status. Mr. Helton seconded the motion.**

**The motion to grant NPRR832 Urgent status carried via roll call vote with 9 objections from the Consumer (OPUC), Independent Power Marketer (IPM) (4) (Citigroup, Morgan Stanley, Shell Energy, Tenaska), Investor Owned Utility (IOU) (2) (AEPSC, CenterPoint) and Municipal (2) (CPS Energy, DME) Market Segments and one abstention from the IOU (Oncor) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.[[2]](#footnote-2))*

Market Participants discussed the merits of NPRR832. ERCOT Staff stated that due to resource constraints implementing NPRR832 would impact the timeline for NPRR831 and that a manual work around option was not available. Some Market Participants opined that if NPRR832 proceeded through the stakeholder process, consideration should be given to prohibiting sourcing at Private Use Network Settlement Points. Market Participants requested additional review by the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS).

**Mr. Ricketts moved to table NPRR832 for one month and refer the issue to WMS. Mr. Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR697, Disclosure of Protected Information for Research and Coordination Purposes*

*NPRR807, Day-Ahead Market Price Correction*

*NPRR814, Modify Black Start Procurement Cycle*

*NPRR817, Create a Panhandle Hub*

*NPRR819, Resettlement Clean-Ups*

*NPRR823, Amend the Definition of an Affiliate*

*NPRR825, Require ERCOT to Declare an Emergency Condition Prior to Curtailing any DC Tie Load*

*NPRR826, Mitigated Offer Caps for RMR Resources*

*NPRR828, Include Fast Frequency Response as a Subset of Responsive Reserve*

PRS took no action on these items.

*NPRR768, Revisions to Real-Time On-Line Reliability Deployment Price Adder Categories*

Market Participants discussed the merits of NPRR768 and the 6/1/17 TIEC comments, and offered clarifications to include registered Block Load Transfers (BLTs). Some Market Participants objected to the preamble of the TIEC comments, but did not oppose the suggested Protocol language changes.

**Eric Goff moved to recommend approval of NPRR768 as amended by the 6/1/17 TIEC comments and as revised by PRS. Greg Thurnher seconded the motion. The motion carried with one objection from the Consumer (Occidental) Market Segment and one abstention from the IPM (Morgan Stanley) Market Segment.**

*NPRR815, Revise the Limitation of Load Resources Providing Responsive Reserve (RRS) Service*

Market Participants discussed the merits of NPRR815. Some Market Participants expressed support for NPRR815 as a market efficiency and noted the WMS and ROS endorsements in the 3/1/17 WMS comments and 6/9/17 ROS comments. Other Market Participants expressed concerns that recommending approval of NPRR815 could lead to inclusion of other controversial Ancillary Service related topics such as the splitting of bid stacks and that NPRR815 should therefore be rejected. Beth Garza opined that NPRR815, if implemented, would allow for a more efficient Ancillary Services market without affecting reliability.

**Melissa Trevino moved to rejected NPRR815. Jennifer Robertson seconded the motion.** Some Market Participants expressed support for the 6/14/17 Sierra Club comments as a compromise solution and requested additional time to review.

**Mr. Thurher moved to table NPRR815 for one month. Mr. Barnes seconded the motion. The motion carried via roll call vote with eleven objections from the Cooperative (3) (Brazos, LCRA, STEC), Independent Generator (Luminant), IPM (Morgan Stanley), and Municipal (6) (City of Burnet, City of Cuero, San Marcos Utility, City of Fredericksburg, City of Brenham, City of Lockhart) Market Segments.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.[[3]](#footnote-3))*

*NPRR821, Elimination of the CRR Deration Process*

Market Participants discussed the merits of NPRR821 and debated the risks to Load. Market Participants opposing NPRR821 opined that it unfairly changes allocation such that Loads will bear 100 percent of the risk associated with deration. Other Market Participants countered that shortfall is borne by Congestion Revenue Right (CRR) Account Holders when the CRR Balancing Account is exhausted, and that the risk of shortfall is not exclusive to Load. Market Participants reviewed the 6/8/17 WMS comments which recommend an implementation date of no earlier than July 1, 2019, and requested to review the Impact Analysis before proposing an effective date for NPRR821.

**Clayton Greer moved to recommend approval of NPRR821 as amended by the 5/31/17 ERCOT comments. Ms. Robertson seconded the motion. The motion carried with five objections from the Consumer (Occidental), Independent Generator (Luminant), Independent Retail Provider (IREP) (2) (Reliant, Discount) and Municipal (Austin Energy) Market Segments, and two abstentions from the IPM (Citigroup) and IOU (CenterPoint) Market Segments.**

*NPRR829, Incorporate Real-Time Non-Modeled Telemetered Net Generation by Load Zone into the Estimate of RTL*

**Mr. Ricketts moved to table NPRR829 for one month. Patrick Peters seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Review of Revision Request Language (see Key Documents)

*NPRR833, Modify PTP Obligation Bid Clearing Change*

Carrie Bivens reviewed NPRR833. Market Participants expressed concern for the high cost of implementing NPRR833. In response to Market Participant questions, Ms. Bivens stated the manual solution in NPRR827, Disallow PTP Obligation Bid Award where Clearing Price exceeds Bid Price by $0.25/MW per hour, was not sustainable and that the costs of NPRR833 reflect a relatively high volume of vendor hours. Ms. Bivens further stated a workshop will be held to continue addressing the differences of opinions on this issue and its solution. Market Participants requested additional review by WMS.

**Mr. Greer moved to table NPRR833 for one month and refer the issue to WMS. Mr. Goff seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

*SCR791, Correction of 60-day SCED GRD Disclosure Report*

Market Participants requested additional review of System Change Request (SCR) 791 by the Commercial Operations Subcommittee (COPS).

**Blake Gross moved to table SCR791 and refer the issue to COPS. Mr. Peters seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

*SCR792, Enhance Communications of BAAL Exceedances*

ERCOT Staff reviewed the proposed changes in SCR792, including the Inter-Control Center Communications Protocol (ICCP) communication of clock-minute average exceedances of the Balancing Authority ACE Limit (BAAL).

**Mr. Greer moved to approve SCR792 as submitted. Mr. Goff seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Other Business

*Resource Definition Task Force*

Ms. Henson conveyed the TAC request that PRS create a task force to review Resource definitions for accuracy and consistency in the Protocols, Guides and Other Binding Documents. Ms. Henson encouraged Market Participants to consider leadership opportunities and proposed scope for the first Resource Definition Task Force meeting on July 20, 2017, following conclusion of the PRS meeting.

Adjournment

Ms. Henson adjourned the June 15, 2017 PRS meeting at 11:24 a.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at <http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2017/6/15/108264-PRS> unless otherwise noted [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. <http://www.ercot.com/mktrules/issues/NPRR832#keydocs> [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. <http://www.ercot.com/mktrules/issues/NPRR815#keydocs> [↑](#footnote-ref-3)